

Allerston, P

Consuming Problems: worldly goods in Renaissance Venice

pp. 11-46

O'Malley, M, (2010) *The material renaissance*, pbk, Manchester: Manchester University Press

Staff and students of University of Warwick are reminded that copyright subsists in this extract and the work from which it was taken. This Digital Copy has been made under the terms of a CLA licence which allows you to:

- access and download a copy;
- print out a copy;

Please note that this material is for use ONLY by students registered on the course of study as stated in the section below. All other staff and students are only entitled to browse the material and should not download and/or print out a copy.

This Digital Copy and any digital or printed copy supplied to or made by you under the terms of this Licence are for use in connection with this Course of Study. You may retain such copies after the end of the course, but strictly for your own personal use.

All copies (including electronic copies) shall include this Copyright Notice and shall be destroyed and/or deleted if and when required by University of Warwick.

Except as provided for by copyright law, no further copying, storage or distribution (including by e-mail) is permitted without the consent of the copyright holder.

The author (which term includes artists and other visual creators) has moral rights in the work and neither staff nor students may cause, or permit, the distortion, mutilation or other modification of the work, or any other derogatory treatment of it, which would be prejudicial to the honour or reputation of the author.

Course of Study: HI3G9 - Venice in the Renaissance

Title: *The material renaissance*

Name of Author: O'Malley, M

Name of Publisher: Manchester University Press

1 ✧ Consuming problems: worldly goods in Renaissance Venice

Patricia Allerston

THE ONSET OF CONSUMERISM has proved to be a compelling theme in historical studies of consumption because consumerism – typically equated with a compelling desire to amass non-essential material goods – is generally understood to be a defining characteristic of modern Western society.¹ By investigating this so-called ‘revolution’ in consumer behaviour, historians have highlighted the transition from a traditional society to a modern one. While much of their discussion has centred on the eighteenth century, such consumerism has also been identified as the driving force of Renaissance cultural development. Indeed, Randolph Starn has noted that ‘By some recent accounts, Renaissance culture was the product of what amounted to an extended shopping spree.’²

Although dating the development of such consumerism presents an interesting historical problem, we should be wary of imposing the concept too readily upon the distant past.³ The Renaissance is well known for being a notoriously problematical historical phenomenon. Given that it is no longer taken for granted that it represents the beginning of modernity, we cannot presuppose that consumerism, as defined above, was likely to have been one of its intrinsic features.⁴ Attitudes towards consumption in both the past and the present are particularly hard to encapsulate for they incorporate a variety of contradictory elements, differ from individual to individual, and are constantly evolving. Whereas careful adaptation of the methods used in other academic disciplines can help us to approach this elusive subject, significant problems face those who seek to understand consumption in the remote past.⁵ Not only are such analyses ultimately dependent upon the existence of appropriate evidence, but we also encounter systems of belief and structural realities quite different from our own.⁶ However, although unequivocal evidence relating to consumer behaviour in Renaissance Italy is extremely uneven, there is great value in attempting to locate consumption within this specific historical context. Such an exercise reveals that the notion of consumerism, in the sense in

which it has usually been deployed by historians, may not be entirely appropriate.

This first chapter highlights the existence of various sets of ideas linked to the acquisition and use of material goods in the Italian peninsula, and relates some of those to the city of Venice and its inhabitants during a period of economic and demographic expansion (*c.*1450–*c.*1650). During this period, which has also been called the ‘long’ or ‘extended’ sixteenth century, Venice was crammed with both people and things.⁷ Best known as a focus of international trade and manufacturing, it was the capital of an extensive state incorporating diverse territories and cities, many of which had developed economies of their own.⁸ At that time the city of Venice was an emporium in every sense of the word since it was still a major retailing centre as well as a hub of wholesale trade, and numerous sources demonstrate its potential as a site for major ‘shopping sprees.’⁹ The letters written by Albrecht Dürer to Willibald Pirckheimer during his second visit to the metropolis in 1506, for instance, reveal the kaleidoscopic range of objects which his patron expected Dürer to find for him: pearls and gemstones, rugs, history paintings, enamels, paper, cranes’ and swans’ feathers, as well as newly published Greek texts.¹⁰ While in Venice, Dürer also procured a set of clothes and a length of woollen cloth for himself.¹¹ A remarkably wide range of Venetian inhabitants were able to acquire similar goods during the ‘long’ sixteenth century, although like Dürer they too were often strapped for cash. This is because items such as clothes, household furnishings, books, jewellery and various other types of precious objects circulated by many means, not simply through the exchange of cash for new manufactures. They could be purchased over or under the shop counter, old and new, or be obtained in lieu of payment, by default as well as design. They might also be bought at public auctions. Moveable goods could also be rented, borrowed, received as gifts or stolen.¹² Dürer was certainly not unusual in being paid three rings for three small paintings while in Venice. This was a normal trading practice in that city as elsewhere, and it suggests that the ways in which Venetians of the time acquired and deployed moveable goods were often very different from our own.¹³ This is not to exclude them from consideration as consumers as we understand the term today, but rather to suggest that we need to consider very carefully what their consumption may have meant to them.¹⁴

Although we are beginning to appreciate that consumer behaviour in the Italian peninsula during the period *c.*1450–*c.*1650 was shaped by ideas as well as by material considerations, the co-existence of diverse bodies of thought about the acquisition and use of goods at that time has still received insufficient attention.¹⁵ The complicated ideological background against which consumption took place in the period needs to be investigated before

we can discuss the relationship which contemporaries had with the material world around them.¹⁶ This chapter, therefore, highlights three inter-related sets of ideas which were current during the period in question relating to the acquisition and use of goods. These can be loosely categorized as intellectual, religious and socio-political. Unlike Goldthwaite or Starn, this chapter dwells on the negative views of the activities since they have been surprisingly neglected in existing historical analyses of consumption in the Italian peninsula.¹⁷ It also draws attention to ambiguities within those bodies of thought. Each of these issues represents a substantial historical topic in its own right and commands an extensive specialist literature; the discussion which follows is therefore necessarily schematic.

While some of the ideas which formed the background to consumption during the 'long' sixteenth century may appear familiar to modern observers, others are more historically specific. Certain types of decorative artefacts, for example, are thought to have appealed to the upper echelons of Italian Renaissance society because they offered a useful means of relaying edifying concepts from classical antiquity, providing a moral and intellectual engagement with the ancient past typical of Italian Renaissance culture as it has been traditionally defined.¹⁸ The banquet plate designs of Giulio Romano examined by Valerie Taylor in chapter 8 strikingly embody this trend. While its effect on consumer behaviour among the social elite has only become the subject of detailed study, this phenomenon has already been labelled 'Renaissance chic' by a well-known historian.¹⁹ An association with classical thought can be seen as benefiting such privileged groups of consumers in particular ways. For example, displaying a glass goblet which bore the words 'Love requires faith', in about 1500, might have served to highlight the discerning nature of its Venetian owners. Its aphorism, believed to be an ancient saying, communicated intellectual credibility and an awareness of the importance of moral improvement, and the goblet itself also revealed an appreciation of ancient technology (Figure 2).²⁰

The ancient sources and concepts which were rediscovered during the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries were an eclectic assemblage and had the potential to affect contemporary thinking in a variety of ways.²¹ In short, as well as taking educated Italians closer to goods, the study of such ideas could also place conceptual obstacles in the path of the same consumers.²² For example, the arcane corpus of Platonic and Neo-Platonic ideas, as reinterpreted in various parts of the Italian peninsula by fifteenth-century scholars such as Pier Candido Decembrio, Cardinal Bessarion and Marsilio Ficino, was as much a part of the 'broad church' that was Renaissance intellectual culture as were those of Cicero and Aristotle.²³ And if an awareness of Neo-Platonic notions of beauty can be seen as fostering a taste for decorative objects such as mirrors, then it is also conceivable that knowledge of



