

The background of the entire page is a light blue-grey color, densely populated with a pattern of colorful handprints and spirals. The handprints are in various colors including orange, yellow, green, blue, purple, red, and brown. Some handprints have a spiral pattern on the palm. The spirals are also in various colors and sizes, scattered throughout the background.

Warwick | Law School

THE UNIVERSITY OF
WARWICK

Building Blocks for Improving Human Rights Education within Initial Teacher Education in Scotland

A Report by the Centre for Human Rights in Practice, University of Warwick

January 2015

written by Alison Struthers

Acknowledgements

The author would like to thank Dr James Harrison, Associate Professor, School of Law and Co-Director of the Centre for Human Rights in Practice for his assistance with carrying out this project and for his helpful comments and feedback on earlier drafts of this report.

Thanks also to Shivaun Chandiramani and Natalie Threlfall for their dedicated research assistance during the early stages of the project.

Advisory Committee

The author wishes to thank the members of the project's Advisory Committee for their feedback and recommendations on earlier drafts of this report:

Cathy Begley (Participation and Education Officer, Scotland's Commissioner for Children and Young People);

Alan Britton (Senior University Teacher, University of Glasgow);

Claire Cassidy (Senior Lecturer & Deputy Head of School, University of Strathclyde);

Linsey Crooks (independent rights consultant);

Elizabeth Curtis (Lecturer & College Co-ordinator, University of Aberdeen);

Charlotte Dwyer (Global Education Advisor, Scotdec);

Rami Ousta (Chief Executive Officer, Black and Ethnic Minority Infrastructure in Scotland);

Tanveer Parnez (Director of National Development, Black and Ethnic Minority Infrastructure in Scotland); and

Elaine Watts (Teaching Fellow, University of Strathclyde)

Interviewees

The author additionally wishes to extend further thanks to those members of the Advisory Committee who were interviewed as part of the research process (Alan Britton, Claire Cassidy and Elizabeth Curtis), together with additional thanks to John I'Anson (Director of ITE, University of Stirling), Henry Maitles (Assistant Dean (Education), University of the West of Scotland), Teresa Moran (Senior Lecturer & Depute Dean, University of Dundee) and Hamish Ross (Senior Lecturer, University of Edinburgh) for their helpful comments and suggestions during the interviews. Thanks also to Morag Redford (ITE Programme Leader, University of the Highlands and Islands) for providing information on the new ITE programme at the University.

Table of Contents

Executive Summary	4
Chapter 1:	
Introduction.....	6
Chapter 2:	
Human Rights Education in Initial Teacher Education in Scotland.....	9
Chapter 3:	
Current HRE Practice in Scottish Higher Education Institutions.....	14
Chapter 4:	
What is Needed to Improve HRE in ITE in Scotland?.....	19
Chapter 5:	
Recommendations for Reform.....	22
Appendix I:	
HRE in ITE as Required by International Human Rights Law.....	24
Appendix II:	
HRE within ITE in Other Countries.....	27

List of Abbreviations

BEd – Bachelor of Education
BEMIS – Black and Ethnic Minority Infrastructure in Scotland
CfE – Curriculum for Excellence
CPD – Continuing Professional Development
DECs – Development Education Centres
EAL – English as an Additional Language
E&Os – Experiences and Outcomes
GTCS – General Teaching Council for Scotland
GTCS Standards – GTCS Standards for Provisional Registration
HRE – Human Rights Education
HEI – Higher Education Institution
ICESCR – International Covenant for Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
IDEAS – International Development Education Association of Scotland
ITE – Initial Teacher Education
PGDE – Professional Graduate Diploma in Education
RME – Religious and Moral Education
RRSA – Rights Respecting Schools Award
SCCYP – Scotland’s Commissioner for Children and Young People
UDHR – Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UNCRC – United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child
UNDHRET – United Nations Declaration on Human Rights Education and Training
UNWPHRE – United Nations World Programme for Human Rights Education

Executive Summary

Introduction

The provision of Human Rights Education (HRE) within formal schooling is considered to be necessary not only for enabling children to recognise human rights issues in their own lives, but also for empowering them to stand up for their rights and for the rights of others, and to feel that it is within their power to take action to promote and defend human rights. The provision of HRE within formal education is therefore an important obligation upon states under the international legal framework.

For teachers to be able to provide effective HRE in their classrooms, they must themselves receive adequate instruction in HRE within their own teacher education or training programmes. In accordance with the provisions of various international instruments and initiatives, therefore, states are additionally required to promote adequate training in human rights for teachers, trainers and other educators. HRE must constitute a compulsory element of domestic Initial Teacher Education (ITE) programmes in order to meet international obligations in this area.

It is the case, however, that education or training in HRE is sparse or inconsistent within current programmes of ITE in Scotland,¹ which in turn translates into fragmented HRE provision in classroom teaching. This project addressed this issue by engaging with those universities in Scotland that currently offer programmes of ITE to determine the most effective means of improving HRE training within their courses, and by providing recommendations for reform based upon these findings.

Methodology

Following an initial desk-based scoping exercise establishing the extent of HRE within programmes of ITE in Scotland, semi-structured interviews were carried out with a relevant staff member from each of the Scottish Higher Education Institutions currently offering ITE: the Universities of Aberdeen, Dundee, Edinburgh, Glasgow, Highlands and Islands, Stirling, Strathclyde and the West of Scotland. These members of staff offered suggestions on the most effective means for increasing HRE provision and identified some of the potential problems to be avoided.

An Advisory Committee with a wealth of expertise in the field then provided feedback and input on the report and its recommendations. The Committee consisted of representatives from the following organisations: Black and Ethnic Minority Infrastructure in Scotland (BEMIS); Scotdec; Scotland's Commissioner for Children and Young People (SCCYP); the University of Aberdeen; the University of Glasgow; and the University of Strathclyde. It also included an independent rights consultant employed by Local Authorities and schools to embed the UNCRC within schools in Scotland (see page 14 for full details of the Advisory Committee).

Report Overview

Chapter 1 of this report provides information on why the provision of HRE is important within formal schooling and why in turn it should be considered an essential component of pre-service teacher education. It also highlights why the current project is necessary by identifying the absence of existing research into the full extent and sufficiency of HRE within programmes of ITE in Scottish universities.

Chapter 2 provides an overview of ITE in Scotland and explores the scope for HRE provision within the Scottish Curriculum for Excellence. It identifies shortcomings in the current extent and sufficiency of HRE both within the curriculum itself and within education policy governing ITE, and draws upon valuable existing research to demonstrate the paucity of HRE within current teaching practice.

Chapter 3 begins by providing an overview of the research methods used in carrying out this project. It then explores in detail the extent of HRE training within current programmes of ITE offered by each of the relevant Scottish universities. The findings show that each Scottish ITE provider is delivering elements of HRE within its syllabus, but the extent to which it features within ITE programmes varies considerably between institutions. This results in fragmented HRE provision across the relevant Scottish universities.

Chapter 4 summarises the key suggestions made, and potential problems identified, by the representatives from each of the Scottish universities currently offering ITE programmes. In particular, most of the representatives expressed a preference for a web-based resource, and many advised that such a resource should link expressly to the teaching requirements under Curriculum for Excellence.

Chapter 5 sets out recommendations for reform based upon the findings from this report. The recommendations reflect the suggestions made by the representatives from each of the relevant Scottish universities and would therefore be likely to be agreed to by the majority of ITE providers. Whilst there is potential scope for more comprehensive reform in this area in the future, the recommendations seek to reflect what is achievable and most likely to work in the current educational landscape. They should therefore be considered as building blocks for improving HRE provision within ITE.

Implementation of the recommendations in this report would result in a core of required components for HRE that ITE providers could then build upon to suit the needs of their particular programmes. This core would provide a foundation of HRE within ITE that would not only increase the current scope and extent of HRE in ITE and classroom practice, but would also be likely to stimulate progression and future development in this field.

The recommendations are as follows:

Recommendation 1

- The inclusion of HRE within ITE should be made compulsory and this change should be reflected by amendment to the GTCS Standards. Competence in HRE should be included as an express requirement of provisional registration with the GTCS and would fit naturally within the social justice element of Learning for Sustainability.

Recommendation 2

- Given the current structure of ITE programmes within Scottish universities, the inclusion of HRE should be facilitated through the development of a flexible and non-prescriptive web-based resource that is made available to Scottish ITE providers.
- The resource should:
 - encourage teachers to engage in critical thinking rather than seek to provide them with one-size-fits-all teaching materials;
 - provide general information on human rights and HRE and why they are important;
 - focus on practical training methodologies and advise on how human rights information can be translated into age-appropriate classroom activities;
 - assist teachers in recognising human rights elements within topics and provide guidance on how to embed HRE within their existing teaching practices;
 - help teachers to signpost their teaching practice relating to HRE;
 - highlight where relevant links can be made to Curriculum for Excellence;
 - direct teachers towards useful existing resources on human rights and HRE;
 - include relevant video clips;
 - suggest issues and questions for classroom discussion;
 - make recommendations for cross-disciplinary and interdisciplinary teaching to assist in the mainstreaming of HRE; and
 - target human rights issues that teachers are particularly likely to face in practice.

Recommendation 3

- The resource should be developed collaboratively with input from NGOs, policymakers, academics, teaching practitioners and children.

Recommendation 4

- Training on the use of the web-based resource should be offered to ITE providers to ensure that its contents are utilised to their fullest potential.
- This training should involve on-going engagement – through the provision of support and monitoring – between ITE providers and the trainers.

Recommendation 5

- ITE providers should continue to build upon their relationships with relevant existing networks, such as IDEAS and the Development Education Centres, in order to further expand and embed HRE and global citizenship within their programmes.

Footnotes

1. See e.g. BEMIS, 'A Review of Human Rights Education in Schools in Scotland (March 2013) at 47.

Chapter 1: Introduction

Key Findings:

- HRE has a central role to play in building a universal culture of human rights and in empowering learners to stand up for their own rights and the rights of others.
- The provision of HRE within Initial Teacher Education is a key requirement of the international HRE framework.
- This project fills a gap in the existing literature as the full extent and sufficiency of HRE within ITE in Scotland has not been the subject of comprehensive study.

1.1 Project Overview

The aim of this project is to identify and make recommendations for addressing the deficiencies in the scope and content of Human Rights Education (HRE) within programmes of Initial Teacher Education (ITE) at Scottish Higher Education Institutions (HEI). Current practice will be assessed and examples of good practice at the institutions will also be identified where relevant.

Since the mid-1990s, there has been a marked increase in the number of international instruments and initiatives addressing HRE. Many of the most prominent and significant examples of these documents make specific reference to the importance of the inclusion of HRE within teacher education or training programmes. In particular, both the current phase of the UN World Programme for Human Rights Education (2005-ongoing) (UNWPHRE) and the recently adopted UN Declaration on Human Rights Education and Training (2011) (UNDHRET) contain express reference to the need for teachers to receive adequate training in HRE.

Building upon research data that BEMIS collected during their extensive mapping exercise conducted to ascertain the level of engagement with HRE in the formal education sector in Scotland², this research focuses specifically on HRE within ITE in Scotland. The objectives of this report are to:

- Evaluate and assess the extent and scope of HRE within current programmes of ITE at Scottish HEIs, including both (i) highlighting examples of current good practice; and (ii) identifying current deficiencies that often result in teachers not incorporating HRE into their classroom teaching;
- Gauge interest in the development of a HRE module or resource for ITE and ascertain ITE provider preferences for the scope and content of such a module or resource; and
- Make recommendations for policy change in this area directed towards both ITE providers and policy makers in the field more widely.

1.2 Why is Human Rights Education Necessary in Initial Teacher Education?

If we are to have real peace in this world, we shall have to begin with the children – Gandhi

From such ideas about children having a central role to play in the creation of a just and peaceful world has come the development of HRE in schools as the means of inculcating in learners the necessary knowledge and values to allow this to happen. With roots in the 1945 Charter of the United Nations, the concept of HRE has grown steadily in prominence and significance on the international stage, and has witnessed in the past two decades a proliferation of instruments and initiatives aiming to further its cause.

