

UNIVERSITY OF WARWICK

Minutes from the Meeting of the Building Committee held on 3<sup>rd</sup> December 2009

Present: Sir John Temple (Chair), Mr A Bradley, Professor A Caesar, Mr G Howells, Professor T Jones, Professor K Lamberts, Professor S Palmer, Mr A Perkins, Professor J Swan, Mr S Thomson.

Apologies: Professor R Critoph, Ms V Cooke.

In Attendance: Mr J Baldwin, Mr C Carrington, Ms R Drinkwater, Ms R Lambert, Ms R Lees, Ms L Pride, Mr P Smith, Mr M Stacey, Mr R Wilson.

01/09-10 Welcome and Introductions

REPORTED (by the Chair):

- (a) That there were four new members of the Building Committee for the academic year 2009-10: Professor Ann Caesar (Pro-Vice Chancellor), Mr Glen Howells (Lay member of Council), Mr A Bradley (President of the Students Union) and Mr A Perkins (representative from the Student Union).
- (b) That Ms Rebecca Lambert has taken over as the Assistant Secretary to the Committee.

02/09-10 Membership and Terms of Reference

RECEIVED:

The Membership and Terms of Reference of the Building Committee and its Sub-Committees for the Academic Year 2009/10, (paper BC.1/09-10) noting that the terms of reference for the Building Committee were being considered as part of the overall review of Governance being undertaken by the University, the results of which would be considered at the Spring meetings of Senate and Council.

03/09-10 Minutes

CONSIDERED:

The minutes of the meeting held on 16<sup>th</sup> June 2009.

RESOLVED:

That the minutes be approved.

04/09-10 Matters Arising

- (a) Alison Backhouse (minute 27/08-09 refers)

REPORTED (by the Chair):

That a letter of thanks had been sent to Ms Alison Backhouse, previous Assistant Secretary to the Building Committee, wishing her well in her new post and thanking her for her contribution to the Committee.

- (b) TM2 Building (minute 29-08-09 refers)

REPORTED (by the Chair):

That the contract with Advantage West Midlands in relation to the TM2 Project had now been signed.

- (c) The Warwick Business School Phase 3b development (minute 29a(ii)/08-09 refers)

REPORTED:

That the Finance and General Purposes Committee, at its meeting on 23 June 2009, resolved that WBS Phase 3b development project be postponed.

- (d) Bluebell Views Residences (minute 29a(iii)/08-09 refers)

REPORTED:

That a further £450k of funding for the Bluebell Residences project had been approved by the Finance and General Purposes Committee.

- (e) Milburn House Extension Phase 5 (minute 29b/08-09 refers)

REPORTED:

That the proposal to build a fifth extension to Milburn House to provide accommodation for Professor O'Connor had been approved, noting that an update on the project was considered under minute 15/09-10.

- (f) S106 Agreement (minute 30b/08-09 refers)

REPORTED:

That the S106 Agreement had been approved by Coventry City Council, Warwick District Council and Warwickshire County Council.

05/09-10 Reports from the Sub-Committees of the Building Committee

- (a) Environment and Amenities Committee

CONSIDERED:

- (i) A report from the meeting of the Environment and Amenities Committee held on 20<sup>th</sup> October 2009, paper BC.2/09-10.
- (ii) The revised University Environmental Policy, paper BC.3a/09-10 and Terms of Reference for the Environment and Amenities Committee, paper BC3b/09-10.

RESOLVED:

- (iii) That the report be approved.
- (iv) That the Terms of Reference and Membership for the Committee be approved, subject to a minor amendment;

RECOMMENDED (to the Council):

- (v) That the Environment Policy be approved.

(b) Capital Planning and Accommodation Review Group

CONSIDERED:

A report from the meeting of the Capital Planning and Accommodation Review Group held on 14<sup>th</sup> October 2009, paper BC.4/09-10.

REPORTED (by Ms R Lees):

That, in the light of the HEFCE's proposal to link performance against carbon management to capital allocation, the Capital Planning and Accommodation Review Group would be taking steps to increase the utilisation of space across the University, noting that at the next meeting of the Group a proposal to increase the number of centrally timetabled rooms on campus will be considered.

RESOLVED:

That the content of the report be noted.

(c) Estates Management Committee

RECEIVED:

An oral report from the Director of Estates regarding key issues considered by the Estates Management Committee at its most recent meetings, noting that:

- (i) A framework for the management of contractors had been considered by the Committee, alongside the harmonisation of Estates staff terms and conditions;
- (ii) The Committee was investigating ways in which carbon use could be reduced across the University, it being noted that the University was currently second worst in the Russell Group for carbon use and fourth worst in the sector overall.

06/09-10 Building Plans

CONSIDERED:

Building plans for:

- (a) The TM2 project;
- (b) Proposed refurbishment to the Radcliffe Teaching Centre.