2 Giovanni Maria Obizzo, goblet with roundels, c.1490–1510.



the Platonic ideal of communal ownership of property, not to mention of Platonic concerns about luxury, could have produced a more ambivalent effect.²⁴ The Platonic ideal of communal ownership prompted intense debate among fifteenth-century intellectuals and also proved to be influential among the sixteenth-century and early seventeenth-century thinkers who, like Plato himself, envisioned perfect societies founded on such ideals. In the utopian city created by the literary adventurer Anton Francesco Doni while living in Venice in 1553, for instance: 'Everything was in common, and the peasants dressed like those in the city, because everyone carried away the reward of his labor and took what he needed.'²⁵ The inclusion of the ideal of communal ownership, in a populist publication of this kind, suggests that this notion was expected to strike a chord with a broad lay readership.²⁶ Indeed, it fits in both with a strand of socio-political criticism and with a strand of radical religious egalitarianism, which were articulated by certain groups of Venetian inhabitants in the early to mid-sixteenth century.²⁷ Distancing oneself from material concerns was also an important tenet within the eclectic body of Stoic ideas, one of a number of other ancient schools of thought which, like Platonism, continued to influence intellectuals throughout the 'long' sixteenth century.²⁸

Although it does not provide all the answers, sensitivity to the co-existence of ambivalent ideas about the acquisition and ownership of goods within Renaissance intellectual circles can help us to understand why educated consumers might have striven to appear disinterested in extravagant displays of their material wealth.²⁹ While Renaissance Venice has not traditionally been seen as a centre in which ancient thought was generally appreciated, this impression is steadily being revised.³⁰ Knowledge of the Venetians' familiarity with classical and classicizing artefacts sheds a very different light on this subject, suggesting that they might have preferred to engage with antique ideas through tangible objects rather than with written texts.³¹ Their consumption patterns, as evidenced by the collection of antiquities associated with Venetian patricians such as the Grimani family and Gabriel Vendramin, reflect this.³² However, the acquisition of copies of antiquities and of new artefacts made in classical styles – such as those owned by the non-patrician collector Andrea Odoni – was probably more common within the higher strata of Venetian society.³³ Such *all'antica* objects were produced and traded in Venice throughout much of the 'extended' sixteenth century, and the inscribed glass goblet mentioned above, which depicts a well-to-do Venetian couple as well as bearing the classicizing motto about love, is a pertinent example (Figure 2).³⁴

Just as Virgil's poetry apparently appealed beyond the social and intellectual elite of Venice, so too, it would seem, did the demand for what Isabella Palumbo-Fossati has called 'concrete and visible evidence of the

mythical classical world'.³⁵ At least, that is the impression given in the latter part of the period, when portraits of ancient emperors were recorded on the walls of the house of a painter of miniatures, when a marbled wooden chest and a painting (of the Madonna) with gilded columns 'in the antique style', furnished the home of a lead founder, and when the goods sold at a debtors' auction included books on architecture by Palladio and Alberti belonging to a carpenter and a small *all'antica* turquoise set in gold owned by a smith.³⁶ This impression contradicts the image given by the Venetian playwright Carlo Goldoni in his mid-eighteenth-century comedy *La famiglia dell'antiquario*. In this play, an appreciation of the antique is presented as the preserve of the nobility; moreover, the incomprehensibility of this expensive pastime (to a Venetian merchant as well as a nobleman's household servant) is central to the plot.³⁷ Yet in sixteenth-century Venice, skilled artisans such as lead founders, carpenters and smiths made the many different types of 'chic' classicizing objects sold in the city, and in so doing they would have had to engage, at least to a certain degree, with the abstract concepts that these products were supposed to express.³⁸ Such familiarity with classically informed artefacts has indeed been seen as providing craftsmen with an opportunity to boost their status in the 'extended' sixteenth century.³⁹ This interpretation is supported by numerous examples: for instance, by the well-documented Venetian-based wood engraver Andrea Fosco, who not only owned such objects, but also was depicted on a portrait medal handling a piece of ancient sculpture.⁴⁰

The variety of meanings which classicizing artefacts could embody in this period, however, supports the idea that, like their social superiors, such artisans might have had a more complicated relationship with 'Renaissance chic' than this rather reductive term suggests.⁴¹ A rare insight into the range of associations which such antiquarian objects might have had for a Venetian artisan is, for example, elucidated by the will drawn up by Lorenzo Lotto while he was in his native city in 1546.⁴² In this document, which he wrote himself, Lotto described an antique engraved cornelian set in a gold ring which was one of a number of intaglio gems in his possession. Like the blacksmith owner of the *all'antica* turquoise mentioned above, Lotto used gems to manage his debts. He also used them to seal his letters to influential patrons.⁴³ He explained that the cornelian's motif (of a crane taking off with a yoke at its feet and the sign of Mercury in its beak) 'represented the active and contemplative lives', and that 'through spiritual meditation' it was possible 'to rise above earthly things'.⁴⁴ This description demonstrates Lotto's familiarity with the arcane worlds of classical scholarship, as well as his ability to use material objects to evoke those worlds.⁴⁵ Yet his concern to signal this engagement with the realm of ideas, by means of an engraved gem which he possessed, cannot simply be attributed to a desire

to demonstrate his intellectual credentials or social pretensions. Lotto's symbolic gem can be seen as serving another and, in contemporary terms, fundamentally important mnemonic purpose; it was a physical memento of the path to religious salvation.⁴⁶

In this respect, as Stephen D. Bowd and J. Donald Cullington have noted, the 'contempt for the world and for worldliness in a civic setting did not disappear or diminish during the Renaissance'.⁴⁷ Material possessions were a key focus of this *contemptus mundi*, and their problematical associations were also far from forgotten during the 'long' sixteenth century. Indeed, the powerful traditional belief that material objects were part of this world and thus ultimately ephemeral was a constant during the sixteenth century. For the pious this meant that, in imitation of Christ, they were to focus instead on spiritual eternity.⁴⁸ The view was shared by the various observant movements, itinerant preachers, religious prophesiers, new religious orders, charismatic figureheads, evangelical artisans and classically educated Christian humanists, who galvanized spiritual life at many levels of society during the devastating era of the Italian Wars (1494–1559).⁴⁹ Such religious fervour – of which Girolamo Savonarola is only the most famous exponent – is now taken more seriously by historians of the Italian Renaissance, and we are also starting to appreciate that this dynamic force continued to shape opinion among many different social groups.⁵⁰ Indeed, the desire to renovate society by returning to a simpler form of Christian behaviour, which underpinned these spiritual phenomena, can be seen as part of a long trend in Catholic reform which started well before the Council of Trent (1545–63).⁵¹ Viewed within this longer perspective, for example, the convent reforms highlighting the sinful connotations of possessions and of possessiveness towards material goods, which were undertaken by Tridentine reformers in Venice as elsewhere during the late 1500s, do not appear unusual.⁵² Such religious concerns had provoked similar criticisms, as well as similar institutional responses, on a number of occasions in early sixteenth-century Venice. For example, during the crisis prompted by the League of Cambrai (1508–17) a specific magistracy was formed to regulate ostentatious displays of material effects by the city's inhabitants.⁵³ Concerns about the problems posed by such effects were also central to the pre-Tridentine reform programme which the Venetian patrician Vincenzo Querini, who left his native city during the height of the League of Cambrai crisis for a more spiritual environment, devised for the Church as a whole.⁵⁴ Knowledge of the persistent appeal of the ideal of religious poverty can also help to explain the zealously devout circle associated with the Venetian religious reformer Girolamo Miani in the late 1520s and the 1530s. This group's close identification with the city's beggars during the subsistence crisis of the late 1520s even extended to the fervent imitation of their threadbare clothing.⁵⁵

n fu uilio mai
che com pene e guai.

Chi sprezza il Mondo e le sue cose fra le
Per gir al sommo Ciel glie dato l'Ale.

PROVERBII



3 Niccolo Nelli, 'Chi sprezza il mondo e le sue cose fra le, Per gir al sommo ciel glie dato l'Ale' in *Proverbii*, Venice, 1564.