HRE refers broadly to education and training that aims to contribute to the building of a universal culture of human rights through teaching about human rights and fundamental freedoms. It has historically been viewed largely as an enabling right, for logically one can only recognise and act upon a violation of their rights if one has sufficient pre-existing knowledge and understanding of those rights, though in 1948 the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR) established HRE as a distinct and freestanding right. It contains a dedicated provision on HRE asserting that:

Education shall be directed to the full development of the human personality and to the strengthening of respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms. It shall promote understanding, tolerance and friendship among all nations, racial or religious groups, and shall further the activities of the United Nations for the maintenance of peace.³

In the intervening years, the right to HRE has been further refined and developed. Though having been described by an expert in the field as something of ‘a slogan in search of a definition’,⁴ the most recent United Nations initiative to exclusively address HRE defines the concept as involving education:

- (a) **About** human rights, which includes providing knowledge and understanding of human rights norms and principles, the values that underpin them and the mechanisms for their protection;
- (b) **Through** human rights, which includes learning and teaching in a way that respects the rights of both educators and learners;
- (c) **For** human rights, which includes empowering persons to enjoy and exercise their rights and to respect and uphold the rights of others.⁵

The UN thus requires education *about*, *through* and *for* human right or, as paraphrased by a leading HRE NGO, education concerning respectively what one should learn about human rights, how one should learn it, and why it is important.⁶

Despite the aspirational words of the UDHR, human rights abuses are still prevalent today. News reports abound with accounts of serious human rights violations connected with war, gender-based violence, authoritarian political regimes, racism, and so on. Similarly, notwithstanding the more focused instructions for HRE within more recent UN instruments, it is likely that in our schools many of our children remain unfamiliar with the concept of human rights, and have little or no understanding of the human rights protections to which they are entitled. Some would argue that learners of school age do

not need to have an awareness of these concepts, but many others are resolute that the only way for a child to recognise abuses of human rights in their own lives is to be taught that they are entitled to these rights by virtue of being human, irrespective of age.

HRE is arguably important on a broader scale too, for it aims to empower learners to stand up for their own rights and for the rights of others, and to feel that it is within their power to take action to promote and defend human rights. By experiencing full and active participation in an educational setting, and by learning explicitly about the significance of human rights, learners should feel that they are able to contribute to the creation of a just and peaceful world in which the rights of all human beings are respected. In this regard, it has been suggested that when instilled in learners from an early age, the values emphasised through HRE:

Can contribute to both the reduction of human rights violations and the building of free, just and peaceful societies. Human rights education is also increasingly recognised as an effective strategy to prevent human rights abuses.⁷

A HRE framework in schools thus enables learners to not only recognise and act upon human rights violations in their own lives, but on a broader scale also empowers them to contribute towards the building of a universal culture of human rights that upholds the ideals of peace, dignity, non-discrimination and respect. The importance of its inclusion within formal education therefore seems beyond doubt, yet it can reasonably be suggested that it is notable by its absence in many classrooms across Scotland.

At a 2011 conference on HRE organised by BEMIS,⁸ for example, teachers who attended 'showed a lack of awareness of HRE as a distinct concept and also highlighted a lack of knowledge and confidence with regards to the teaching of HRE'.⁹ The subsequent mapping exercise conducted by BEMIS substantiated this finding by demonstrating through survey data that a significant majority of teachers identified lack of training in this area as by far the most significant barrier to their provision of HRE, with most never having received any training in HRE within their ITE.¹⁰

ITE is the term commonly used to refer to the programmes of education and training that teachers must complete before they are qualified to enter the teaching profession.¹¹ In most countries, there are only a certain number of recognised entry points into professional teaching practice and thus the way such programmes are organised 'plays a key role in determining both the quality and the quantity of teachers'.¹² Programmes of ITE typically cover three principal areas: core subject knowledge, pedagogical knowledge and practical experience in a school setting. Many, including Scotland, also include the study of education as a discipline in its own right. In accordance with the provisions of various international instruments and initiatives, however, states are additionally required to promote 'adequate training in human rights for teachers, trainers and other educators'.¹³ HRE must therefore constitute a compulsory element of state programmes of ITE in order to meet international obligations in this area.

It is the case, however, that HRE is sparse or quite simply non-existent within the majority of national programmes of ITE.¹⁴ In turn, the omission of HRE from ITE is frequently cited as the principal reason for its paucity in schools, for to be able to provide effective HRE teachers must themselves

receive comprehensive training in 'the necessary knowledge, understanding, skills and competencies to facilitate the learning and practice of human rights in schools'.¹⁵ Indeed, research in this area has demonstrated a clear link between increased HRE in ITE and its subsequent incorporation into classroom teaching.¹⁶

Research has shown that Scotland represents an example of a country in which HRE is sparse or non-existent in many classrooms.¹⁷ Teaching about HRE in Scottish classrooms is currently fragmented and inconsistent owing largely to insufficiencies in both the confidence and abilities of many teachers to provide suitable education in this area. HRE is not filtering down into classroom practice and many school children in Scotland are emerging from formal education with little or no knowledge of their own human rights entitlements or of the importance of human rights concepts more widely. This project seeks to address this by starting from the premise that for teachers to be able to provide effective HRE, they themselves must receive adequate instruction in HRE within their own ITE programmes.

Appendix I provides more detailed information on the international legal obligation to include HRE within programmes of teacher education or training.

1.3 Why is this Research Necessary?

The full extent and sufficiency of HRE within programmes of ITE run by Scottish HEIs has not been the subject of comprehensive study, and information on this subject is therefore piecemeal and sparse. Whilst the Scottish Government has explained that human rights are 'embedded within the curriculum',¹⁸ it has also acknowledged to the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights that the UNWPHRE has had little impact upon domestic education. The Government explained its reasons for this, with express acknowledgement that insufficiencies in teacher education in this area means that teachers are often unaware of the requirement to teach about HRE.¹⁹

BEMIS has recently mapped the extent of HRE in Scotland with a view to developing an outreach Continuing Professional Development (CPD) programme for interested teachers.

Though this project did not map the extent of HRE within ITE specifically, the research survey did query the extent of training that teachers felt they had received in HRE (both pre and post qualification) and an overwhelming majority responded that they had received no training in this area (78% of the 346 respondents to the question). Furthermore, a number of recently qualified probationer teachers indicated that they had not received any training or awareness raising on human rights or the UNCRC during their ITE, suggesting that Scottish HEIs are not currently addressing the inadequacy of HRE within ITE programmes.

In the absence of any comprehensive and focused research into current HRE practice within programmes of ITE in Scotland, this research aims to fill this gap in the existing literature. It evaluates the extent and scope of HRE provision within ITE programmes and gauges interest in the development of a HRE module or resource for use within university ITE programmes. A number of recommendations for policy reform in this area will be made based upon the findings.

Footnotes

- 2 BEMIS, 'A Review of Human Rights Education in Schools in Scotland (March 2013).
- 3 UDHR, Article 26(2).
- 4 P Gerber, *From Convention to Classroom: The Long Road to Human Rights Education* (2008), title of chapter.
- 5 UN General Assembly, 'United Nations Declaration on Human Rights Education and Training' (2011) (Resolution A/RES/66/137), Article 2(2) [emphasis added].
- 6 Human Rights Education Associates, 'UN General Assembly Adopts Declaration on Human Rights Education and Training' (2011) (available at: http://www.hrea.org/index.php?base_id=1197&language_id=1)
- 7 UN General Assembly, 'United Nations Decade for Human Rights Education (1995-2004) and Public Information Activities in the Field of Human Rights: Report of the Secretary-General' (1997) (A/52/469/Add.1) para 12.
- 8 In partnership with key stakeholders: UNESCO, Amnesty International, SCCYP, Education Scotland and the IDEAS network.
- 9 BEMIS, 'A Review of Human Rights Education in Schools in Scotland' (2013) at 7.
- 10 BEMIS, 'A Review of Human Rights Education in Schools in Scotland (March 2013) at 47.
- 11 In Scotland, ITE results in provisional registration and teachers must complete a probationary period before they are fully registered to teach. See section 2.1.3 for more information.
- 12 P Musset, 'Initial Teacher Education and Continuing Training Policies in a Comparative Perspective: Current Practices in OECD Countries and a Literature Review on Potential Effects' OECD Education Working Papers, No.48 (2010) para 2.1.1.
- 13 UN General Assembly, 'United Nations Declaration on Human Rights Education and Training' (2011) (Resolution A/RES/66/137), Article 7(4).
- 14 P Gerber, *From Convention to Classroom: The Long Road to Human Rights Education* (2008) 225; F Waldron et al, 'Teacher, Human Rights and Human Rights Education: Knowledge, Perspectives and Practices of Primary School Teachers in Ireland', Dublin: The Centre for Human Rights and Citizenship Education (2011) at 49; & Y V Lapayese, 'National Initiatives within the UN Decade for Human Rights Education: The Implementation of Human Rights Education Policy Reforms in Schools' (2004) 3 *Educational Research for Policy and Practice* 167 at 179.
- 15 UN General Assembly, 'Final Evaluation of the Implementation of the First Phase of the World Programme for Human Rights Education' (2010) (A/65/322) para 54.
- 16 F Waldron et al, 'Teacher, Human Rights and Human Rights Education: Knowledge, Perspectives and Practices of Primary School Teachers in Ireland', Dublin: The Centre for Human Rights and Citizenship Education (2011) at 175 & 177.
- 17 See for example BEMIS, 'A Review of Human Rights Education in Schools in Scotland (March 2013); & A E C Struthers, 'Human Rights Education: educating about, through and for human rights' (2014) *The International Journal of Human Rights* (available at: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/13642987.2014.986652>).
- 18 Scottish Government, National Report to the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights Regarding Implementation of the First Phase of the United Nations World Programme for Human Rights Education (2010) at 8 & 10.
- 19 Ibid at 13.
- 20 BEMIS, 'A Review of Human Rights Education in Schools in Scotland (March 2013).

Chapter 2: Human Rights Education in Initial Teacher Education in Scotland

Key Findings:

- **There are a set number of recognised routes to qualification as a teacher in Scotland, meaning that there is more control over the regulation of ITE.**
- **Requirements for providing HRE can be found in: (i) the Standards for Provisional Registration issued by the GTCS; (ii) the Scottish Curriculum for Excellence; and (iii) relevant existing training programmes and resources.**
- **Most teachers report that they have received little or no training in how to provide HRE within their classroom teaching.**

2.1 ITE in Scotland

As of 1984, all entrants to the teaching profession in Scotland are required to hold a university degree from a qualifying institution.²¹ The General Teaching Council for Scotland (GTCS) carries out the accreditation process for programmes of ITE, though HEIs must also validate the courses they provide.²²

In contrast to a number of other countries, including England and Northern Ireland, ITE approval in Scotland is given to the ITE course itself, as opposed to the HEI offering the course. Scotland also differs from its neighbouring countries by involving its national General Teaching Council in the accreditation process, as opposed to simply its education authority and accompanying inspectorate. ITE courses will only receive accreditation if they enable student teachers to meet the GTCS Standards for Provisional Registration (GTCS Standards).²³

Extensive consultation with teachers in the drawing up of the GTCS Standards means that 'ITE can be regarded as largely self-regulating in Scotland'.²⁴ It has also been noted that by having the GTCS Standards at the core of the accreditation process, 'Scotland pays more attention to teachers' commitment and values, especially inclusion and equality, than England does'.²⁵ The Scottish system also affords greater flexibility for ITE providers and results in 'a sufficiently broad framework within which you can take the students forward in all kinds of directions', thus not 'constraining institutions in terms of how they design their course'.²⁶

Eight Scottish HEIs currently offer programmes of ITE that have received accreditation and are thus deemed to comply with the GTCS's required standards for graduating teachers. These are:

- The University of Aberdeen;
- The University of Dundee;
- The University of Edinburgh;
- The University of Glasgow;
- The University of the Highlands and Islands;

- The University of Stirling;
- The University of Strathclyde; and
- The University of the West of Scotland.

2.1.1 Recent Reform to ITE in Scotland

Programmes of ITE tend to be in continuous flux. Within a recent Literature Review on Teacher Education in the 21st Century, commissioned by the Scottish Government as part of a wider review of ITE, all fifteen of the countries drawn upon for international comparison had recently undertaken reform of their teacher education programmes.²⁷

Scotland too has carried out a number of reviews into its programmes of ITE.²⁸ The most recent of these was an extensive review of ITE carried out in Scotland in 2010, colloquially named the Donaldson Review, following the introduction of Curriculum for Excellence.²⁹

The above-mentioned Literature Review on Teacher Education in the 21st Century was commissioned as part of the Donaldson Review, and had as its principal aim:

*To understand the contribution that teacher education can make to the quality and effectiveness of the educational experience and wider personal development of young people, drawing on effective practice in Scotland and elsewhere.*³⁰

The Donaldson Report advised, however, that little existing research in the field of teacher education linked ITE directly to the *wider personal development of young people*, and further identified difficulties in:

*Striking the right balance between breadth and depth in what is covered in the course. ... There is clear evidence of courses trying but failing to keep pace with an ever-expanding set of expectations of what should be included. ... Concerns about about students' depth of understanding of both what they are teaching and about how to employ teaching approaches which meet the needs of their pupils and of the particular subject matter.*³¹

A number of recommendations from the Donaldson Review and subsequent Report have now been implemented across Scottish ITE providers and will be discussed where relevant below.