REPORTED (by the Director of Estates):

- (c) That, in relation to the TM2 building:
  - (i) A planning submission was required for the building (to house the imaging suite for the Marie Curie research group) within the week to ensure the project would be eligible for Advantage West Midlands funding, it being noted that the current plans were a work-in-progress and could be substituted at a later stage in the project;
  - (ii) Discussions were ongoing in relation to the look of the service entrance to the building, it being noted that this elevation would be visible from the road;
  - (iii) The car park capacity available at Gibbet Hill was deemed sufficient to deal with the anticipated additional requirements of the building;
  - (iv) There was potential for a further 1000sqm extension to the Gibbet Hill site before site capacity would be reached
- (d) That, in relation to the Radcliffe Teaching Centre:
  - (i) That building plans for the project were a work-in-progress, however the Committee were asked to approve in principle the project, it being noted that the timescales for the project would not permit the Committee further opportunity for discussion on the project;
  - (ii) The funding that had been earmarked for the Warwick Business School phase 3B car park would be used to fund the proposed work to the Radcliffe Teaching Centre;
  - (iii) The project was predominantly to refurbish the lecture theatres in the Radcliffe Teaching Centre and provide dedicated space for doctoral candidates, and therefore the work was mostly internal to the building.

RESOLVED:

- (e) That the plans for TM2 building be approved;
- (f) That PDFs copies of the TM2 plans be circulated to members, to include a composition plan showing the new building *in-situ*;

- (g) That the plans for the Radcliffe Teaching Centre be approved.

RECEIVED:

The latest building plans for the following projects (noting that these projects have previously been approved by the Committee):

- (h) Coventry House Forecourt Landscaping, noting that the plans had been downscaled from the original proposal;
- (i) Phase 5 extension to Milburn House, noting that the extension was due for completion in March 2010, and that options for phase 6 were currently being considered;
- (j) Costa Franchise extension to Rootes Building.

07/09-10 Estates Key Performance Indicators

RECIEVED:

A paper detailing the status of the Estates Key Performance Indicator as reported to Council on 27<sup>th</sup> November, paper BC.6/09-10, noting that the paper was part of a larger report outlining the performance of the University across a range of KPIs.

REPORTED (by the Director of Estates):

- (a) That the University's estate was reported as being 51% larger than predicted using the HEFCE Space Management Group (SMG) model however its income was low for its size in comparison to the sector;
- (b) That the University had a high NIA per student FTE in comparison with the rest of the sector, it being noted however that an indication of density per square metre would be a useful supplementary PI;
- (c) That Capacity/Usable Space had been assigned a red value of 'problematic', it being noted however that there was little that the Committee could do to impact the performance of this measure;
- (d) That the Development and Advancement KPI had been assigned an amber value of 'mixed', however it was likely that this was, in reality, the measure the University performs least well in when considered in a broader context.

08/09-10 Estates Management Statistics

CONSIDERED:

An executive summary and detailed report providing analysis of the University's performance in the latest Estates Management Statistics (period to July 31<sup>st</sup> 2008), papers BC.7/09-10 PART 1 and BC.7/09-10 PART 2.

REPORTED (by the Director of Estates)

- (a) The key issues of note identified in the report showed that:
  - (i) The University was generously provided for in terms of space for students and staff;
  - (ii) The University had a high NIA of office space per staff FTE, it being noted however that this could be distorted by the amount of specialist space allocated to staff;
  - (iii) The University was at the top end of the sector in terms of the quality of its estate, with 83% of the University's space in 'good' condition, noting that it would cost approximately £30m to bring all University buildings to 'good' condition;
  - (iv) The University had improved its recycled waste proportion by 400%.
- (b) That there were difficulties in benchmarking the University against other institutions as it was unclear whether consistent space reporting measures are applied across the sector; furthermore the inclusion of HRI and the Arts Centre in the University's space return distorted the University's performance against competitors.

RESOLVED:

- (c) That the Committee consider at its next meeting a paper from the Director of Estates outlining proposals for an energy charging system for departments.

09/09-10 Estates Strategy

REPORTED:

That, following the approval of the S106 agreement, outline planning permission for the Estates Master Plan had now been issued by Coventry City Council and Warwick District Council.

CONSIDERED:

An executive summary of the Estates Strategy (paper BC.5/09-10), outlining potential changes to the document and the recommendation to circulate the current document to Council and, subject to approval, issue to the HEFCE.

REPORTED (by the President of the Student's Union):

That the Students Union was keen that the University consider building additional student accommodation aimed at the lower rental cost market, it being noted that the new Bluebell residences would have large, en-suite accommodation which would attract a high rent and therefore would not be appropriate for many students at the University.