As Lotto's interpretation of his intaglio gem reveals, the high, pagan worlds of classical scholarship could be compatible with this persisting religious *contemptus mundi*. Indeed, the Christian humanist Desiderius Erasmus, who, like Dürer, was in Venice during the turbulent first decade of the sixteenth century, applied the Platonic allegory of the cave to the things of the physical world, describing them as 'mere shadows of reality'.⁵⁶ It is tempting to suggest, on the basis of an illustrated proverb published in Venice in 1564, that such spiritual concerns were also compatible with less recondite spheres of lay belief in the sixteenth century (Figure 3). The text of this proverb translates as: 'Who disregards the world and its things within it, is given wings to go to the top of the heavens.'⁵⁷ Knowledge of the continuing importance of such ideas throughout society helps us to understand why,

for example, in his will of 1579, a relatively well-off Venetian shopkeeper called Zuane sought to be buried with 'his dear Capuchin fathers', dressed in their humble attire.⁵⁸ The long-standing symbolic practice of being buried in such 'virtuous' mendicant garb was one of the distinctive features of Venetian Catholic ritual which the English traveller Thomas Coryate chose to recount to his countrymen in the early seventeenth century.⁵⁹ While overt demonstrations of piety of this nature might no longer have been standard during the 'extended' sixteenth century (and were thus, as Sharon Strocchia has noted, all the more striking as a result), the spiritual ideal which inspired them continued to be upheld.⁶⁰ For instance, in the well-ordered world of dress which Cesare Vecellio constructed at the end of the



4 Cesare Vecellio, 'Donne di Venetia attempate & dismesse', in *Habiti antichi et moderni di tutto il mondo* di Cesare Vecellio di nuovo accresciuti di molte figure, Venice, 1598, fol. 104.

1500s, married Venetian women of 'a certain age' dressed in accordance with their distance 'from the vanities of the world', and gave 'themselves to the spiritual life' (Figure 4).⁶¹ In these examples, as with Lotto's cornelian and the worn-out garb affected by the Venetian patrician Girolamo Miani and his circle earlier in the century, material goods paradoxically served the useful religious function of signalling their owners' pious asceticism. While this strategic deployment of material objects sits rather uneasily with the fact that those objects were part of the physical world which devout Christians were meant to spurn, such inconsistencies were an integral part of the complicated ideological background against which consumption took place during the period.⁶²

Within traditional religious thought, the things of the physical world were not problematic simply because they discouraged people from reaching 'forward to the heavenly kingdom'; they could also act upon people and direct them to a much less desirable end – hell.⁶³ As Valerie Taylor demonstrates in her essay on Giulio Romano's silverware designs (chapter 8), the ways in which material artefacts played upon the senses were, like their classical associations, an important part of their attraction. Delightful to feel as well as see, such objects might also make a distinctive sound when touched, or emit a pleasant odour; indeed, scent holders became decorative objects in their own right in the sixteenth century.⁶⁴ The cloth door-, wall- and bed-hangings, for example, which were intrinsic parts of the decorative ensembles of household furnishings most usually associated with the upper echelons of Venetian society, bore each of these sensory attributes.⁶⁵ To understand their appeal to contemporaries, we need to appreciate the sounds which these textiles and their trimmings made when moved, and the scents they emitted, together with their colours, textures and weights.⁶⁶ We would expect such qualities to have been esteemed by contemporaries for, as well as being attractive features in themselves, they were the means by which more abstract values – such as the cost of such items, their place of origin and their association with classical virtues such as splendour – were communicated.⁶⁷ However, we also need to appreciate that within certain circles sensuous qualities of this nature continued to provoke serious religious concerns.

Not only were the senses often linked more with base material concerns than with the higher and more virtuous realms of the spirit, but gratification of those senses was thought to have serious spiritual consequences of its own.⁶⁸ Indeed, in the 'specially designed' hell of seventeenth-century Jesuit preachers so dramatically evoked by Piero Camporesi, the senses were the means of punishment used to torture the bodies 'which, on earth, they had served, smoothed and caressed'.⁶⁹ In one fell swoop, a nobleman awaking in this hell might go '[f]rom smelling amber in gloves, liquid amber from

Messico [sic] in food, the essence of roses in baths and balsams in oil lamps, to suffering the infected stench of decaying bilges in that enormous sewer.⁷⁰ Such indulgence in corporeal pleasures provoked this type of trenchant religious response because it was traditionally equated with the mortal sin of Luxury (*Luxuria*). As Christopher J. Berry has noted, "luxury" was a stock ingredient in the moral vocabulary of the "pre-modern" period.⁷¹ The close relationship between the senses and the capital sin of Luxury was also exploited to great dramatic effect in the profane literature of the 'long' sixteenth century, as well as in its art.⁷² The term 'luxury' continued to have strong sexual connotations in the period, being closely linked to lechery, an association which is largely absent from its modern usage.⁷³ For example, a mercer accused of having lived 'luxuriously' in 1580s Venice was understood to have had carnal relationships with women outside marriage.⁷⁴ Neutral modern uses of the word 'luxury' to describe the fine products of the period mistakenly negate this moral dimension, for, in contemporary terms, the appeal of such objects was theoretically akin to that of the flesh in that both invoked the senses.⁷⁵

The close relationship between sumptuous material effects and licentious behaviour is made quite clear in Thomas Coryate's ecstatic account of the apartment and clothes belonging to a Venetian courtesan. By including a detailed description of that courtesan's lavish trappings (which concluded with the grave warning that dressed in her glittering attire '[s]hee wil very neare benumme and captivate thy senses'), Coryate made his account of this otherwise apparently innocent supposed encounter somewhat suggestive.⁷⁶ While Coryate's discourse can be seen as conforming to contemporary English views of Italy – and especially of Venice – as a place grounded in 'vanity and vice', similar references can also be found in Venetian literature itself.⁷⁷ For example, in the anonymous sixteenth-century comedy *La Venexiana*, a Venetian widow orders her servant to prepare a room in which to receive a young foreign stranger. The deployment of sensual material effects – wall-hangings, a bed canopy and perfume – to decorate the room can be interpreted as an indication of the widow's amorous intentions, as well as a sign of her socio-economic status and of contemporary notions of hospitality.⁷⁸ The continuing belief that sensuality, thus broadly interpreted, could lead to eternal damnation is graphically illustrated in an early seventeenth-century engraving and its accompanying poem, attributed to the Paduan publishing house of Pietro Paolo Tozzi (Figure 5). Here 'impious and harmful' sensuality, personified as a stylishly dressed woman seated on an elaborately carved chair, gives birth to the seven capital vices. Once nurtured by ignorance and pleasure, these vices are then goaded into the mouth of hell.⁷⁹

Knowledge of this particular body of ideas can help us to understand

the prominent place given to prostitutes in the transformative spiritual reform of the sixteenth century. As in the Paduan engraving, such women were conspicuous reminders of the 'harmful' relationship between sensuality and the vice of Luxury.⁸⁰ Like the Gothic sculptures of Luxury carved on capitals of the Ducal Palace in Venice during the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries, the city's prostitutes were also associated with elaborate jewellery, a concern with their appearances, and elaborate clothing which exposed their breasts.⁸¹ The sixteenth-century belief that the eradication of these material associations was instrumental to their redemption is demonstrated by an altarpiece commissioned for the Venetian church of the Soccorso, a charitable institution founded expressly for the purpose of reclaiming such women in the late 1500s (Figure 6).⁸² Painted in the 1590s by Benedetto Caliari, the brother of Paolo Veronese, it depicts the prioress of the Soccorso interceding with the Madonna, via Mary Magdalene, on behalf of three penitent prostitutes.⁸³ While the prioress conforms to the Vecellian ideal of an older woman whose distance from 'the vanities of the world' is indicated by her simple garb, the sumptuously dressed prostitute on the far right signals her sincere intention to reform by removing her expensive jewellery.⁸⁴