2.1.2 Routes to Teaching Qualification

The Scottish system provides a number of different routes to obtaining a teaching qualification through programmes of ITE within its HEIs. Following the Donaldson Review and Report, Bachelor of Education (BEd) programmes are being phased out. Scottish HEIs now no longer offer BEd programmes for incoming students, though existing students will continue to graduate from traditional BEd courses until 2017.

In place of BEd programmes, Scottish HEIs are now offering BA (Hons) or MA (Hons) degree programmes combining professional students with in-depth academic study beyond the field of education. The BA and MA are of the same SCQF level with the 'M' in MA reserved for the ancient universities. At the University of Glasgow, the degree is referred to as the 'MEduc'.

(i) Primary Education

Until current BEd students complete their degree programmes, there are three recognised routes to qualification for primary teachers in Scotland:

- Dedicated Undergraduate Programmes – previously most commonly the Bachelor of Education (BEd) (typically comprising four academic years of study, including a minimum of 30 weeks of educational placement) and now replaced by BA (Hons) or MA (Hons) programmes;
- Concurrent Undergraduate Programmes: concurrent programmes enable students to obtain a degree in a specialised subject and a separate teaching qualification. This again typically involves four academic years of study and a minimum of 18 weeks of educational placement; or
- Professional Graduate Diploma in Education (PGDE): enables graduates to obtain a primary teaching qualification by completing a minimum of 36 weeks full-time study. Fifty per cent of that time must be allocated to educational placements.

At the University of Aberdeen, students in their 4th year of the MA programme are combined with PGDE students to create a joint MA4/PGDE course.

The University of the Highlands and Islands is a federated university and has only recently started running a programme of ITE. It offers a one-year PGDE primary programme run through five academic partners.

(ii) Secondary Education

As with primary education, there are three recognised routes to qualification for secondary teachers in Scotland:

- BEd, or equivalent: typically comprises four academic years of study, including a minimum of 30 weeks of educational placement. Such programmes are being phased out post-Donaldson;
- Concurrent Undergraduate Programmes: as with the equivalent primary qualification, concurrent programmes enable students to obtain a degree in a specialised subject and a separate secondary teaching qualification. This is a more common route to qualification for secondary teachers than for primary teachers. Concurrent degrees typically involves three and a half academic years of study and a minimum of 18 weeks of educational placement; or
- PGDE: as with primary education, this requires a minimum of 36 weeks full-time study with at least fifty per cent of that time devoted to educational placements, with students having already completed an undergraduate degree.

2.1.3 HRE in the Standards for Provisional Registration

The General Teaching Council for Scotland is the independent professional body responsible for promoting and regulating the teaching profession in Scotland. It maintains the relevant Standards for Provisional Registration that outline what is expected of student teachers at the completion of their ITE. The GTCS Standards were revised in 2007 and again on 1 August 2013, with the new Standards outlining the expectations upon student teachers at the end of ITE. Once this initial registration is obtained, all provisionally registered teachers then continue their professional learning by working towards

attainment of the Standards for Full Registration.³² Provisional registration requires competence in three areas:

- Professional values and personal commitment;
- Professional knowledge and understanding; and
- Professional skills and abilities.³³

The categories are considered to be complementary and linked, with professional values and personal commitment at the heart of the inter-relationship. It is significant, therefore, that it is within the category of professional values and personal commitment that the professional teaching requirements most relevant to HRE are found. Teachers are required, for example, to value and demonstrate a commitment to social justice, including embracing locally and globally the educational and social values of equality and justice, and to recognise the rights and responsibilities of current and future generations. They must respect social and cultural diversity and promote the principles and practices of local and global citizenship. Teachers are additionally required to demonstrate commitment to the principles of democracy, and to show respect for the rights of all learners as outlined in the UNCRC, including recognition of learners' entitlement to be involved in decisions regarding their learning experiences.

Owing to the fact that a fundamental requirement of accreditation of ITE programmes in Scotland is that student teachers 'have the capacity to meet the Standards for Provisional Registration',³⁴ all accredited ITE providers should be facilitating each of the elements of ITE that touch upon HRE discussed above. It is particularly noteworthy that in the United Kingdom's state report to the Committee on the Rights of the Child in 2008, express reference was made to the fact that the Standards emphasise the importance of the UNCRC and require prospective teachers 'to demonstrate respect for the rights of all children as set out in the Convention'.³⁵

2.2 Human Rights Education in the Scottish Curriculum

In addition to such references to ideas consistent with HRE within the ITE requirements for teachers, the provision of HRE is also required by the Scottish curriculum. Curriculum for Excellence (CfE) is the national curriculum for learners aged between 3 and 18, and was formally introduced into primary and secondary schools in 2010.

Though it is not a prescribed national curriculum, schools are expected to follow national guidelines and design their teaching to conform to the Education Scotland drafted Experiences and Outcomes (E&Os).³⁶ The E&Os are broad and aim to foster the development of pupils in four capacities: as successful learners, confident individuals, effective contributors and responsible citizens. As drafted, therefore, CfE is designed to be flexible, with a strong focus on outcomes, and to provide teachers with greater autonomy than the preceding 5-14 Guidelines.

The Scottish Government considers 'human rights' and 'a rights-based approach to education' to be concepts relevant to the provision of education under CfE. Whilst not taught as a discrete subject, elements of HRE are arguably present across the teaching areas of (i) responsibility of all; (ii) freestanding curriculum areas; and (iii) themes across learning. A brief explanation of each is required.

2.2.1 Responsibility of All

These subjects are the responsibility of all teachers, and comprise Literacy across learning, Numeracy across learning and Health and Wellbeing across learning. Though HRE does not feature in Literacy across learning or Numeracy across learning, its presence within Health and Wellbeing across learning is noteworthy.

The curriculum guidance expressly directs learners: (i) to explore and exercise their rights appropriately and to accept the responsibilities that go with them; and (ii) to show respect for the rights of others.³⁷ Learners should learn to contribute to and participate in society and recognise their role in bring about positive change in the school and wider community.

The Health and Wellbeing guidance further directs that learners will be supported to 'acknowledge diversity and understand that it is everyone's responsibility to challenge discrimination'.

2.2.2 Freestanding Curriculum Areas

Whilst HRE values and principles are alluded to in a number of freestanding curriculum areas, such as references to deepening understandings of the wider world in the Expressive Arts and developing a richer understanding of active citizenship within Modern Languages, they are not generally couched in the express terminology of human rights. The E&Os in Social Studies make explicit reference to 'rights and responsibilities', encouraging learners at primary school to consider the meaning of rights and responsibilities and to discuss those of particular relevance to them. Primary learners then proceed to discuss the features of a democracy and the rights and responsibilities specifically affecting Scottish citizens. In the first three years of secondary education, learners compare the rights and responsibilities of Scottish citizens with a contrasting society, and finally within the last two years of secondary education, learners are expected to be able to make 'reasoned judgements about how the exercise of power affects the rights and responsibilities of citizens by comparing a more democratic and less democratic society'.⁴⁰

Numerous references are made within the Religious and Moral Education (RME) E&Os to ideas consistent with HRE ideas,⁴¹ such as developing respect for others, and counteracting prejudice and intolerance. RME also contains the only express reference to 'human rights' within any freestanding curriculum subject, in an E&O requiring learners of primary age to develop views about values such as fairness, equality and human rights.⁴² Learners at secondary school are then expected to build upon this knowledge by (i) discussing ways in which to create a more just, equal, compassionate and tolerant society, and (ii) putting their understanding of morality and values into practice through participating in events which make a positive difference to others.⁴³

2.2.3 Themes Across Learning

Global Citizenship represents, along with Enterprise in Education, one of the 'themes across learning' within CfE. As a 'theme across learning', it must not consist of a simple add-on to any curriculum area but instead should provide a context in which to deliver all of the E&Os. By embedding the 'themes across learning' throughout all curriculum areas, the Government believes that learners will acquire the 'knowledge, skills, values and attitudes' necessary for full and active participation in society.⁴⁴

It is of considerable significance, therefore, that the clearest presence of HRE in CfE is within Global Citizenship. Reference is made in the curriculum guidance to learners developing an understanding of equality and human rights issues, and this idea is continued and developed in Global Citizenship's subsidiary strands:

- Education for Citizenship, for example, addresses issues including 'human rights, ...social equality and appreciation of diversity';⁴⁵
- International Education prepares learners for 'active participation in a global, multi-cultural society';⁴⁶ and
- Sustainable Development Education includes a Social Sustainability element 'enabling all people of the world to have a quality of life which respects their human dignity and ensures that their rights to nutrition, health, wellbeing, education and freedom are met'.

With HRE occupying a more central position in CfE than within the preceding 5-14 curriculum – and given the prominence of human rights principles and practice within the Standards for Provisional Registration – it is perhaps to be expected that it would also occupy a prominent place within ITE programmes at the relevant HEIs. Indeed, it was reported by Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Education in 2010 that ITE providers had given their assurance to the then Cabinet Secretary for Education and Lifelong Learning that all facets of CfE would be embedded in their programmes of ITE by 2013.⁴⁸ It is unfortunate therefore that recent research in this area suggests that newly qualified probationer teachers have received little, if any, training on HRE.

2.3 Existing HRE Training & Resources

In addition to HRE within both the Standards for Provisional Registration and CfE, there are additional training programmes and resources available through which teachers may become familiar with HRE in the course of their ITE or subsequent professional practice. Some examples include:

- **Recognising and Realising Children's Rights**

In Autumn 2013, Aileen Campbell MSP, Minister for Children and Young People, commissioned Education Scotland to produce a national professional development resource on children's rights.⁵⁰ The resulting online training resource, *Recognising and Realising Children's Rights*, 'aims to develop knowledge and understanding of the UNCRC with the purpose of supporting rights-based values, attitudes, skills and practices among those adults who have a duty of care for children and young people'.⁵¹

The Rights, Support and Wellbeing team at Education Scotland has led national training events to promote the resource and further its implementation, and electronic copies have been made available to Local Authorities. Whilst *Recognising and Realising Children's Rights* is aimed at adults currently working with children and young people and is being delivered predominantly through Local Authorities, the resource could be useful for ITE providers.

- **UNICEF's Rights Respecting Schools Award**

A quarter of Scottish schools are currently working towards the Rights Respecting Schools Award (RRSA),⁵² which 'recognises achievement in putting the UNCRC at the

heart of a school's planning, policies, practice and ethos'.⁵³ UNICEF provides guidance and support to schools to enable them to implement and maintain the school-wide standards required for RRSa accreditation. Many teachers therefore become familiar with human rights terminology and instruments through involvement with the RRSa programme.

- **Global Learning Programme Scotland**

This training programme organised by the IDEAS network is delivered by the Scottish Development Education Centres and has been running for 2 years. It offers practical funded support to clusters, schools and teachers to develop global citizenship. The programme requires teachers to undertake a three-stage process involving training, practical implementation and reflection.

2.4 Human Rights Education within ITE in Scotland

Within their recent mapping of HRE in formal education in Scotland,⁵⁴ BEMIS reported both that the majority of teachers had received no ITE or CPD in HRE (78% of 346 respondents) and that the most commonly cited barrier to HRE identified by teachers is their own lack of relevant knowledge and/or training in the area.⁵⁵ These research findings led BEMIS to advise that:

*The large number (78%) of respondents who stated that they have not had access to any form of HRE training at all, either during their ITE programmes or through professional development, is concerning, not least because of the limitations this will have on young people's entitlement to HRE.*⁵⁶

Of the 22% of teachers that had received some training on HRE, it was encouraging that the majority of this training had been conducted within HEIs during pre-qualification training. Those universities explicitly referred to within the responses to the BEMIS survey were the Universities of Aberdeen, Edinburgh, Glasgow and Strathclyde, though most respondents did stipulate that this amounted to just one lecture or tutorial on the topic within broader training on the curriculum areas of Global Citizenship and Health and Wellbeing. Within their final report, BEMIS thus concluded that:

*As teachers have strongly indicated a lack of training in this area, we believe that a national training programme should be considered to empower educators to develop and harness their interest in HRE in such a way that it permeates all aspects of learning, teaching and curricula.*⁵⁷

The next chapter on the existing practices of HRE in ITE within the eight relevant Scottish universities probes more deeply into the extent and scope of the current training being provided in these institutions.