RESOLVED:

- (a) That the changes to the Strategy document outlined in paper BC.5/09-10 be approved.

RECOMMENDED (to Council)

- (b) That the current Strategy document be approved and circulated to the HEFCE.

RECEIVED:

- (c) An oral report for the Director of Estates outlining recommendations for standards against which the Estates maintenance can be benchmarked, noting that Internal Audit were keen for an agreed target to be set for the percentage of buildings in 'good' condition across campus together with the resulting backlog maintenance value, as a means to mitigate the Contingent Liability of the estate.

RESOLVED:

- (d) That the benchmark for the percentage of University buildings in 'good' condition be set at 85%, pending further consideration of the issue at the next meeting of the Committee.

10/09-10 Life Sciences

CONSIDERED:

A paper detailing proposals from the Life Sciences Advisory Group and feedback from staff, students, Trades Unions and external stakeholders regarding the implementation of the School of Life Sciences, noting that the paper consisted of 3 parts:

- (a) A covering paper (noting that Part 3 had not been circulated), (paper S.7/09-10);
- (b) PART 1: The Life Sciences Advisory Group Paper on implementation (paper S.7/09-10 PART 1);
- (c) PART 2: Summary of the themes arising from the consultation on the Life Sciences Advisory Group Paper with a brief comment from the Group after each section, (paper S.7/09-10 PART 2).

REPORTED (by the Interim Head of Life Sciences):

- (d) That at its meeting on 17<sup>th</sup> November, Senate considered the recommendations of the Life Sciences Review Group and approved the continuation of the merger of the Department of Biological Sciences and Warwick HRI during the current academic year, with the School of Life Sciences becoming a formal School of the University from October 2010;

- (e) That proposals for the Wellesborne site were currently being considered, including the potential for medium-to-long term funding for the site from DEFRA;
- (f) That the School would likely be located at the Gibbet Hill site in the first instance, it being noted however that, with the expected continued extension of Warwick Medical School, the site would not be able to contain both departments indefinitely, and therefore alternative long-term accommodation options needed to be considered.

RESOVLED:

That the Building Committee be kept updated on space-related developments in relation to the Life Sciences project.

11/09-10 Library Road (minute 30a/08-09 refers)

CONSIDERED:

An option appraisal on the use of Library Road as a bus terminus, paper BC.8/09-10.

RECEIVED:

A presentation from Mr P Smith (ARUP Ltd.) to outline the key conclusions from the option appraisal on use of Library Road as a bus terminus.

REPORTED:

- (a) That there were several advantages to locating the bus terminus on Library Road, namely that it was not a congested area (traffic-wise), that the road is concurrent with the central spine of the campus, and offers a route which would minimise the mileage required by the route;
- (b) There were very few alternative viable options for location of the terminus, and that the route formed a key component of the University's development Masterplan
- (c) That the aim was to equip the University with a first class public transport system commensurate with the standard of the University, the first phase of which would be to link the University directly with Coventry train station, noting that the timescale for the project was c. 2014-15;
- (d) That it would cost c. £140k to resolve the issue of sensitive academic equipment being affected by buses stopping on Library Road, noting that the cost would increase should the number of rooms holding such equipment increase in the future (there are currently seven rooms affected).

REPORTED (by the Pro-Vice-Chancellor (Student Experience))

That Library Road was highly congested with pedestrian traffic, and the location of a bus terminus at this location would have a detrimental impact on the campus.

REPORTED (by the Chair):

That the location of the terminus at Library Road, whilst perhaps ideal from a transport perspective, was not the ideal solution and therefore further consideration should be given to possible alternatives.

RESOLVED:

- (e) That additional options for the bus terminus be submitted for consideration at the next meeting of the Committee.

12/09-10 HEFCE 27/2009: Carbon Targets

CONSIDERED:

The recent HEFCE document entitled 'Consultation on a carbon reduction target and strategy for higher education in England' (paper BC.9/09-10), together with the University's response and a report outlining the implications for Warwick (papers SC.32/09-10 and SC.11/09-10) noting in particular that:

- (a) The Secretary of State has asked the HEFCE to establish a link between performance against carbon plans (in effect carbon reduction) and capital allocations for 2011-12 onwards;
- (b) The Higher Education sector is expected to reduce its carbon emissions by 80% against 1990 levels by 2050;
- (c) That HEFCE was obliged under the conditions of the 2008 grant letter from the Secretary of State to link future capital funding allocations with performance against carbon plans.

REPORTED:

That an entry on carbon management had been entered into the University Risk Register.

REPORTED (by the Director of Estates):

That there were potentially very significant issues for the design and maintenance of the University estate in relation to the carbon management proposals, for both new and existing buildings. Given the likely impact of the HEFCE plans on the University, consideration should be given to passing ownership of carbon reduction onto departments, with incentives available for improved performance in carbon management, it being noted that energy use would have to be linked to department specific equipment, rather than the space occupied by a department, to account for the differing levels of energy efficiency among University buildings.