As with Lotto's cornelian and Miani's ragged clothes, while Caliari's altarpiece and the Paduan engraving served the useful purposes of communicating specific ideas about the spiritual problems posed by material concerns, they also incorporated interpretative ambiguities. Whereas the engraving was designed for a fan, and was thus intended to be part of the sensual world of material effects which it admonished, Caliari's painting prompted similar questions about the moral status of decorative artefacts.⁸⁵ One of the virtuous activities in which the reformed inmates of the Soccorso (depicted on the left of his painting) engage is lace-making. However, although lace was synonymous with chastity and virtue, being typically used on altar cloths and religious vestments, it also had problematic associations.⁸⁶ It was not only one of the 'vanities of the world' which the inmates of pious institutions such as the Soccorso were meant to have left behind them, but was also one of the dangerous 'luxurious' effects which were particularly identified with unrepentant Venetian prostitutes in the late sixteenth century and much of the seventeenth century.⁸⁷ The prosecution of the 'public whore' (*pubblica meretrice*), Pasquetta, by the Venetian sumptuary magistrates in 1639, for example, was due as much to the black lace which decorated her silk skirt, sleeves, apron, cuffs and veil, as to the gold chain and flowers which, like the penitent prostitute in Caliari's painting, she wore in her hair.⁸⁸

Thanks to an increasing number of studies of sumptuary legislation, the socio-political ideas which, along with civic concerns about lay piety, underpinned these governmental measures to regulate displays of costly effects are



La sensualità empia e dannosa,
 E sette vizi, nostri danno eterno,
 Hor pavorosa a noi, per cui l'homosa
 Fuggir l'aperto Ciel, darci a li Inferno
 E l'ostination gli aiuta, e posa
 In luogo, ove i mondani habbino ischerno
 La via Ignoranza gli addormenta infesse
 La Delitacion gli nutre, e pasce



La Superbia, vantoza, e violenta,
 E l'Invidia, ch'ogni bene atterra
 E l'Invidia, ch' indegno fuoco avienta
 E l'ira, che a' diu, Satàn moue aspra guerra
 L'Invidia ch'ogni cor serote e' spaventa
 La Gola, che virtù di caccia e' serra.
 Empio con l'Accidia il mortel Regno
 D'Odio Incendio, Covoglio, error, di religio

already quite familiar.⁸⁹ Venetian sumptuary laws have in particular been interpreted from this angle, as a means of maintaining the appearance of social cohesion which was central to Venice's reputation as a well-governed, aristocratic republic.⁹⁰ This type of analysis is predicated upon the understanding of displays of material wealth encountered above, that is to say as a device employed by people for strategic social purposes, rather than simply as an end in itself. Moreover, the dynamic period of economic and demographic expansion with which we are concerned has itself been seen as a propelling agent, encouraging the use of such ostentation to reinforce existing social boundaries as well as to breach them.⁹¹ Both types of social strategies were politically dangerous because they undermined the notion



5 (opposite) Tozzi (attrib.), engraving of the Seven Vices, c.1600.

6 Benedetto Caliari, *L'istituzione del Soccorso*, c.1597.

of the Venetian Republic as an harmonious state, whose stability was based upon the communally minded attitudes of its citizens (*communitas*), as well as its model constitution.⁹² The case of Vincenzo Zuccato, a Venetian wool merchant denounced to the sumptuary magistrates in early 1605, supports this type of analysis.⁹³ Zuccato was accused of holding a grandiose reception on the birth of a child, objections being made both to the number of women thought to have attended and to the sumptuous appearance of the room in which they were supposedly received (the *camera del parto*).⁹⁴ According to the late sixteenth-century Venetian eulogist Francesco Sansovino, such displays of 'splendour and magnificence' were typical of these events; though noting that excessive expenditure was forbidden on these occasions, he particularly extolled the use of gold and silver plate as 'a noble thing and beautiful to onlookers' eyes'.⁹⁵ Zuccato's *camera del parto* apparently contained such forbidden 'noble' effects: 'silk figured tapestries which stretched from the floor up to the ceiling', 'engraved and gilded wooden chests worked with bronze' and 'a gilded iron bedstead with a yellow damask canopy and finely worked sheets'.⁹⁶ The carefully worded declaration in which Zuccato refuted these allegations certainly illuminates his understanding of the socio-political concerns provoked by such display.⁹⁷ Abasing himself before the 'Very Excellent Lordships' (as contemporary etiquette demanded), he immediately stressed that he had 'never gone beyond the boundaries of modesty, and of his tenuous fortunes, and social status [*conditione*]'.⁹⁸

In effect, however, sumptuary legislation seems not to have been an expedient means of socio-political management.⁹⁹ When summoned to answer to the city's magistrates for her unseemly appearance in public, the prostitute Pasquetta apparently arrived wearing all the forbidden items detailed in her denunciation, plus more: semi-precious stone 'pins', a coral and gold necklace and a coloured undergarment trimmed with gold.¹⁰⁰ While such items were prohibited to respectable married women as well as to 'women of her status', Pasquetta is reported as saying ('most licentiously') that she was allowed to wear them. Her prosecution and punishment – six months in a windowless prison and a fine of 150 ducats – appear to prove her wrong, although it was subsequently contested by the French ambassador, who appealed to the Venetian Senate on her behalf, and the final result proved ambiguous.¹⁰¹ The involvement of an aristocratic foreign dignitary in this particular case serves to highlight the existence of contradictory socio-political concerns with which the patrician sumptuary authorities, like their counterparts in other administrative spheres, had to contend.¹⁰² This is particularly evident on the occasions when the problematic sumptuous effects belonging to private individuals proved to be indispensable to the Venetian state.

When high-ranking foreign dignitaries visited Venice, for example, and

were said to be hosted 'at public expense', this was quite literally true, for a substantial amount of the material splendour exhibited on these important political occasions was supplied in kind, directly by the city's inhabitants.¹⁰³ During the visit of the princes of Savoy in April 1608, for instance, a state banquet was held in the palace belonging to 'the very illustrious Lord Procurator Priuli'.¹⁰⁴ Another patrician, Foscari, lent a boat and the Jewish community was similarly involved, supplying costly furnishings for the banqueting venue in accordance with a recent government stipulation.¹⁰⁵ Even the brigade of Venetian noblewomen who were invited to the banquet can be seen as contributing to the material environment; like the paintings hired by officials to embellish Priuli's residence, the arrival of 150 sumptuously dressed *gentildonne* would also have helped 'to furnish the palace for the *festa*'.¹⁰⁶ Paradoxically, such public displays of privately owned finery can be seen, like sumptuary laws, as a mechanism for maintaining the appearance of social cohesion which was central to the idea of Venice as an harmonious republic. Indeed, the use of citizens' valuable possessions for public purposes was an extremely effective way of showcasing the republican ideal of *communitas* to representatives of princely states.¹⁰⁷ The costs of organizing such elaborate public events were another consistent concern and they also seem to have risen significantly, especially towards the end of the period.¹⁰⁸ As well as serving a useful rhetorical function, therefore, official deployment of borrowed finery can be seen as a convenient alternative to defraying these essential government expenses.¹⁰⁹

In spite of these advantages, it is hard to reconcile the Venetian state's deployment of its citizens' private property in this way with the efforts which it made to limit the private display of such goods.¹¹⁰ Such public use of privately owned property not only undermined the government's own sumptuary legislation, but it also exacerbated the socio-political problems which that body of laws was apparently meant to address. This is because the deployment of Venetians' splendid effects at high-profile public events can be seen to have benefited their owners as well as the state.¹¹¹ The use of private palaces for major state festivities, for example, inevitably associated those festivities with the families to which the palaces belonged.¹¹² In this respect, the deployment of Ca' Foscari for the state visit of the French king, Henry III, in 1574 (which was a milestone in sixteenth-century Venetian public ceremonial) can be seen in the same light as the use of the new Medici palace to accommodate Galeazzo Maria Sforza in Florence in 1459.¹¹³ Moreover, the ubiquitous use of coats of arms and familial devices on household objects of every sort would also have left no onlooker in doubt that the property deployed 'at the public expense' belonged to quite specific people rather than the state.¹¹⁴ Although the public festivities at which such goods were displayed are often termed 'ephemeral', they left

a tangible legacy in manuscript and print.¹¹⁵ Describing a theatrical event attended by various procurators and other public figures in January 1530, for example, the famous Venetian diarist Marino Sanudo mentioned the two suppliers of the 'very beautiful' crimson (and thus very expensive) wall-hangings by name.¹¹⁶