Footnotes

- 21 This includes the Teaching Qualification of the General Teaching Council for Scotland. For more information, see the website of the General Teaching Council of Scotland: <http://www.gtcs.org.uk/home/home.aspx>.
- 22 The General Teaching Council for Scotland, 'Guidelines for Initial Teacher Education Programmes in Scotland' (June 2013) at para 1.1.
- 23 The General Teaching Council for Scotland, 'Guidelines for Initial Teacher Education Programmes in Scotland' (June 2013) at para 1.2; the GTCS Standards are included within GTCS, 'The Standards for Registration: mandatory requirements for Registration with the General Teaching Council for Scotland' (December 2012)
- 24 J McKie et al 'Initial Teacher Education in the Four Nations of the United Kingdom' (2005) at 5.
- 25 The Teaching Council, 'Learning to Teach and its Implications for the Continuum of Teacher Education: A Nine-Country Cross-National Study' (2009) para 3.3.7.
- 26 E Brisard, I Menter and I Smith, 'Convergence or Divergence? Initial Teacher Education Policy and Practice in England and Scotland' (University of Paisley, 2003) at 33-34.
- 27 Those countries were: Australia, Canada, England, Finland, France, Italy, Japan, Netherlands, New Zealand, Northern Ireland, Norway, Singapore, South Korea, USA & Wales.
- 28 See, for example, Scottish Executive, 'Review of Initial Teacher Education Stage 2: Report of the Review Group' (2005).
- 29 G Donaldson, 'Teaching Scotland's Future: Report of a review of teacher education in Scotland' (2010).
- 30 The Scottish Government, 'Literature Review on Teacher Education in the 21st Century' (2010) at 1.
- 31 G Donaldson, 'Teaching Scotland's Future: Report of a review of teacher education in Scotland' (2010) at 8.
- 32 GTCS, 'The Standards for Registration: mandatory requirements for Registration with the General Teaching Council for Scotland' (December 2012) at 2.
- 33 Ibid.
- 34 The General Teaching Council for Scotland, 'Guidelines for Initial Teacher Education Programmes in Scotland' (June 2013) para 3.1.
- 35 UN Committee on the Rights of the Child, 'Consideration of Reports Submitted by States Parties under Article 44 of the Convention: United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland (2008) (CRC/C/GBR/4) para 69.
- 36 Scottish Government, 'National Report to the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights Regarding Implementation of the First Phase of the United Nations World Programme for Human Rights Education' (2010) at 5.

- 37 CfE, 'Health and Wellbeing Across Learning: responsibilities of all', E&Os in Social Wellbeing section.
- 38 CfE, 'Health and Wellbeing Across Learning: responsibilities of all', E&Os in Social Wellbeing section.
- 39 CfE, 'Health and Wellbeing Across Learning: responsibilities of all' at 1.
- 40 CfE, 'Social Studies', E&Os in People, Past Events and Societies section.
- 41 RME is studied in non-denominational schools in Scotland. Religious Education (RE) is studied in Roman Catholic schools and the relevant E&Os for RE make no express reference to human rights.
- 42 CfE, 'Religious and Moral Education' E&Os in Christianity section and World religions selected for study section.
- 43 CfE, 'Religious and Moral Education' E&Os in Christianity section and World religions selected for study section.
- 44 Learning and Teaching Scotland, 'Developing Global Citizens Within Curriculum for Excellence' (2011) at 8.
- 45 'Education for Citizenship', Education Scotland website (available at <http://www.educationscotland.gov.uk/learningteachingandassessment/learningacrossthecurriculum/themesacrosslearning/globalcitizenship/about/educationforcitizenship/index.asp>)
- 46 Learning and Teaching Scotland, 'Developing Global Citizens Within Curriculum for Excellence' (2011) at 11.
- 47 Sustainable Development Education, Education Scotland website (available at: <http://www.educationscotland.gov.uk/learningteachingandassessment/learningacrossthecurriculum/themesacrosslearning/globalcitizenship/sustainabledevelopment/elements.asp>)
- 48 HMIE, 'Report on the Aspect Review of Initial Teacher Education' (2010) para 1.1.10.
- 49 BEMIS, 'A Review of Human Rights Education in Schools in Scotland (March 2013); & A E C Struthers, 'Human Rights Education: educating about, through and for human rights' (2014) *The International Journal of Human Rights* (available at: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/13642987.2014.986652>).
- 50 For more information, see Education Scotland, 'Recognising and Realising Children's Rights' (available at: <http://www.educationscotland.gov.uk/resources/r/childrensrightsresource.asp>)
- 51 Education Scotland, News and Events (available at: http://www.educationscotland.gov.uk/newsandevents/educationnews/2013/education/october/news_tcm4817178.asp)
- 52 Black and Ethnic Minority Infrastructure in Scotland, 'Human Rights Education: Theory and Practices' (2011) at 11; for an evaluation of the program, see generally J Sebba & C Robinson, 'Evaluation of UNICEF UK's Rights Respecting Schools Award' (2010).
- 53 From UNICEF website, Rights Respecting Schools Award: <http://www.unicef.org.uk/rrsa>.
- 54 BEMIS, 'A Review of Human Rights Education in Schools in Scotland (March 2013).
- 55 62% of the 47 respondents who provided further information in response to the relevant survey question expressly mentioned lack of knowledge and/or training.
- 56 BEMIS, 'A Review of Human Rights Education in Schools in Scotland (March 2013) at 59.
- 57 BEMIS, 'A Review of Human Rights Education in Schools in Scotland (March 2013) at 61.

Chapter 3: Current HRE Practice in Scottish HEIs

Key Findings:

- **Whilst none of the current ITE providers run compulsory modules exclusively addressing HRE, all include reference to HRE concepts within other mandatory or optional modules.**
- **All ITE providers work with NGOs and other organisations to provide additional instruction in this area, and most set mandatory or optional reading on HRE.**
- **There are many examples of good practice within the programmes run by Scottish ITE providers, but the scope and content of HRE provision varies considerably between the institutions.**

3.1 Research Aim and Objectives

This research aims to identify and make recommendations for addressing the current deficiencies in the scope and content of HRE within programmes of ITE at Scottish HEIs.

Its objectives are to:

- Evaluate and assess the extent and scope of HRE within current programmes of ITE at Scottish HEIs, including both (i) highlighting examples of current good practice; and (ii) identifying current deficiencies that often result in teachers not incorporating HRE into their classroom teaching;
- Gauge interest in the development of a HRE module or resource for ITE and ascertain ITE provider preferences for the scope and content of such a module or resource; and
- Make recommendations for policy change in this area directed towards both ITE providers and policy makers in the field more widely.

3.2 Methodology

The project was conducted in three stages. An initial scoping exercise was carried out through internet searches and by telephoning and/or emailing providers of ITE in Scotland to establish the extent of HRE currently available within their institutions. This involved assessing whether the institutions:

- Run compulsory modules on HRE;
- Include HRE topics within other compulsory modules;
- Refer students explicitly to compulsory reading on HRE;
- Refer students to optional additional reading on HRE; and
- Offer compulsory or optional sessions on HRE run by external organisations, such as NGOs.

The second stage consisted of qualitative semi-structured interviews with a relevant staff member from each of the HEIs in Scotland currently offering programmes of ITE. These interviews provided more detail on the scope and content of

HRE within programmes of ITE at the relevant institutions and sought to gauge interest in the development of a HRE module or resource to be used in ITE. The latter line of enquiry explored with interviewees the preferred content of such a module or resource and queried whether it should be a compulsory component of ITE.

The final stage of the project involved consultation with members of an Advisory Group consisting of representatives from:

- BEMIS
- Scotdec;
- Scotland's Commissioner for Children and Young People;
- University of Aberdeen;
- University of Glasgow; and
- University of Strathclyde.

The Advisory Committee also included an independent rights consultant employed by Local Authorities and schools to embed the UNCRC within schools in Scotland.

The members of the Advisory Group represented experts in the fields of both HRE and educational policy and practice. They provided comments on the findings from the initial fact finding stages of the project and gave feedback on the content and recommendations of the final report.

3.2.1. Ethics

As it is possible to identify individual interviewees from each of the relevant HEIs within this research project, interview participants were offered the option of not being identified by name anywhere within the report. All participants advised that they were happy to be named in the acknowledgements section.

It should also be recognised that any comments made by the interviewees advancing suggestions for the most effective means of incorporating HRE to a greater extent within programmes of ITE represent personal opinions. The scoping exercise is thus limited in the extent to which the views of the interviewees can be attributed more broadly to the universities.

3.3 Research Findings

The information provided by the universities highlights examples of good practice across ITE provision in Scotland, and all of the HEIs currently offering ITE programmes are delivering HRE to a certain extent within their courses. Furthermore, reforms to all undergraduate ITE courses following the Donaldson Review and Report are likely to have made certain elements of ITE provision more compliant with HRE expectations. The research findings nevertheless indicate that the current system is fragmented and inconsistent, with the extent to which HRE features as a central component of teaching varying considerably between institutions.

The research findings concerning the scope and extent of HRE within current programmes of ITE will be presented under headings that equate to the questions put to relevant staff members at the Scottish HEIs during the course of the semi-structured interviews. They relate to (i) the inclusion of HRE within teaching courses and modules; (ii) reference to reading

material on human rights; and (iii) use of NGOs and other external organisations in the provision of HRE.

3.3.1 Do any of the current ITE providers run compulsory modules on HRE or include HRE components within other compulsory modules?

(i) Compulsory modules that include human rights elements

Whilst none of the universities are currently running compulsory modules exclusively addressing HRE, several are including reference to HRE concepts within other mandatory modules. In particular, teaching on the UNCRC is included within relevant modules at each of the universities.

At the **University of the West of Scotland**, for example, the UNCRC is used as a starting point for discussion of citizenship rights, and in particular for consideration of participation rights in schools. In ITE at the **University of Glasgow**, the UNCRC is introduced early in the degree programmes as one of the tools through which students should be starting to reflect on professional practice, and at the **University of Strathclyde** much of the work in the area of human rights and children's rights is concerned with problematizing rights. The approach taken therefore seeks to equip students with the pedagogical tools through which they can teach HRE effectively, and explicitly linking teaching to the UNCRC is considered to be one of the most effective ways of doing this. A compulsory first year module on What Makes us Human? at the **University of Aberdeen** also includes a specific lecture and workshop exploring the UNCRC, and teaching on both the UNCRC and human rights more generally is included within the one year primary programme of ITE at the **University of the Highlands and Islands**.

HRE more generally also features to a certain extent within compulsory modules across the different programmes of ITE. Discussion of general human rights issues features in teaching around inclusion at the **University of Edinburgh**, for example, with HRE also addressed to a lesser extent within modules on development.

Modules that address broader human rights issues are also included within ITE at the **University of Glasgow**. Although there is no freestanding module labelled specifically as HRE, rights are embedded within the existing module frameworks. For example, under the Donaldson reforms, one of the major compulsory strands across the four-year degree programme is now Education and Society. Whilst the PGDE at the university has less human rights input owing to constraints in curriculum time, the undergraduate degree programme addresses rights in various compulsory modules at each level of the four-year degree.

As with Glasgow, the **University of Stirling** does not offer a designated HRE module, but certain aspects of human rights are addressed in other modules. Within the concurrent degree – a four-year degree programme with an education qualification alongside – students undertake an Introduction to Education in their first year, which looks at areas of concern within education more generally. Human rights issues frequently surface in this context, including for example within lectures on the rights of minorities. In their second year, the students are then exposed to rights to varying degrees depending upon their particular programme of study. The early years students, for example, have a compulsory lecture and seminar specifically on children's rights, and there are elements of the professional programme that are linked to rights in practice.

Additionally, students undertake a compulsory module in the sixth semester of the degree programme – after they have completed their 5-week professional placement – which aims to address the wider support role of teachers. The module is entitled Differences and Identities and it looks specifically at rights-based approaches to teaching and what these might look like in practice. This involves thinking about issues of inclusion and considering a young person's experience from a particular perspective, using, for example, an environmental or social model. A head teacher from a local school talks to the students about some of the ways that rights can be incorporated into school processes and about the extension of rights to the school environment. Showing how rights fit into the organisational structures of schools is considered to be a particularly effective way of demonstrating to students the implication of rights for their own teaching practice.

The Differences and Identities module is infused with a rights-based approach, and includes work on Restorative Approaches. It also refers explicitly to the Getting It Right for Every Child framework. Students attend a local school once a week for 5 weeks to better understand rights and inclusion policies in practice, and then a series of visiting speakers take sessions with the students which are also rights-based and deal with the practices of working with young people

The **University of Strathclyde** was one of the first universities to have gone through the validation process for the new degree programmes and from September 2013, students undertake two education modules in their first year of study. One of these modules, Understanding Education in the 21st Century,⁵⁸ specifically addresses rights. In their second year, students undertake a compulsory module entitled Barriers to Learning and Contexts of Schooling, in which children's rights and inclusive practice feature heavily; and in third year they take another compulsory module on the Philosophy of Education that touches upon issues of problematizing human rights and children's rights.