RESOLVED:

That thought be given to the impact of the HEFCE statement on the Estates Strategy, with a paper summarising the impact being brought to the Committee in due course.

13/09-10 Energy Report 2008/09

CONSIDERED:

- (a) An executive summary of the University's Energy Report for 2008-09, paper BC.10/09-10, noting that the report consists of 2 parts:
  - (i) Part 1: Energy Report 2008-09;
  - (i) Part 2: Outlook on Future Energy Costs.

RESOLVED:

- (b) That the Committee was supportive of the need to ensure highest level support for an energy conservation cultural change programme and approved in principle, pending further detailed consideration of the proposals at the next meeting of the Committee, the recommendations that:
  - (i) The University increase its contribution to the ring fenced energy saving fund;
  - (ii) A transparent process be implemented to devolve utilities' budgets and invoice departments for utilities consumption;
  - (ii) There was a need for the University to further investigate Flexible contracting for the purchase of utilities

14/09-10 Maintenance Report 2009/10

CONSIDERED:

The Estates Maintenance Report 2009/10, paper BC.11/09-10, noting that the report consisted of 5 parts:

- (a) Part 1: A summary report on maintenance expenditure;
- (b) Part 2: The current year's (2009-10) amended non residential major maintenance plan;
- (c) Part 3: Residential Services Major Maintenance Plan 2010-11;
- (d) Part 4: WHRI proposed five year major maintenance plan from 2009-10;
- (e) Part 5: Estates Office Risk Register.

REPORTED (by the Head of Estates Services):

That the University's estate was in good condition overall, however it was important that the University ensured that the maintenance backlog be addressed as soon as possible to insure the infrastructure of the campus against deterioration.

REPORTED (by the Chair):

That it was paramount that the University's maintenance budget be maintained, in particular it was key that appropriate financial planning for the long-term maintenance of new buildings was undertaken.

REPORTED (by the Director of Finance):

That in due course the University would need to appropriately balance its new build programme against the maintenance of the existing estate.

RESOVLED:

- (f) That revised plans for the current year be approved, noting that should additional funding be made available the Committee also approved the proposal that the additional works noted in the report be reintroduced;
- (g) That the proposal that virements within the Major Maintenance budget, up to a value of £100k, be made on the authority of the Estates Office Senior Management Team be approved;
- (h) That the impact on the maintenance budget of the target provisionally set in minute 9g/09-10 above be considered by the Estates team and incorporated into the maintenance backlog figures to be produced for consideration by the Committee at its June meeting;
- (i) That the Committee note the existing (unfunded) five year major maintenance plan for WHRI and await the outcome of the Life Science review before considering a revised major maintenance plan;
- (j) That the risk identified on the University risk register that there was insufficient space to carry out the University strategy be revised in the light of the space metrics reported in minute 8/09-10 above;
- (k) That the Committee would consider a paper by the Director of Estates detailing the issues in relation to the introduction of departmental energy charging as a means to address the risk, noted in paper BC.11/09-10 (Part 5), that the University's CO2 emission targets might not be met (see minute 8c/09-10 above).

15/09-10 Capital Projects Report 2009/10

CONSIDERED:

The Capital Projects Report 2009-10 detailing progress on major capital projects and associated issues with programme delivery, paper BC.12/09-10.

REPORTED (by the Head of Estates Projects):

- (a) Tender prices were expected to continue to fall until the end of 2010, and that during this period it would be economically advantageous for the University to procure tenders for building projects, it being noted that due diligence would be undertaken to ensure that the University was protected against contractor insolvency;
- (b) That the University had an open tendering process and as such it was at minimal risk to the anti-competitive bid-rigging identified by the Office of Fair Trading;
- (c) That the plans for the TM2 building had been previously considered under minute 6(a)/09-10 above.

RESOLVED:

- (d) That the content of the report be noted.

16/09-10 Finance Report

CONSIDERED:

The Estates Office finance report, paper BC.13/09-10.

RESOLVED:

That the Finance Report be approved.

17/09-10 Penny Thurston

REPORTED (by the Chair):

That Penny Thurston, Estates Office Finance Officer, was retiring at the end of the year. The Committee expressed its thanks to Penny for her support over the last three years.

18/09-10 Students Union Signage

RECEIVED (from Mr A Perkins):

Signage plans for the Students Union building.

RESOLVED:

That PDF copies of the proposed signage be circulated to the Committee for information.

19/08-09 Date of the Next Meeting

REPORTED:

That the next meeting of the Committee would take place on Thursday 11 March 2010 at 2.15pm in the Council Chamber, University House.