The multi-dimensional nature of such public events is exemplified by a festive banquet held to honour the Prince of Salerno (Pietro Antonio di Santo Severino) one evening in January 1521.¹¹⁷ It was hosted by the patrician company of Ortolani, one of a number of youth associations which, as Edward Muir has noted, organized such festivities 'for their own entertainment and for the glory of the republic'.¹¹⁸ The banquet's venue, a private residence on the Grand Canal, was apparently decorated with tapestries and pictures like Priuli's palace in 1608, as well as with a display of silver plate reputedly worth 5,000 ducats. Cloth of gold, a fabric which according to a sumptuary decree of 1549 'had always been forbidden' to Venetian patricians as 'inappropriate for private citizens' ['no[n] conveniente a privati cittadini'], covered the princely seat of honour.¹¹⁹ Adding to the general glittering effect achieved by the display of these objects within a candlelit interior were gilded bread, gilded oysters, gilded wax candles and forty or so women dressed in gold-patterned and silk clothes.¹²⁰ We know about this event because it was recorded for posterity by the thwarted state chronicler Sanudo. However, Sanudo was not a disinterested historian: the owner of the palace in which this *fiesta* occurred – and whom he took care to mention at the start – was a young male relative.¹²¹ As this example suggests, the display of sumptuous personal effects at Venetian public events offered a means for private citizens to avoid the negative associations which such ostentation normally entailed.¹²² While this private involvement in state ceremonial encourages us to question the purpose of civic sumptuary legislation, it also indicates that Venetian consumers remained sensitive to the ideological concerns provoked by unwarranted displays of such goods.¹²³

This chapter has dwelt upon such mixed views of consumption in the Italian peninsula during the 'long' sixteenth century. In this respect it has adopted an approach advocated by the well-known historian of consumption John Brewer at a conference on the art market in Renaissance and Early Modern Italy held in the year this project began.¹²⁴ Brewer urged the participants at that conference to become cultural anthropologists instead of economists, and he particularly championed the idea associated with the theorist Pierre Bourdieu, that people are essentially resistant to commodification. This idea – that people find it difficult to treat their belongings simply as objects of exchange – has informed certain recent studies of consumption and is supported, as far as Renaissance Italy is concerned, by Sharon Strocchia's investigation of the rituals associated with death

in Renaissance Florence, as well as by Luke Syson and Dora Thornton's magisterial study of Renaissance art objects.¹²⁵ The evidence from Venice cited in this chapter bears out Strocchia's argument that the social worth of the objects used in rituals such as funerals was more important than their material value.¹²⁶ The example of Zuane the Venetian shopkeeper, for instance, who specified in 1579 that he wished to be buried in a Capuchin cowl, suggests that in spite of Venice's predominance as a hub of trade and retailing, economic considerations were not consistently uppermost in the minds of its citizens.

Yet at the same time, the existence of the market cannot simply be ignored. As indicated at the start of this study, Venetian inhabitants took advantage of the developed commercial facilities available in their city. They acquired and disposed of material goods as a matter of course. In short, with the possible exception of the precious objects donated to serve liturgical functions (and even they occasionally cropped up on the second-hand market), sixteenth-century Venetians seem to have had few difficulties in treating their material possessions as commodities.¹²⁷ For example, the numerous pious legacies left by Zuane, the shopkeeper, in his will of 1579 (including 100 ducats to the money-shy Capuchins), were to be funded by auctioning off his material possessions.¹²⁸ Acknowledging their active participation in the market for consumer goods does not, however, mean that Venetians were necessarily motivated by consumerism. Indeed, what is so interesting about sixteenth-century consumption is that it occurred alongside a dynamic and intricate ideological framework concerned with material goods. This chapter has highlighted the diverse range of ideas about the consumption of such goods which existed in the Italian peninsula during the period *c.*1450–*c.*1650, and it has also emphasized the co-existence of contradictory systems of beliefs within each of the three bodies of thought considered. Unfortunately it has not been possible to do full justice to the dynamic nature of these ideological systems: to show, for example, how certain ideas were supposed to carry greater weight during specific phases of the religious calendar, such as at Lent, or during the different stages of a person's life cycle. An awareness of this varied, inconsistent and changeable ideological framework is useful because it enables us to appreciate that the ownership and use of material goods could not simply have been causes for 'celebration' and 'unashamed enthusiasm' in the period.¹²⁹ In fact it encourages us to believe quite the opposite.¹³⁰ While the exact extent to which these ideas impacted upon a particular individual's patterns of consumption remains extremely hard to gauge, it is clear that the possession and deployment of material goods not only required sixteenth-century Venetians to engage with, but also to negotiate their way carefully among, a plethora of contradictory values.¹³¹ Knowledge of this ambiguous complex of beliefs

complicates our understanding of consumption as a 'long' sixteenth-century phenomenon, but historical analyses of the subject which are informed by it are likely to be much more convincing.

Notes

I wish to thank the following for their helpful comments, criticisms and references: Stephen Bowd, Michael Bury, Marie Chessel, Silvia Evangelisti, Maurice Howard, the Material Renaissance group, and participants in the Material Renaissance conference and in a material culture symposium held in St Andrews in 2003. References provided by Cordelia Beattie, Giuseppe Ellero, James Lindow, Irene Marcuccio and James Shaw, and Helen Webster were also very much appreciated.

- 1 See, for example, Chandra Mukerji, *From Graven Images: Patterns of Modern Materialism*, New York, 1983, pp. ix–xi (which also highlights the 'hedonistic' nature of consumerism on p. 2); John Brewer and Roy Porter, eds, *Consumption and the World of Goods*, London, 1993, pp. 1–3; and Jan De Vries, 'Luxury in the Dutch Golden Age in Theory and Practice', in Maxine Berg and Elizabeth Eger, eds, *Luxury in the Eighteenth Century: Debates, Desires and Delectable Goods*, Basingstoke, 2003, p. 41. For an in-depth analysis of historical consumerism, see Sara Pennell, 'Consumption and Consumerism in Early Modern England', *Historical Journal*, 42 (1999), pp. 549–64, especially p. 552.
- 2 Randolph Starn, 'The European Renaissance', in Guido Ruggiero, ed., *A Companion to the Worlds of the Renaissance*, Oxford, 2002, p. 49. Relevant works are Mukerji, 1983; Richard A. Goldthwaite, *Wealth and the Demand for Art in Italy, 1300–1600*, Baltimore, 1993; and Lisa Jardine, *Worldly Goods: A New History of the Renaissance*, London, 1996. Cf. Ingrid D. Rowland, 'The Renaissance Revealed', *New York Review of Books*, 6 November 1997, p. 30; and Berg and Eger, eds, 2003, pp. 1, 3, which sees the eighteenth century as the watershed for debates about 'consumer desires and practices'. For a brief summary of eighteenth-century developments, see James C. Riley, 'A Widening Market in Consumer Goods', in Euan Cameron, ed., *Early Modern Europe: An Oxford History*, Oxford, 1999, pp. 257–60.
- 3 On its development see Peter N. Stearns, 'Stages of Consumerism: Recent Work on the Issues of Periodization', *Journal of Modern History*, 69 (1997), pp. 102–17. Such efforts were strongly criticized by Lorna Weatherill in 'The Meaning of Consumer Behaviour in Late Seventeenth- and Early Eighteenth-century England', and, from a different perspective, by Jean-Christophe Agnew, 'Coming Up for Air: Consumer Culture in Historical Perspective', which are both in Brewer and Porter, eds, 1993, pp. 207–8 and 19–39.
- 4 For a classic synthesis which built on Burckhardt's ideas of modernity, see Alfred Von Martin, *Sociology of the Renaissance*, London, 1944, pp. viii, 3. Cf. Gene Brucker, 'The Italian Renaissance', in Ruggiero, ed., 2002, pp. 23–35. The sort of teleological approach adopted by Goldthwaite, 1993, p. 5, and Jardine, 1996, was strongly criticized by Rowland, 1997, pp. 30–5, and Lauro Martines, 'The Renaissance and the Birth of Consumer Society', *RQ*, 51 (1998), pp. 193–203. See also Maureen Quilligan, 'Renaissance Materialities: Introduction', *Journal of Medieval and Early Modern Studies*, 32:3 (2002), p. 428. On the various definitions of the term 'Renaissance' which are now used, see Peter Burke, *The European Renaissance: Centres and Peripheries*, Oxford, 1998, p. 170; and on the ambiguities associated with the term 'Renaissance' in Venice, see Richard MacKenney, *Renaissances: The Cultures of Italy, 1300–1600*, Houndmills, Basingstoke, 2005.