Within both Religious Education and Education for Sustainable Development, too, human rights issues are explored; and in the Educational Studies course, HRE is considered both from a legal and philosophical perspective. In 2012-2013, for example, the focus of the 4th year Educational Studies course was contemporary issues, which looked at the then Children and Young People Bill in Scotland,⁵⁹ and in the preceding academic year, pupil voice and participation had provided the focus. The BA in Childhood Practice, undertaken by early years workers, also has a whole module on children's rights and inclusive practice.

Most modules within the programmes of ITE at the **University of the West of Scotland** are compulsory for all students. Within this compulsory set of modules, the University runs lectures and workshops on citizenship and global citizenship, and these tend to start from a human rights perspective. In the early stages of their PGDE programme, both primary and secondary education students undertake a series of lectures addressing topics relevant to rights. Their opening lecture, for example, is on the purpose of education, and this deals expressly with human rights issues. This is then followed by a full day on citizenship, one on global citizenship and another on professionalism. These days address issues such as: the emergence of human rights post-WWII; racism, including issues like Islamophobia; human rights in terms of equality and class; and democracy, focusing in particular on China and mass movements in countries in the Middle East.

(ii) Optional modules that include human rights elements

Many of the universities additionally offer optional modules that address certain elements of HRE. In the second year of the MA programme at the **University of Aberdeen**, for example, the module *What Makes Us Human?* becomes optional, replacing the previous BEd module on *Global Childhood*. The UNCRC retains a central role in the 2nd year *What Makes Us Human?* module for students who continue to study it. For example, students review topical issues with specific reference to UNCRC articles. A 3rd year Professional Focus option entitled *Passport to the World* also has human rights at its core, and is built around issues of identity and belonging. In the 2013-14 academic year, students taking the module looked at current issues relating to asylum seekers and refugees in the UK. A module on *Global Citizenship* has also replaced the previous *Citizenship Education* unit for 4th year students who are doing social studies. Whilst the new module places greater emphasis on rights, it is an optional module only.

The **University of Dundee** similarly offers optional modules that address human rights topics. Both the inclusive practice and the child-centred electives consider the UNCRC and children's rights in detail, for example. The degree to which students are exposed to human rights topics therefore depends very much upon the route that they take to qualification.

Following the Donaldson Review, a system of electives has been introduced for third and fourth years at the **University of Glasgow**. These modules have rights as a permeating element, and cover issues such as *Global Citizenship* and support for the children of new arrivals. There is also an additional module on *Educational Support* and although much of this addresses language and EAL (English as an Additional Language) issues, rights are at its core.

Following the phasing out of the BEd, the set-up of the four-year undergraduate programme at the **University of the West of Scotland** has been altered. A University-wide module on citizenship is now offered that has human rights issues, such as respect and dignity, as its basis. This is, however, an optional module worth 60 credits *in addition* to the existing 480 credits required for the undergraduate degree. The 60 credit module has a core element on citizenship, a second module addressing issues such as working in the community, peer mentoring and developing greater political awareness, and a third module targeted to citizenship within specific disciplines, such as chemistry or engineering.

The **University of Strathclyde**, too, offers a voluntary and extra-modular CPD which aims to demonstrate to students how they might begin to address human rights and HRE within their teaching practice. A number of students run their own CPD on topics that relate to human rights, such as sectarianism, or request staff to run additional CPD sessions on HRE.

At the **University of the Highlands and Islands**, human rights is referred to at various points throughout the programme modules, particularly in relation to *Health and Wellbeing* and *Additional Support Needs*.

(iii) Teaching HRE in the absence of human rights terminology

Within some programmes of ITE, whilst HRE concepts are included in certain courses, the terminology of human rights is not adopted. The **University of Dundee**, for example, places

great emphasis on providing students with a strong values base upon which to build subsequent knowledge of areas such as citizenship, equality and human rights in teaching practice. Its ITE programme is designed to provide the building blocks for subsequent practice by addressing relevant general topics, including social justice and values education.

At the **University of Edinburgh** too, whilst human rights terminology is expressly used within certain modules, such as those around inclusion and social justice, such terminology is less explicit in framing the relevant course outlines.

(iv) External influences upon the inclusion of HRE within ITE modules

At some of the universities, both the Scottish Government and external organisations have been influential in increasing the presence of HRE in certain courses within ITE programmes. In 2009-2010, for example, the **University of Aberdeen** received a large Government grant to explore and develop inclusive practice within its PGDE programme. It was envisaged that this pilot project would then be rolled out across the other ITE providers in Scotland. Owing to the nature of the inclusive practice/social justice agenda of the pilot project, the concepts relating to HRE featured heavily in its policies. Within the two compulsory modules on the primary and secondary PGDE programmes, for example, HRE concepts feature prominently:

- Professional studies: involving a number of specific issues relating to aspects of human rights, including social justice, inclusion, citizenship, child protection, and learning difficulties; and
- Curricular studies: this module focuses on a number of the issues addressed within the professional studies module, but applies them to specific contexts within curriculum subject areas.

Whilst the GTCS's Standards for Provisional Registration are central to all programmes of ITE within Scotland, the relevant ITE providers differ in their approaches to preparing students to meet these. Students at the **University of Dundee**, for example, must demonstrate competency in each standard prior to completion of their degree, thus ensuring that knowledge of, and competency in using, the UNCRC is a fundamental component of ITE. The breadth and depth of knowledge of the areas referred to within the Standards does vary across degree programmes at the University, however. The UNCRC will therefore be addressed in greater detail in the four-year undergraduate programme than in the one year PGDE, though there is a greater expectation within the PGDE that students would research these additional areas in their own time.

3.3.2 Do any of the ITE providers refer students explicitly to compulsory or optional additional reading on HRE?

Students on the current MA Education programme at the **University of Aberdeen** are required to read the UNCRC, and those taking social studies are directed towards readings on *global childhood* more generally. Students at the **University of Strathclyde** are similarly required to have a good knowledge of the UNCRC, and a number of the relevant modules additionally refer to compulsory core reading on HRE with a number of follow-up references. Optional additional reading is also always suggested. At the **University of the Highlands and Islands**, students are referred to the UNCRC, however the federated nature of the University means that

other readings vary across the academic partners. Whilst the programme is taught by video conferencing and through a virtual learning environment, collaborative tasks and discussions are supported separately in each academic partner.

In contrast, at the **University of Glasgow** there are readings within the module reading lists that are related to rights but none that explicitly refers to the concept of human rights. The module readings tend to be more about curriculum policy.

Whilst the reading for the modules at the **University of the West of Scotland** that are taught from a human rights perspective (principally Citizenship and Global Citizenship) is compulsory, it tends to be those students who elect to carry out further project work or assignment options within these subject areas that read more widely on human rights issues. For example, there have been questions on citizenship in previous examinations, but these have been optional and thus it tends only to be those students who elect to answer that question in the exam would study widely on the topic. Students are, however, referred to wider reading in the lectures and in the pre-reading for their tutorials. Teaching in this area is linked to the relevant human rights instruments, so students will be familiar with the UNCRC, the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and, to a lesser extent, national legislation that deals with human rights, such as relevant Education (Scotland) Acts. Students are additionally required to read a policy document produced by Learning and Teaching Scotland entitled 'Education for Citizenship in Scotland: A Paper for Discussion and Development'.⁶⁰

Within the PGDE programme of ITE at the **University of Aberdeen**, students are directed towards relevant reading concerning the human rights instruments and machinery of the United Nations. Specific emphasis is placed upon the human rights elements of citizenship education and students are encouraged to read the relevant UN and European documentation and literature in order to understand how these supra-national frameworks have influenced Scottish legislation on social justice.

In contrast, the PGDE programme at the **University of Edinburgh** has a much smaller number of readings relating specifically to human rights. Similarly, with the greater time constraints on the PGDE programme, staff at the **University of Dundee** expect the students to read about topics such as the UNCRC and children's rights as part of their reading for the programme to a greater extent than those on the four-year programmes.

3.3.3 Do any of the ITE providers offer compulsory or optional sessions on HRE run by external organisations, such as NGOs?

As part of its PGDE programme, the **University of the West of Scotland** includes a Global Citizenship Day, which involves a full day of workshops with external organisations, such as The International Development Education Association of Scotland (IDEAS). The **University of Edinburgh** also involves external providers in its programmes of ITE, recognising that engaging with relevant organisations is an important element of the GTCS Standards for Provisional Registration. Within the secondary PGDE programme, for example, external organisations and NGOs are invited to give input on specific topics, such as global citizenship, and then students work with that information to demonstrate how they would address those issues in their own teaching practice in their specific discipline. Scotdec and the Red Cross have both been involved in these sessions. These

sessions involve explicit teaching on HRE and relevant related terminology.

Both the **Universities of Glasgow and Aberdeen** have also worked closely with the Red Cross. At Glasgow, the focus is upon humanitarian education, with the NGO providing day-long workshops with the undergraduate students and workshops of a few hours with the postgraduates. For Secondary Social Studies PGDE students at Aberdeen, the University promotes inclusive practices and social justice and has invited presenters from the Red Cross to examine relevant issues, including child soldiers and globalisation.

Students at the **University of Strathclyde** frequently identify and request extra training in areas where they feel they lack confidence. This is sometimes conducted by relevant external organisations, such as Nil by Mouth, which has recently worked with a group of students on issues of sectarianism. Within some particular modules, too, external speakers will be invited to address relevant topics. In the Contemporary Education Issues module as part of the Educational Studies on the BEd, for example, a member of staff from the office of Scotland's Commissioner for Children and Young People was invited to speak about the then Children and Young People Bill. Additionally, in 4th year there is a student course conference at which three or four external speakers will provide input on areas that the students have not addressed during their degree programme. In the 2011-2012 session, the Humanist Society spoke to the students about parity of esteem and Humanism.

A few of the universities are also working with their local Development Education Centres (DECs) in the provision of HRE. The **University of Aberdeen**, for example, works closely with the Montgomery Development Education Centre, which conducts workshops with the students on rights and citizenship issues. The **University of Dundee**, too, works in close collaboration with the One World Centre in Dundee. Staff members from the Centre are given the opportunity to provide information to students regarding their work and to distribute their newsletter, which contains relevant information for students regarding teaching and resources in this area. The students are also able to borrow resources from the Centre to use in their teaching, and many maintain links with the Centre when they enter professional practice.

Although the local DEC for the **University of Stirling** does not currently work with their students, they have worked with staff in the area of Global Education, with the work done with the staff members then filtering down into the ITE courses. Within semester 5 of the Global Citizenship module on the secondary programme, for example, students work on a cross-disciplinary programme of work relating to global citizenship, which they then present to local head teachers.

Whilst ITE at the **University of the Highlands and Islands** is a newly offered programme, it includes identified time slots where students are not in schools in order to allow local input from, and engagement with, relevant organisations.

3.4 The Effectiveness of HRE within ITE in Scotland

The above information demonstrates examples of good practice across ITE provision at HEIs in Scotland. All of the universities currently offering ITE programmes are delivering elements of HRE within: their modules, suggested reading materials, involvement with external agencies, or a combination

of these. At some HEIs, aspects of HRE are further included as permeating elements within courses and/or modules and at others, whilst human rights terminology is not used, relevant related issues are touched upon where this is considered pertinent to discussions.

Whilst each university is therefore delivering elements of HRE within its syllabus, it is the case that the scope and content of this provision within current programmes of ITE varies considerably between the relevant Scottish HEIs. A number of newly qualified teachers are entering practice without comprehensive knowledge of how to provide effective education in HRE and are consequently avoiding teaching in this area because they lack confidence in their own teaching abilities. Without detailed and consistent education in HRE across ITE providers in Scotland, the provision of HRE within primary and secondary classrooms is likely to remain piecemeal.

It is also important to highlight that representatives from the universities expressed concerns with the teaching of HRE that may provide some explanation for its paucity within programmes of ITE. For example, a small number of students have reportedly expressed the opinion that children have too many rights and that teaching children about human rights would only compound this. It is for reasons such as this, however, that the teaching of HRE within ITE is so important, for it is only through effective teaching in this area that the pre-conceptions and misconceptions of student teachers can be addressed. ITE providers must be in a position to make students aware of the wider ethical framework in which human rights are situated to ensure that students are not opposed to the idea of learners having rights in the classroom and school environment.