- 5 Early Modern and Renaissance historians of the book interested in literary consumption have, for example, demonstrated how difficult it is to analyse receptivity to ideas. For an idea of the recent state of that field, see the special issue of *Word & Image*, 17 (2001), especially Roger Chartier, 'Afterword: Materiality and Meaning', pp. 181–3. Of particular relevance to this chapter are Craig Kallendorf, *Virgil and the Myth of Venice: Books and Readers in the Italian Renaissance*, Oxford, 1999, pp. 1–11, 205–12; and James Hankins, *Plato in the Italian Renaissance*, 2 vols, Leiden, New York, 1991, I, pp. xv–xviii. On the need for 'dialogue between "cultural studies" and "political-economy" through an inter-disciplinary approach' to modern consumption, see Peter Jackson et al., eds, *Commercial Cultures: Economies, Practices, Spaces*, Oxford, 2000, pp. 1–3, and quote on p. 145. The inter-relationship of material and intellectual concerns within consumption, and the need to 'cross conventional intellectual boundaries' to access it, are also highlighted by Berg and Eger, eds, 2003, pp. 2, 4. Peter Burke, *Popular Culture in Early Modern Europe*, rev. reprint, Aldershot, 1994, p. xi, also remains relevant. The advantages and pitfalls of such inter-disciplinarity are noted in the editors' introduction, 'Material Strategies Engendered', in Barbara Burman and Carole Turbin, eds, *Material Strategies: Dress and Gender in Historical Perspective, Gender and History*, special issue, Malden, MA, 2003, p. 4.
- 6 The general problem with historical sources is noted by Lisa Tiersten, 'Redefining Consumer Culture: Recent Literature on Consumption and the Bourgeoisie in Western Europe', *Radical History Review*, 57 (1993), p. 137. For specific examples, see Marta Ajmar, 'Toys for Girls: Objects, Women and Memory in the Renaissance Household', in Marius Kwint, Christopher Breward and Jeremy Aynsley, eds, *Material Memories*, Oxford, 1999, pp. 75–89; and Patricia Allerston, 'L'abito usato', in Carlo Marco Belfanti and Fabio Giusberti, eds, *La moda*, Turin, 2003 (*Storia d'Italia*, Annali, 19), pp. 572–3. See also Burke, 1994, p. xiii.
- 7 The terms 'long sixteenth century' and 'extended sixteenth century' are used here in preference to other problematical alternatives such as 'high' and 'late' Renaissance. On the terms, see Fernand Braudel, *The Mediterranean and the Mediterranean World in the Age of Phillip II*, 2 vols, Glasgow, 1976, II, pp. 893–5; and Richard MacKenney, *Tradesmen and Traders: The World of the Guilds in Venice and Europe, c.1250–c.1650*, Totowa, NJ, 1987, pp. 78–9. The terms 'high Renaissance' and 'later Renaissance' are used, for example, in Burke, 1998, p. 13. On general problems with the term 'Renaissance', see n. 4 above.
- 8 Salvatore Ciriaco, 'Mass Consumption Goods and Luxury Goods: The De-Industrialization of the Republic of Venice from the Sixteenth to the Eighteenth Century', in Herman Van der Wee, ed., *The Rise and Decline of Urban Industries in Italy and in the Low Countries (Late Middle Ages – Early Modern Times)*, Leuven, 1988, pp. 42–3; Paula Lanaro, *I mercati nella repubblica veneta: economie cittadine e stato territoriale (secoli XV–XVIII)*, Venice, 1999.
- 9 See MacKenney, 1987, pp. 85–8; Ennio Concina, *Venezia nell'età moderna: struttura e funzioni*, Venice, 1989, pp. 230–4; and also Patricia Allerston, 'The Market in Second-Hand Clothes and Furnishings in Venice, c.1500–c.1650', Ph.D. dissertation, European University Institute, Florence, 1996, pp. 266–71.
- 10 Philippe Braunstein, 'Un Étranger dans la ville, Albrecht Dürer', in Philippe Braunstein, ed., *Venise 1500: La Puissance, la novation et la concorde: le Triomphe du mythe*, Paris, 1993, pp. 216, 219–20, 222–4, 226, 228. Dürer's role as a book-buyer for Pirckheimer is noted by Jardine, 1996, p. 225.
- 11 Braunstein, 1993, p. 226, 23 September 1506. See also pp. 224, 228–9.
- 12 See Patricia Allerston, 'Wedding Finery in Sixteenth-Century Venice', in Trevor Dean

- and Kate J. P. Lowe, eds, *Marriage in Italy, 1300–1650*, Cambridge, 1998, pp. 25–40; and Patricia Allerston, 'Clothing and Early Modern Venetian Society', *Continuity and Change*, 15 (2000), 367–90; and Allerston, 2003. For examples of book-lending, see Susan Connell, 'Books and their Owners in Venice 1345–1480', *JWCI*, 35 (1972), pp. 173–4. Thefts of antique objects are noted by Marilyn Perry, 'Cardinal Domenico Grimani's Legacy of Ancient Art to Venice', *JWCI*, 41 (1978), pp. 228–9. For a book of Seneca's letters left as a pledge (with some clothes) against a debt of 12 ducats in Venice in 1462, see Connell, 1972, p. 173.
- 13 Braunstein, 1993, p. 219, 28 February 1506. They contained an emerald, a ruby and a diamond. He was told they were worth 24 ducats, but good acquaintances subsequently said they were worth only 22 ducats. He sent them to Pirckheimer to have valued and keep for that value, if he liked them. On such exchanges, see also Matchette's essay (chapter 10).
 - 14 On the study of consumer culture in Early Modern Europe, and the identification of that culture among people without surplus economic means, see Tiersten, 1993, pp. 118, 139–40.
 - 15 See, for example, Patricia Fortini Brown, 'Behind the Walls: The Material Culture of Venetian Elites', in John Martin and Dennis Romano, eds, *Venice Reconsidered: The History and Civilization of an Italian City-State, 1297–1797*, Baltimore, 2000, pp. 295–338; and Allerston, 2000; cf. Fritz Schmidt, 'Zur Genese kapitalistischer Konsumformen im Venedig der Frühen Neuzeit', in Jürgen Reulecke, ed., *Stadtgeschichte als Zivilisationsgeschichte: Beiträge zum Wandel städtischer Wirtschafts-, Lebens- und Wahrnehmungsweisen*, Essen, 1990, pp. 23–40. Relevant works on other parts of Italy include Sharon Strocchia, *Death and Ritual in Renaissance Florence*, Baltimore, 1992, p. 30; and Sandra Cavallo, 'What did Women Transmit? Ownership and Control of Household Goods and Personal Effects in Early Modern Italy', in Moira Donald and Linda Hurcombe, eds, *Gender and Material Culture in Historical Perspective*, London, 2000, pp. 38–53.
 - 16 On this approach, see John Styles, 'Custom or Consumption? Plebian Fashion in Eighteenth-Century England', in Berg and Eger, eds, 2003, pp. 105–6.
 - 17 See especially Jardine, 1996, and Goldthwaite, 1993, but also Luke Syson and Dora Thornton, *Objects of Virtue: Art in Renaissance Italy*, London, 2001. A rare exception was Mary Rogers, 'Evaluating Textiles in Renaissance Venice', in Gabriele Neher and Rupert Shepherd, eds, *Revaluing Renaissance Art*, Aldershot, 2000, pp. 121–36. In this respect, Peter Burke, 'Conspicuous Consumption in Seventeenth-Century Italy', in *The Historical Anthropology of Early Modern Italy: Essays on Perception and Communication*, Cambridge, 1987, pp. 143–5, remains relevant. On negative attitudes in general, see Joyce Appleby, 'Consumption in Early Modern Social Thought', in Brewer and Porter, eds, 1993, p. 162.
 - 18 See the important contribution by Syson and Thornton, 2001, pp. 10, 12–36, as well as Dora Thornton, *The Scholar in his Study: Ownership and Experience in Renaissance Italy*, New Haven, 1997, pp. 1–8, 177; Guido Guerzoni, 'Liberalitas, Magnificentia, Splendor: The Classic Origins of Italian Renaissance Lifestyles', in Neil de Marchi and Crauford D. W. Goodwin, eds, *Economic Engagements with Art*, Durham, NC, 1999, pp. 332–78; and Evelyn Welch, 'Giovanni Pontano's De Splendore (1498) and the Domestic Arts', *Journal of Design History*, 15 (2002), pp. 211–29. Specifically on Venice, see Patricia Fortini Brown, *Venice and Antiquity: The Venetian Sense of the Past*, New Haven, 1996, pp. 206, 242–5 and 248. More generally on the utility of humanist thought to Renaissance elites, see Lauro Martines, *Power and Imagination: City-States in Renaissance Italy*, London, 1980, pp. 269–73, 440–1, 467. Reservations

- about the narrowness of this definition of culture are expressed by Gene Brucker, 'The Italian Renaissance', in Ruggiero, ed., 2002, p. 25.
- 19 Burke, 1998, p. 175. Burke described the consumption of classicizing objects as part of a process by which 'fashionable' Renaissance ideas became 'domesticated', see *ibid.*, p. 14 and chapter 5. See also Taylor's essay (chapter 8), which discusses what Pietro Aretino called the 'anciently modern' appeal of Giulio Romano's silverware. The early sixteenth-century 'Dickhead Plate', attributed to Francesco of Urbino, in the Ashmolean Museum in Oxford, demonstrates that these artefacts were not solely restricted to edifying messages. On the acquisition of this plate, see *The Guardian*, 18 September 2003.
 - 20 The goblet is discussed by Syson and Thornton, 2001, on pp. 52–3; see also chapter 5, pp. 182–200, on the technological aspects of glass. On the ability of glass to express refined taste as well as aristocratic status, see Patricia Fortini Brown, *Private Lives in Renaissance Venice*, New Haven, 2004, pp. 217–40.
 - 21 See William J. Bouwsma, 'The Two Faces of Humanism: Stoicism and Augustinianism in Renaissance Thought', in Heiko A. Oberman and Thomas A. Brady, eds, *Itinerarium Italicum: The Profile of the Italian Renaissance in the Mirror of its European Transformations*, London, 1975, pp. 3–4; Paul O. Kristeller, 'The Moral Thought of Renaissance Humanism', in *Renaissance Thought, II: Papers on Humanism and the Arts*, New York, 1961, p. 33; and Martines, 1980, p. 440.
 - 22 See Martines, 1980, p. 291, on the 'two different humanist moods on the moral worth of riches. One in praise and one in blame', although on pp. 291–2 he qualifies the impact of these moods.
 - 23 See Hankins, 1991, I, pp. 3–7; Burke, 1998, pp. 206–7; Fortini Brown, 1996, pp. 104, 118, 219; and Syson and Thornton, 2001, pp. 23–9, 87–9. On the notion of Platonic thought as 'commonplace' in sixteenth-century Europe, see Eustace M. W. Tillyard, *The Elizabethan World Picture*, London, 1973, p. 25. The importance of Aristotelian and Ciceronian ideas for Renaissance Italian material history has been re-emphasized by James Lindow, 'Magnificence and Splendour: The Palace in Renaissance Florence', Ph.D. thesis, Royal College of Art, London, 2004, chapter 1. See also Shepherd's essay below (chapter 2).
 - 24 Syson and Thornton, 2001, pp. 51–2 (beauty and mirrors); see also Thornton, 1997, pp. 127, 167–74 on other reasons for having mirrors. On the communal ownership of goods for members of the ruling elite, see Hankins, 1991, I, pp. 74, 77, 133–4, 141–2, 176, 229–30; see also p. 348 on beauty. For Platonic views on luxury, see Christopher Berry, *The Idea of Luxury: A Conceptual and Historical Investigation*, Cambridge, 1994, pp. 45–62 (Roman reservations are discussed on pp. 63–77). On this concept, see also John Sekora, *Luxury: The Concept in Western Thought, Eden to Smollett*, Baltimore, 1977, and Till Wahnbaeck, *Luxury and Public Happiness: Political Economy in the Italian Enlightenment*, Oxford, 2004. Surprisingly, Berg and Eger, eds, 2003, does not analyse the problematical notion of luxury in detail. Christian responses to this concept, which added lust to the equation, are discussed below.
 - 25 Quoted in Paul F. Grendler, *Critics of the Italian World 1530–1560: Anton Francesco Doni, Nicolò Franco & Ortensio Lando*, Madison and Milwaukee, 1969, p. 174. The compatibility of Plato's Republic with religious ideas, and its close relationship to Renaissance utopianism, are highlighted by Luigi Firpo in 'Political Philosophy: Renaissance Utopianism', in Eric Cochrane, ed., *The Late Italian Renaissance 1525–1630*, London, 1970, pp. 155–6, 158, 163. On Doni's own medal and print collection, see Thornton, 1997, p. 119.