Concern was also raised about the use of external organisations in the provision of HRE instruction. A representative from the University of Strathclyde noted, for example, that as core academic material has to be covered in the relevant time, and all input must be assessable, there are limitations on the use of such external organisations within ITE programmes. The use of speakers must therefore support the HEI's research-informed approach within the programmes and must complement existing practices rather than be simply an additional element of instruction that can be delegated to others. Time pressure within programmes of ITE is therefore an important consideration when determining the most effective means of incorporating HRE into ITE in Scotland.

In light of such recognition that HRE in current programmes of ITE is not consistent across relevant providers, and with identification of some of the barriers to the systematic inclusion of HRE, the current project sought to address these issues by consulting with representatives from the universities to gauge not only how best to incorporate the teaching of HRE, but also the feasibility of doing so and the capacity and willingness of the providers themselves to do so. The next chapter provides a summary of the key suggestions, and a number of the principal concerns, from the representatives from each of the universities.

Footnotes

- 58 All students studying Education at the University of Strathclyde undertake this module and thus its scope is broader than just ITE students.
- 59 This is now the Children and Young People (Scotland) Act 2014.
- 60 This document was written in 2000. Learning and Teaching Scotland has since become part of Education Scotland.

Chapter 4: What is Needed to Improve HRE in ITE in Scotland?

Key Findings:

- **Most of the interviewees from the ITE providers advised that a web-based resource would be the most useful format for improving HRE within ITE.**
- **A number of the interviewees suggested that the resource should: link expressly to Curriculum for Excellence; link to existing useful resources; and be interdisciplinary.**
- **Interviewees felt that such a resource would need to be flexible as prescriptive modules or resources would not work well within the Scottish system.**

4.1 Suggestions for Improvements to HRE in ITE in Scotland

In addition to questions concerning the scope and extent of HRE within current programmes of ITE at the relevant Scottish HEIs, members of staff from the universities were also asked in the interviews about potential reform in this area. They were asked an open-ended question regarding how organisations, such as the Centre for Human Rights in Practice, could best assist HEIs in their provision of HRE. A summary of their recommendations, together with some of their concerns, is outlined in this chapter. Key recommendations for reform in this area based upon the research findings are then provided in the next chapter.

4.1.1 University of Aberdeen

(i) Summary

- **A web-based resource that is interdisciplinary and links expressly to CfE should assist teachers both in recognising and signposting HRE within their own teaching and in addressing controversial issues in the classroom.**

(ii) Key Points Made

- The focus of teaching in the area of rights and civics tends to be on development in other parts of the world or on sustainability rather than on political issues. This is because educators and student teachers tend to struggle with teaching political concepts. What is required, therefore, is **better interdisciplinary interaction between different sectors**, which encourages teachers to address more controversial political aspects of citizenship and rights.
- Any resource should also ensure that the current **shift in focus towards teaching sustainability and environmental matters does not result in socio-economic and political issues being overlooked or disregarded completely.**
- Students should also be encouraged to make the **links between the teaching of these issues and CfE**. If, for example, they are given a video clip, a poster and a pack, it

is better for their own teaching practice that they are able to see how all these elements connect both to each other and to the curriculum. They need to be better prepared and armed with the tools to address the required elements of CfE.

- A glossy pack or resource is not what is needed. It would be more beneficial to develop some sort of **resource or programme that assisted teachers in signposting the elements of their teaching practice that relate to human rights**. This is more useful than having a short dedicated workshop or session on human rights.
- **Web-based or electronic resources are often better than a pack**, particularly if they link to other useful sites, or have video clips or activities that can be used on an interactive whiteboard.

4.1.2 University of Dundee

(i) Summary

- **A web-based resource that links expressly to CfE should assist students in locating useful materials for teaching about HRE and should facilitate collaborative learning in teaching practice.**

(ii) Key Points Made

- Part of the problem with resources in ITE is that students are able to locate many different resources online, but do not have the time to determine which resources are particularly good. ITE providers should therefore aim to **assist the student in locating resources and recognising which ones are particularly useful.**
- **A prescriptive module would not work well in the Scottish system**, because all accredited programmes of ITE are structured in very different ways.
- The most useful resources are those that are **firmly rooted in, and linked explicitly to, CfE.**
- Resources that **facilitate collaborative learning**, for example encouraging children to work in groups and take responsibility for their own learning, are particularly important when talking about issues such as children's rights and responsibilities. It is important that **students are taught in a way that demonstrates these competencies in a practical way.**
- Whilst web-based resources can be useful, their shelf-life can be limited. **Only if a resource does not need to be regularly updated will it be appropriate for web-only use.**

4.1.3 University of Edinburgh

(i) Summary

- **A web-based resource that is easily accessible to students should provide general information about human rights and HRE. Whilst there are benefits to this being linked to CfE, it should encourage critical and independent thinking.**

(ii) Key Points Made

- The key to success in this area is the creation of a resource that is not overly burdensome for ITE providers. **Students**

therefore have to be able to use the resource to do the groundwork themselves and then come back to discuss this in class. This is achievable if, for example, the relevant materials are designed by experts in the field but are accessible and can be used easily by generic tutors.

- Some students are likely to take the idea of HRE more seriously if the relevant resource is **linked explicitly to the E&Os within CfE**.
- On the other hand, it is arguable that HRE ought to extend **beyond the curriculum and should thus be more central to teaching practice**. Students should be encouraged to be critical of materials and resources, and a resource linked explicitly to CfE tends to curtail this type of critical engagement.
- A **web-based resource has the greatest potential for incorporation into existing programmes of ITE**. This would be most beneficial if it included video clips and a bit of text with suggested questions and issues around human rights. There should be **some information about human rights and HRE more generally**, so that student teachers can readily access this information.

4.1.4 University of Glasgow

(i) Summary

- A **ready-made interdisciplinary elective on HRE should encourage critical thinking in students, but should also target institutions through increased linkage with the GTCS Standards and through guidance on how to embed human rights within ITE courses**.

(ii) Key Points Made

- The development of a relevant HRE module might strengthen the hand of ITE providers who wish to see more being done in this area. If a **ready-made elective was available, ITE providers would not need to justify the time and resources required to create a relevant programme** or elective from scratch.
- HRE could be strengthened through **increased linkage with the revised GTCS Standards for Provisional Registration**. Values play a key role in these standards, and this has filtered down into practice in areas such as learning for sustainability. HRE is now an entitlement that should be reflected in ITE and the most effective way of achieving this is by **utilising the language of the Scottish policy context**.
- It is **more important that a resource for HRE encourages critical thinking than that it is linked explicitly to CfE**.
- The creation of a glossy pack is therefore unlikely to be beneficial. It would be **more useful if a resource was constructed around course development and the embedding of human rights**.
- Such a **tool should also aim to be interdisciplinary**.

4.1.5 University of the Highlands and Islands

(i) Summary

- A **web-based resource with an international focus should provide easy access to other relevant**

existing resources. It should be easily applied in the Scottish context through, for example, linking with organisations that can provide up-to-date information for ITE programmes.

(ii) Key Points Made

- A module would not be useful or feasible for a University offering only a one-year postgraduate primary programme, as there is no space for additional modules.
- Access to **additional resources** in this area would be useful.
- It would be useful to have a resource with an **international focus but with a Scottish application**. For example, the resource should have **close connections to organisations** which can provide up-to-date information for ITE programmes.

4.1.6 University of Stirling

(i) Summary

- A **flexible web-based resource should emphasise why the teaching of human rights is important and should show how rights can become embedded in existing practices. It should enable students to engage more effectively with translating a rights-based approach into a certain form of critical thinking in relation to classroom practice and does not necessarily have to link expressly to CfE**.

(ii) Key Points Made

- The **most useful resources are those located online**, rather than in text form.
- It is equally important that the resource is functional and **enables students to get to grips with the rights themselves and why they are important, as well as how rights in turn inform their own teaching practice**.
- There is considerable focus currently in ITE on the purpose of education, though this tends to be overlooked when the students actually enter professional practice. They tend to become caught-up in existing school processes, such as lesson planning, and do not consider the deeper theoretical issues. A **resource or module that enabled students to engage more effectively with translating a rights-based approach into a certain form of critical thinking in relation to classroom practice and ideas would therefore be particularly beneficial**.
- Any improvement to HRE within ITE should therefore **address not only the design of courses but also the institutional structures themselves**. A module that **enabled ITE providers to select those aspects most relevant to their programmes** would be likely to be particularly effective in this regard.
- It is unlikely to be possible within the existing ITE structure in Scotland to have a compulsory core module on HRE, as there are so many pressures on providers to include various different elements, but it would be **possible to incorporate aspects of HRE into the existing programmes**.

- Any improvements to HRE within ITE ought therefore to **show how rights can become embedded within existing practices**, rather than simply comprising an add-on or standalone lecture.
- A **focus on educational processes and the purpose of education itself is more important than focusing upon the E&Os of CfE**. Links to CfE can be useful for highlighting gaps in practice but it has the tendency to promote plateau thinking, rather than a more radical approach to HRE ideas. Additionally, CfE will develop and change over time, so a more **general resource is likely to be of greater benefit**.
- HRE cannot, however, be too embedded within programmes of ITE, as that leaves open the possibility for students to overlook the topic completely. **If rights are not clearly signposted as a topic, the students can be wholly unaware that they are being inducted into a rights-based approach**.

4.1.7 University of Strathclyde

(i) Summary

- A **web-based resource should provide links to relevant resources and useful materials on one page and should demonstrate how teachers can link HRE to their own teaching practice. It should not be linked to CfE but should guide students more generally**.

(ii) Key Points Made

- A beneficial undertaking for HRE in ITE in Scotland generally would be an **audit of available resources**. It would be useful for students to be guided towards good relevant resources for Scottish classroom practice and in particular towards resources linked expressly to CfE.
- Rather than a resource linked expressly to the E&Os in CfE that provides direct instructions for teaching, it would be of **greater benefit to guide students more generally**. Providing students simply with a bundle of ready-made lessons can result in sloppy lesson planning and teaching. It would be useful, therefore, to provide students with **guidance on how to recognise human rights elements within existing topic areas**.
- A **website** might be a particularly beneficial way of demonstrating to student teachers **how to make the relevant links between HRE, the curriculum and their own teaching**. Teachers would also be more likely to use a website than a resource pack.
- Such a website should **provide relevant useful links to different resources on one page**, which would enable teachers to make the connections between the available information and resources and their own teaching.

4.1.8 University of the West of Scotland

(i) Summary

- A **module with a relevant resource included should identify a core of required content for the teaching of HRE and provide ideas and guidance on how this content can be used. It should highlight to teachers how to be selective when teaching in this area and how to target their teaching to the particular human rights**

issues they are likely to face in their teaching practice.

(ii) Key Points Made

- What is needed is a **core of citizenship and human rights embedded as learning experiences within existing modules**. A requirement for course validation would therefore be that the module meets global citizenship and human rights targets. A particular drawback of this approach, however, is that inclusion of the relevant topics might be patchy and tokenistic, and may result simply in a box ticking approach.
- One way in which the situation could be improved is through an **exchange of ideas amongst ITE providers**. As there are currently huge variations amongst ITE programmes, the **development of a core of required components that universities could then build upon would be particularly beneficial**.
- A **module with ideas and with guidance on how it might be used would be particularly interesting** and even more so if it had a **relevant resource included**.
- A key aspect of the module should be **highlighting to teachers how to be selective when teaching HRE**. It is more important for students to have some in-depth knowledge of those areas of human rights that they are likely to encounter in practice, such as prejudice and racism, rather than engaging in rote learning of universal rights more widely.
- A **prescriptive programme of HRE would not work**, simply because the provision of ITE is rarely independent of the university itself.
- **More explicit guidelines on HRE within the GTCS Standards** might provide the impetus for ITE providers to focus greater time and attention on HRE.

Chapter 5: Recommendations for Reform: what is needed for more consistent HRE in ITE?

5.1 Introduction

Based upon the findings from this research project, this chapter sets out recommendations for reform to HRE provision within programmes of ITE. The recommendations reflect the suggestions made by the representatives from each of the relevant Scottish universities and would therefore be likely be agreed to by the majority of ITE providers.

Whilst there is potential scope for more comprehensive reform in this area in the future, the recommendations seek to reflect what is achievable and most likely to work in the current educational landscape. The absence of central control over the provision of ITE in Scotland in particular makes any suggestion for a prescriptive core module, or similarly standardised and inflexible equivalent, unattainable at present. The recommendations should, however, be viewed as building blocks towards a more comprehensive approach to HRE provision within ITE in the future.

Implementation of the recommendations in this report would result in a core of required components for HRE that ITE providers could then build upon to suit the needs of their particular programmes. This core would provide a foundation of HRE within ITE that would not only increase the current scope and extent of HRE in ITE and classroom practice, but also would also be likely to stimulate progression and future development in this field.

The recommendations reflect advice offered by members of the Advisory Group and additionally include suggestions stemming from comparative studies of HRE in teacher education or training in other countries. A report of this comparative analysis can be found in Appendix II, but certain approaches that may be beneficial for ITE reform in Scotland (drawn from best practice in Columbia, England, Germany, Guatemala and Ireland) include:

- adopting an **outcomes based approach** to HRE, emphasising the desired practical outcomes of HRE instruction rather than providing teachers with detailed information on how to teach in this area;
- the express use of **human rights terminology** within ITE teaching programmes;
- **mainstreaming HRE within ITE** so that it is not viewed as a separate and additional discipline but integral to ITE competence;
- the use of **practical training methodologies** to assist teachers with translating human rights knowledge into a rights respecting classroom environment;
- the use of **HRE activities** to encourage learner interest and engagement with the subject;
- splitting education or training into **ideas, concepts and principles** of human rights on the one hand, and the **practical application** of these on the other;
- effective use of **cross-disciplinary and interdisciplinary methodologies**; and

- encouraging **collaborative partnerships** between NGOs, policy makers and academics in developing HRE tools for use in ITE programmes.

5.2 Recommendations

Based upon the findings from these interviews, the additional suggestions made by the Advisory Committee and upon comparative study of HRE in other countries, the Centre for Human Rights in Practice makes the following recommendations:

5.2.1 Recommendation 1

- **The inclusion of HRE within ITE should be made compulsory and this change should be reflected by amendment to the GTCS Standards. Competence in HRE should be included as an express requirement of provisional registration with the GTCS and would fit naturally within the social justice element of Learning for Sustainability.**

5.2.2 Recommendation 2

- **Given the current structure of ITE programmes within Scottish universities, the inclusion of HRE should be facilitated through the development of a flexible and non-prescriptive web-based resource that is made available to Scottish ITE providers.**

The resource should:

- encourage teachers to engage in critical thinking rather than seek to provide them with one-size-fits-all teaching materials;
- provide general information on human rights and HRE and why they are important;
- focus on practical training methodologies and advise on how human rights information can be translated into age-appropriate classroom activities;
- assist teachers in recognising human rights elements within topics and provide guidance on how to embed HRE within their existing teaching practices;
- help teachers to signpost their teaching practice relating to HRE;
- highlight where relevant links can be made to CfE;
- direct teachers towards useful existing resources on human rights and HRE;
- include relevant video clips;
- suggest issues and questions for classroom discussion;
- make recommendations for cross-disciplinary and interdisciplinary teaching to assist in the mainstreaming of HRE; and
- target human rights issues that teachers are particularly likely to face in practice.

5.2.3 Recommendation 3

- **The resource should be developed collaboratively with input from NGOs, policymakers, academics, teaching practitioners and children.**

5.2.4 Recommendation 4

- **Training on the use of the web-based resource should be offered to ITE providers to ensure that its contents are utilised to their fullest potential.**
- **This training should involve on-going engagement – through the provision of support and monitoring – between ITE providers and the trainers.**

5.2.5. Recommendation 5

- **ITE providers should continue to build upon their relationships with relevant existing networks, such as IDEAS and the Development Education Centres, in order to further expand and embed HRE and global citizenship within their programmes.**

Appendix I: HRE in ITE as Required by International Human Rights Law

Within recent years, studies into the theory and practice of ITE have become considerably more prolific.⁶¹ This increased focus on ITE is likely to stem in part from the new challenges facing teachers, including the greater complexity of professional practice, the demands of teaching a more diverse student body to higher levels of academic achievement, and issues of equality and inclusion.⁶²

It has been recognised within recent research reports that teacher education is a career-long process that does not stop when teachers gain their professional qualification. Programmes of relevant CPD and in-service training, or Career-long Professional Learning as it is now called in Scotland, allow teachers to keep abreast of new information and best practice. The aim of programmes of ITE is not, therefore, to inculcate student teachers with all the knowledge and proficiencies required for their teaching career, but rather to provide them with 'a set of high-level beginning competences'.⁶³

Since the mid-1990s, HRE has been strongly emphasised as one such area in which teachers ought to demonstrate at least basic understanding and teaching competence before entering the profession.

What are the Requirements for Human Rights Education?

The most recent comprehensive definition of HRE can be found in the UN Declaration on Human Rights Education and Training. It requires the provision of education:

- **About** human rights, which includes providing knowledge and understanding of human rights norms and principles, the values that underpin them and the mechanisms for their protection;
- **Through** human rights, which includes learning and teaching in a way that respects the rights of both educators and learners;
- **For** human rights, which includes empowering persons to enjoy and exercise their rights and to respect and uphold the rights of others.⁶⁴

This most recent definition of HRE is focused and precise in its requirements compared to a number of the more aspirational provisions that preceded it. Whilst the 1945 Charter of the United Nations made only a vague reference to promoting and encouraging respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms, three years later the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948) (UDHR) introduced the concept of HRE as a distinct and freestanding right. Article 26 of the UDHR was the first dedicated provision on HRE, asserting that:

Education shall be directed to the full development of the human personality and to the strengthening of respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms. It shall promote understanding, tolerance and friendship among all nations, racial or religious groups, and shall further the activities of the United Nations for the maintenance of peace.

The rights enshrined in the UDHR were subsequently divided and codified within two legally binding international human rights covenants that came into force in 1966. The International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR) gave

HRE greater legal weight and significance by incorporating and extending the nature and scope of the right as it had been enshrined within the UDHR. Article 13 of the ICESCR thus states that:

Education shall be directed to the full development of the human personality and the sense of its dignity, and shall strengthen the respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms. They further agree that education shall enable persons to participate effectively in a free society, promote understanding, tolerance and friendship among all nations and all racial, ethnic or religious groups, and further the activities of the United Nations for the maintenance of peace.

A number of the more specific and targeted international instruments also make reference to the right to HRE,⁶⁵ though arguably of the greatest significance to formal education is Article 29(1) of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC), which prescribes that:

States Parties agree that the education of the child shall be directed to:

- (a) the development of the child's personality, talents and mental and physical abilities to their fullest potential;*
- (b) the development of respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms, and for the principles enshrined in the Charter of the United Nations;*
- (c) the development of respect for the child's parents, his or her own cultural identity, language and values, for the national values of the country in which the child is living, the country from which he or she may originate, and for civilizations different from his or her own;*
- (d) the preparation of the child for responsible life in a free society, in the spirit of understanding, peace, tolerance, equality of sexes, and friendship among all peoples, ethnic, national and religious groups and persons of indigenous origin;*
- (e) the development of respect for the natural environment.*

When this Article is read in conjunction with Article 12 of the same instrument, which guarantees children the right to express their views freely on matters that affect them, the right to HRE enshrined within the UNCRC becomes of particular significance to formal education. It is for this reason that it is the international human rights instrument expressly referred to with the greatest frequency by teachers working in schools.⁶⁶

Whilst these international documents place considerable legal and moral pressure upon states to comply with their HRE obligations, a number of lesser-known United Nations' initiatives also influence state practice in this area. Though the sheer volume of such initiatives is considerable, it is arguable that the UN's recent work in the field of HRE has been more influential than the plethora of preceding initiatives. For this reason, only the most recent initiatives will be considered here.

The mid-1990s witnessed a concerted effort on the part of the United Nations and other relevant stakeholders to improve the situation of HRE globally. Based upon recommendations made at the influential 1993 World Conference on Human Rights in Vienna, the years 1995-2004 were proclaimed as the UN Decade for Human Rights Education.

Though the Decade itself did not specify teacher education as one of its core objectives, the training of teachers and

curriculum developers was to be given special attention, and universities and relevant institutions were to be assisted in developing human rights curricula.⁶⁷ Further advice was provided regarding the nature and content of such training in HRE:

*Courses developed under the Decade, in each case, should include a section designed to introduce a variety of effective techniques for the training of specific audiences. In particular, suggestions should be made for the use of creative, interactive teaching methods, which offer the best hope for securing the active, engaged participation of the programme participants. Such techniques may include the use of working groups, lecture-discussions, case-studies, panel discussions, round-table discussions, brainstorming sessions, simulation and role-playing, field trips, practica and the use of audio and visual aids, as culturally appropriate to the specific audience.*⁶⁸

Based upon the success of the UN Decade, the United Nations extended the initiative through the UN World Programme for Human Rights Education, which commenced in 2005 and is predicted to enter its third consecutive phase in 2015.

The first phase of the UNWPHRE, which ran until 2009, focused upon HRE within primary and secondary education, and sought to promote:

*A common understanding of principles and methodologies of HRE, provide a concrete framework for action, and strengthen cooperation between organisations and governments.*⁶⁹

This concrete framework for action took the form of a Plan of Action with five key components designed to assist states in complying with the detailed requirements of the initiative. These components related to: comprehensive state educational policies; effective implementation of those policies; rights respecting learning environments; rights-based teaching methodologies; and effective teacher training in HRE. A number of these elements included requirements for the inclusion of HRE within teacher education or training. Under the Policies section, for example, it was emphasised that states should:

Adopt a comprehensive training policy on human rights education including:

- (i) The training of trainers, the training of head teachers, pre-service and in-service training of teachers, and the training of other educational personnel;*
- (ii) Information on the rights, responsibilities and participation of students and teachers in all pre- and in-service teacher training policies and programmes;*
- (iii) Recognizing, accrediting and supporting NGOs and other sectors of civil society carrying out training activities in human rights education;*
- (iv) Considering human rights education as a criterion for the qualification, accreditation and career development of educational staff and the accreditation of training activities of non-governmental organizations.*⁷⁰

This last component of the Plan of Action, on effective teacher training, is of particular significance to the current project, with recognition that:

Given the role model function of teachers, effective human rights education implies that they master and transmit relevant

*values, knowledge, skills, attitudes and practices. Education and professional development must foster their knowledge about, commitment to and motivation for human rights.*⁷¹

The relevant UNWPHRE guidelines also require HRE to be included in the training curriculum of all primary and secondary teachers, with such training requiring, amongst other elements:

- Knowledge about human rights, their universality, indivisibility and interdependence and about protection mechanisms;
- Links between human rights education and other similar types of education (such as education for sustainable development, peace education, global education, multicultural education, citizenship and values education);
- Teachers' and students' rights and responsibilities and their participation in school life; identifying and handling human rights abuses in schools; and
- The school as a human rights-based community.

The most recent UN initiative to specifically address HRE is the UN Declaration on Human Rights Education and Training (UNDHRET) – adopted by the General Assembly at the end of 2011 – which represents the first instrument in which 'international standards for HRE...[are] officially proclaimed by the UN'.⁷² It has thus been deemed to 'surpass...existing documents due to its specific HRE focus and holistic character'.⁷³ Whilst the UN initiatives that had preceded UNDHRET had been formulated as programmes over extensive time periods, therefore lessening the sense of urgency for states in complying with their requirements, UNDHRET represented a significant progression by outlining a set of obligations upon states which ought to be immediately implemented.

Given the prevalence and increasing prominence of HRE on the world stage, it is perhaps not unreasonable to conclude that it should form a central feature of national education programmes. With its capacity to instil in learners both the desire and means to respect and defend human rights, its importance should not be underestimated. Schools in particular are viewed as the bedrock for HRE, and a number of the international instruments make specific reference to the need for HRE to be included at every stage of formal education. Many of the instruments additionally make reference to the requirement for human rights principles and practice to permeate both the formal curriculum and the 'hidden curriculum' of the classroom and school environment. For this to happen, however, a number of the relevant instruments and initiatives recognise that HRE must constitute a central feature of national teacher training or education programmes.

Footnotes

- 61 See e.g. The Teaching Council, 'Learning to Teach and its Implications for the Continuum of Teacher Education: A Nine-Country Cross-National Study' (2009); OECD 'Teachers Matter' (2005); & UNESCO, 'Education for All: The Quality Imperative' (2005).
- 62 The Teaching Council, 'Learning to Teach and its Implications for the Continuum of Teacher Education: A Nine-Country Cross-National Study' (2009) para 1.0.
- 63 Ibid at para 0.1.7.
- 64 UN General Assembly, 'United Nations Declaration on Human Rights Education and Training' (2011) (Resolution A/RES/66/137), Article 2(2) [emphasis added].
- 65 Including, for example, the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (1979), Article 10; & the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (1965), Article 7.
- 66 See for example BEMIS, 'A Review of Human Rights Education in Schools in Scotland (March 2013); & A E C Struthers, 'Human Rights Education: educating about, through and for human rights' (2014) *The International Journal of Human Rights* (available at: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/13642987.2014.986652>).
- 67 UN General Assembly, 'Human Rights Questions, Including Alternative Approaches for Improving the Effective Enjoyment of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (1996) (A/51/506/Add.1) paras 24-25.
- 68 Ibid at para 75.
- 69 Lawyers' Rights Watch Canada, 'The Right to Know Our Rights: International Law Obligations to Ensure International Human Rights Education and Training (2012) at 12.
- 70 UNESCO and OHCHR: 'Plan of Action: World Programme for Human Rights Education: First Phase' (2006) at 40.
- 71 Ibid at 4.
- 72 UN Human Rights Council, 'Joint Written Statement Submitted by CIVICUS – World Alliance for Citizen Participation et al' (2011) (A/HRC/16/NGO/116) para 5.
- 73 Comment by Dr. Peter Kirchsclaeger during Teachers Without Borders Webinar on 'UN Declaration on Human Rights Education and Training' (8 February 2012).

Appendix II: HRE within ITE in Other Countries: what can Scotland learn?

In the Final Evaluation on implementation of the UNWPHRE, the United Nations noted that the overall approach to HRE within teacher education or training is *ad hoc*, as well as 'haphazard, optional and variable in terms of quality and time, and with limited access to materials and tools'.⁷⁴ In the majority of countries that responded to the evaluation, training in HRE is elective and only a handful of countries were considered to have ITE programmes that came close to complying with the requirements of the UNWPHRE.

Certain elements of HRE within teacher training in other countries could assist with improving the provision of HRE in ITE programmes in Scotland, however. The following countries will be discussed in this regard: Bosnia & Herzegovina, Columbia, England, Germany, Guatemala, Ireland and Japan.

Bosnia and Herzegovina

Bosnia and Herzegovina has one of the most widespread and comprehensive programmes of ITE within Europe. Civic education is a compulsory curriculum subject for learners of secondary school age and the Ministry of Education therefore introduced a requirement that all teachers receive relevant training in this area. The result was the development of The Democracy and Human Rights Teacher Certification Programme, which provides teachers with **in-depth specialised training in concepts such as citizenship, democracy, human rights, and civic participation in government and society.**

The programme is divided into theoretical and practical components, with the former comprising 120 contact hours split into 12 separate modules. The **instructors on the programme represent the most prominent and distinguished local, national and international experts in the fields of democracy and human rights**, and only teachers certified through this programme are qualified to teach civic education.

Columbia

Columbia has one of the most comprehensive formal implementation programmes for HRE within ITE. Run by the National Council of the National Human Rights Education in collaboration with the UN Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights, the Education Program for the Enforcement of Human Rights is implemented within a number of ministries of education in Colombia. Its aim is to ensure that formal educational practices not only foster the exercise of human rights, but also encourage children and young people to develop citizenship skills and to be active in the school, family and community.

The **Program offers support in the training of teachers and educators at ITE level and post-qualification stages, and aims to demonstrate how the provision of knowledge about human rights can lead to a better understanding of the transformational potential of human rights within education. It utilises practical training methodologies to show teachers how they can translate this human rights knowledge into efficacious HRE in the classroom environment.** The programme ultimately aims to ensure that all teachers leaving faculties of education are equipped with the tools for incorporating HRE into their teaching.

England

Standardising the ITE curriculum in England is more problematic than in Scotland, as England permits a much greater number of routes to professional qualification and it has no General Teaching Council. Thus, instead of obtaining a qualifying degree from a HEI, teachers can elect to undertake an employment-based programme of teacher training. The rather more fragmented nature of the qualification process therefore makes the standardised introduction of thematic areas, such as HRE, more difficult. Despite the fact that the UK Government has reported to the United Nations that teachers must achieve a certain standard of HRE before qualifying as a teacher in England,⁷⁵ there is in fact no comprehensive policy in place to guarantee that student teachers obtain relevant training in HRE. Nevertheless, there are pockets of HRE activity within a number of ITE programmes across the country and some of these have been particularly successful.

The Rights, Respect, Responsibility: A Whole School Approach initiative piloted in Hampshire in 2004, for example, represents a domestic programme of HRE that involved effective teacher training practices. It endeavoured to develop with teachers ways of integrating rights into their classroom teaching and sought to facilitate empowerment and better understanding of HRE within formal education. Although the training is offered to primary schools individually, rather than as a central component of ITE generally, the structure of the training is nevertheless instructive. **One third of the training focuses on ideas, evidence, concepts and emerging principles, with the other two thirds devoted to assisting teachers with the practical application of these knowledge elements.**

A further example is Nottingham Trent University, which was one of the collaborative institutions in an initiative called INTER Guide: A Practical Guide to Implement Intercultural Education at Schools, co-ordinated by the Distance University in Spain. INTER was a targeted teacher training guide designed to assess existing educational practice and to improve deficiencies through improved intercultural education in schools. It comprised eight modules that addressed topics ranging from homogeneity and diversity at a general level to the school, home and community at a more local level.

Germany

The Working Group on Human Rights Education in Berlin has compiled a set of Standards of Human Rights Education in Schools. The Standards were drafted with the aim of encouraging HRE in schools by way of **providing a comprehensive framework that would be easily translatable into all levels of formal schooling.**

As with Curriculum for Excellence in Scotland, the Standards not only afforded teachers greater autonomy in their classroom teaching, but also focused largely upon curriculum outcomes. The **outcomes-based framework therefore does not prescribe how HRE is to be implemented within classrooms, though the Standards do define the required outcomes for each level of school** in each of the relevant teaching areas. They are furthermore considered to:

Rationalize the knowledge and skills associated with human rights education in a way comparable to other major subjects, such as mathematics and languages.

The Standards were **drafted by a coalition of NGOs, drawing upon the knowledge and experience of policymakers and academics in the field.** They therefore provide a useful example of **policy change in this area through collaboration between NGOs and educational authorities,** in place of the more common practice of NGOs being relied upon to run programmes of HRE at the coalface of formal education. A number of university departments in Germany use the Standards as a framework for educating prospective teachers in the knowledge and practices of HRE.

Guatemala

Guatemala provides a particularly interesting case study with regard to its programme of HRE within ITE. The country has a very specific national curriculum for ITE and expressly states that HRE should be incorporated within a number of relevant subject areas. It is one of the few countries that contains **explicit reference to the terms 'human rights' and 'HRE' within its programme of ITE.**

The National Curriculum Base Initial Teacher Training Level Primary Education represents the common curriculum for all ITE providers in the country. **Each training institution must therefore adopt the standardised curriculum, which includes subject areas such as:**

- Intercultural and diversity pedagogy;
- Democratic life and a culture of peace; and
- People's rights.

With the inclusion of these types of subject areas in the standardised curriculum, it is envisaged that ITE will develop ways of thinking, values and attitudes that are respectful and tolerant of all people and all cultures. It is furthermore **expressly stated within the Ministry of Education guidance that both human rights and the rights of people are relevant to all curriculum subjects.**

Within the compulsory module of Intercultural and Diversity Pedagogy, for example, **express reference is made to teachers' understanding: equality of rights; the elimination of racism and discrimination; respect for the identity and individual rights of people and social groups; and unity in diversity.** In the compulsory Social Sciences module, too, human rights is expressly designated as a learning requirement, with instruction that courses will address the main challenges faced in improving respect for human rights in Guatemala. Finally, within the compulsory module of Education Legislation, teachers are required to be able to identify relevant international human rights treaties.

Ireland

Beyond the formal statutory regulation of teaching training, Ireland represents a good example of a country in which HRE is included within ITE programmes through the work of organisations external to the central education authority.

In 2011, for example, the Centre for Human Rights and Citizenship Education in Dublin developed a designated Framework for embedding development education, inter-cultural education and HRE within ITE for primary school teachers. The development of the Framework followed research that was carried out into primary teachers' understanding of human rights and HRE. Conducted by way of detailed questionnaires, the research sought to ascertain

'the level of awareness of and attitudes towards human rights and HRE among primary teachers in Ireland, to assess the extent to which HRE is implemented in primary schools, and to identify the challenges and opportunities for HRE in the primary system'.⁷⁶

Whilst the findings did indicate that teachers had an interest in and enthusiasm for teaching HRE, they lacked the knowledge and understanding required to fully incorporate HRE into their teaching practice. Despite the fact that the majority of teachers interviewed for the study felt that they were providing HRE in their classrooms, the insufficiency of their own knowledge in this area meant that this teaching was not grounded in the correct language and terminology of human rights. Instead, HRE practices in schools merely loosely addressed human rights concerns and incorporated rights respecting approaches.⁷⁷

The Framework developed by the Centre for Human Rights and Citizenship Education therefore sought to address the gaps in teacher knowledge regarding HRE. The developers recognised that cross-disciplinary topics such as HRE are often overlooked within teacher training programmes due to the need to adequately prepare teachers across the spectrum of mandatory curriculum subjects and thus sought to ensure **'greater visibility and greater coherence across the initial teacher-education programme in relation to human rights, citizenship, inter-cultural and development education'**.⁷⁸

In the first year of study, the Framework focuses upon **student teachers' own knowledge and experience of development, inter-culturalism and human rights.** It contains both freestanding and integrated elements and is accompanied by a roadmap brochure to assist student teachers in locating knowledge, values and pedagogical approaches in each of the three dedicated subject areas. When students reach Year 3 of the training, their **personal understanding of the issues are brought together with relevant pedagogical knowledge and specific understanding of the social, cultural, political and economic context in which they will be teaching.**

Within the Compendium of Good Practice in HRE, compiled in 2009 by the Organisation for Security and Co-operation in Europe, the integration of the Framework's dedicated subject areas within ITE is identified as a rare example of an effective programme and is thus considered to have 'the potential to be a model for teacher education programmes'.⁷⁹ A number of universities in Ireland therefore now include human rights and/or citizenship within their ITE courses.⁸⁰

Japan

Japan represents an example of a country in which the provision of HRE within programs of ITE relates largely to the social circumstances of the particular geographic region. Each prefectural board of education is responsible for the training programmes provided in ITE for primary and secondary teachers,⁸¹ with the content of such programmes left to the discretion of the boards themselves.

In Western Japan, for example, courses on 'Social Integration Education' are common and thus Social Integration is compulsory for student teachers in certain areas. In Eastern Japan too, HRE is a compulsory element of ITE programmes within certain universities;⁸² and a **number of local boards of education require qualified teachers to attend human right training classes periodically.** Such training typically

involves a lecture of 2-4 hours given by board of education officers or researchers in the field of HRE. The inclusion of HRE within ITE programmes and in post-qualification practice is often in response to petitions from civil society and human rights-related social movements.⁸³

Teachers who seek to obtain licences for teaching at primary level and/or junior high school level in Japan additionally have to obtain relevant credits in 'Methods of Moral Education', as a Moral Education period is included within the National Curriculum for learners at these school levels. With the present Prime Minister placing increased emphasis upon the importance of Moral Education in schools, it is likely that there will be policies for strengthening Moral Education in the near future in Japan.

The National Centre for Teachers' Development offers a course on Training for Development of Human Rights Education Instructors, though this is merely an optional course available in Tsukuba in Eastern Japan. It does, however, operate a 'train the trainers' initiative, whereby course attendees are provided with the knowledge and skills to give training sessions in their own prefectures.

Footnotes

- 74 UN General Assembly, 'Final Evaluation of the Implementation of the First Phase of the World Programme for Human Rights Education' (2010) (A/65/322) para 62.
- 75 UN General Assembly, 'Final Evaluation of the Implementation of the First Phase of the World Programme for Human Rights Education' (2010) (A/65/322) para 56.
- 76 Waldron, F. et al, 'Teachers, Human Rights and Human Rights Education: Knowledge, Perspectives and Practices of Primary School Teachers in Ireland', Dublin: The Centre for Human Rights and Citizenship Education (2011) at 4.
- 77 Ibid at 53.
- 78 Organisation for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE) et al 'Human Rights Education in the School Systems of Europe, Central Asia and North America: A Compendium of Good Practice' (2009) at 201.
- 79 Ibid at 202.
- 80 Including, for example, the University of Ulster; see University of Ulster UNESCO Centre, Annual Report 2003:04 (2003) at 6.
- 81 Under the Local Government Employees Law and the Special Law for Local Teachers.
- 82 Tokyo Gakugei University, for example, runs a compulsory HRE course; & Yamaguchi University runs a designated course in Education for International Understanding which includes human rights as a core element.
- 83 See e.g. <http://www.hurights.or.jp>.