- 26 Cf. Martines, 1980, pp. 452, 457–8, which instead emphasizes the importance of Platonic ideas about love and beauty. Doni was one of several writers of modest origins who lived by their pens in early sixteenth-century Venice and as such have been seen as a means of understanding prevailing attitudes. See Grendler, 1969, pp. 3–19. On Doni see *ibid.*, pp. 49–65; and Claudia di Filippo Bareggi, *Il mestiere di scrivere: lavoro intellettuale e mercato librario a Venezia nel Cinquecento*, Rome, 1988, pp. 26–31. On the use of texts produced by popular writers to detect sources of popular resentment, see James S. Amelang, 'Vox Populi: Popular Autobiographies as Sources for Early Modern Urban History', *Urban History*, 20:1 (1993), p. 35.
- 27 See Grendler, 1969, pp. 71–135; and John Martin, *Venice's Hidden Enemies: Italian Heretics in a Renaissance City*, Berkeley, 1993. The theme of Venice 'as the ground for utopian thought in the sixteenth century' also underlies Marion Leathers Kuntz *Venice, Myth and Utopian Thought in the Sixteenth Century: Bodin, Postel and the Virgin of Venice*, Aldershot, 1999.
- 28 The similarities between Stoic and Platonic ideas in this respect were highlighted by Erasmus in 1503 in his *The Handbook of the Militant Christian (Enchiridion Militis Christiani)*: see John P. Dolan, ed., *The Essential Erasmus*, New York and Scarborough, Ontario, 1964, p. 45. Stoic rejection of worldly things is also highlighted by Sekora, 1977, pp. 33–4; and Berry, 1994, p. 63. On the nature of Stoicism and its place in contemporary intellectual thought, see Bouwsma, 1975, pp. 6–7, 10–11, 17–33, 58; Stephen D. Bowd and J. Donald Cullington, 'Two Renaissance Treatises: Carlo Valgulio of Brescia on Funerals and Music', *Annali queriniani*, 3 (2002), pp. 144, 153–7; and Burke, 1998, pp. 207–9; cf. Kristeller, 1961, p. 35. Ancient reservations about the consumption of goods are also discussed by Catherine Kovesi Killerby, *Sumptuary Law in Italy 1200–1500*, Oxford, 2002, pp. 9–17.
- 29 This distinction is highlighted by Syson and Thornton, 2001, pp. 229, 233. A somewhat different interpretation of the same phenomenon is given in Von Martin, 1944, p. 60.
- 30 Poggio Bracciolini's depiction of Venetian nobles as 'boorish merchants' is noted in Connell, 1972, p. 178, n. 166; see also pp. 163, 175–82 for the library which contained books in Greek and humanists' works which was the exception in Connell's sample. Hankins, 1991, I, p. 142, sees Plato's Republic as having a warmer reception in Milan than in republican Venice and Florence. Kallendorf, 1999, which posits the broad-based appeal of Virgil's poetry in Venice during the later 1400s and early 1500s, includes a useful summary of past scholarship on this topic on pp. 19–20. For a broad-ranging and informative reassessment of this presumed indifference, see Fortini Brown, 1996; also Ronald G. Witt, 'In the Footsteps of the Ancients': *The Origins of Humanism from Lovato to Bruni*, Leiden, 2000, pp. 454–75. An addition is Virginia Cox, 'Rhetoric and Humanism in Quattrocento Venice', *RQ*, 41 (2003), 652–94.
- 31 Fortini Brown, 1996, argued that while Venice did become a centre of classical scholarship (pp. 147, 272), the Venetian interest in the antique was pursued in aesthetic and tangible forms such as images and artefacts, and in ephemeral events such as pageants, rather than in written texts (pp. 60, 183, 206–7, 219, 221). She also notes that this interest was initially associated with the domestic sphere, rather than the public one (pp. 33, 248–52). Isabella Palumbo-Fossati also raised this issue in 'L'interno della casa dell'artigiano e dell'artista nella Venezia del Cinquecento', *SV*, new ser., 8 (1984), p. 147 (see also p. 133 on the relative lack of books in inventories); whereas John J. Martin made a similar point, about Palladio's engagement with classical ideas, in a paper given at the conference of the Renaissance Society of America held in New York in April 2004 ('Andrea and Palladio'). The existence of

- varieties of antiquarianism, divided between philological and 'archaeological' activities, has usefully been highlighted by Daniel Woolf, *The Social Circulation of the Past: English Historical Culture, 1500–1730*, Oxford, 2003, pp. 141–7.
- 32 On these and other collections, see C. A. Levi, *Le collezioni veneziane d'arte e d'antichità dal secolo XIV ai nostri giorni*, Venice, 1900; Marino Zorzi, ed., *Collezioni di antichità a Venezia nei secoli della repubblica*, Rome, 1988; Perry, 1978, pp. 215–44; Thornton, 1997, pp. 99–100, 114–19; and Fortini Brown, 2004, pp. 217–40. For evidence of earlier collections, see Fortini Brown, 1996, pp. 59, 77; Thornton, 1997, p. 10.
- 33 Fortini Brown, 1996, makes this point forcibly on p. 206; the impact of classicizing motifs on the minor arts is also noted by Palumbo-Fossati, 1984, p. 147. The copies and modern works in Odoni's collection are discussed by P. Debus, 'Portraits de collectionneurs: à propos de quelques collectionneurs vénitiens au XVI^e siècle', in Laurence B. Dolléas, ed., *Le commerce de l'art de la Renaissance à nos jours*, Besançon, 1992, pp. 44–5; and an inventory of Odoni's possessions is reproduced in Georg Gronau, 'Beiträge zum Anonymus Morellianus', *Italienische Forschungen*, 4 (1911), pp. 56–71; see also Monika A. Schmitter, 'The Display of Distinction: Art Collecting and Social Status in Early Sixteenth Century Venice', Ph.D. dissertation, University of Michigan, 1997, pp. 135–285. For a detailed insight into the broad range of classicizing art objects produced in the fifteenth and early sixteenth centuries, see Syson and Thornton, 2001.
- 34 See Fortini Brown, 1996, for example pp. 117–41, 193–222, 232–46. A chapter is devoted to 'all'antica style' in Syson and Thornton, 2001, pp. 78–134; see also Taylor's essay below (chapter 8). On the classical credentials of glass, and attempts to imitate and perfect upon ancient glass-making techniques in Venice, see Syson and Thornton, 2001, pp. 186–9.
- 35 The quote is from Palumbo-Fossati, 1984, p. 147; Thornton, 1997, p. 10, also discusses this subject. See Kallendorf, 1999, pp. 140–204, for his ideas about the broad Venetian readership of Virgil.
- 36 See Palumbo-Fossati, 1984, pp. 146–7 (miniature painter, 1576) and pp. 122, 129 (lead founder, 1590, the painting hung in the kitchen). For the carpenter obliged to sell his copies of 'Paladio' and 'Batta Alberti de architettura', see ASV, Signori di Notti al Civil, busta 271, Vendite, registro 1, fol. 25r, 28 September 1601; and for the smith, *ibid.*, fol. 26r, 5 October 1601: 'turqueseta d'oro all'antiga'. On Palladio's cabinet designs, see Thornton, 1997, pp. 71–2. Burke, 1998, also dates what he calls the 'domestication' of Renaissance thought (including the popularity of images of emperors) to the 'later Renaissance' (c.1530–1630), although he downplays the involvement of lower social groups outside Venice and Florence; see pp. 170–1, 187.
- 37 Carlo Goldoni, *La famiglia dell'antiquario* (1750), Turin, 1983. See especially Act I, Scenes 1, 16 and 18; Act II, Scenes 9, 10 and 11.
- 38 See Burke, 1998, pp. 170–1.
- 39 Syson and Thornton, 2001, pp. 92–5; see also p. 16. On emulation as a spur to such consumption, see Thornton, 1997, p. 9; cf. Allerston, 2000, pp. 368–9.
- 40 Thornton, 1997, pp. 72–3, illustrates and discusses Fosco's portrait medal. Palumbo-Fossati, 1984, cites the inventoried possessions of Fosco, who, at the time of his death in 1582, owned a cabinet painted with 'figure e prospettive', as well as works by Serlio, Alberti and Vignola, and a book 'in stampa di rami di diversi disegni di prospettive di sepolchri di principi': see pp. 118–38, esp. pp. 122–3, 134–5. For another example, see Victoria Avery, 'The House of Alessandro Vittoria Reconstructed', *Sculpture Journal*, 5 (2001), p. 20.

- 41 Burke made the valuable point that objects could speak more than one language in 'The Presentation of Self in the Renaissance Portrait', in Burke, 1987, p. 158; see also Strocchia, 1992, p. 30. The methodological difficulties posed by overly narrow interpretations of other sorts of historical texts are also highlighted by Chartier, 2001, p. 182. See also my review of Syson and Thornton, 2001, in *RS*, 17 (2003), p. 134.
- 42 On the 'detailed, almost autobiographical' nature of this will, see Peter Humfrey, *Lorenzo Lotto*, New Haven, 1997, p. 2. On the utility of artisans' personal documents – including the bombastic autobiography of the infamous sculptor Benvenuto Cellini – to reconstruct the 'multiple identities of humble citizens from the past', see Amelang, 1993, p. 35.
- 43 On seal-dies with ancient devices, see Thornton, 1997, pp. 128–30. On Lotto's use of his cameos as pledges against debts, see Lorenzo Lotto, *Il 'Libro di spese diverse' con aggiunta di lettere e d'altri documenti*, ed. Pietro Zampetti, Rome, 1969, pp. 158–9, December 1547–January 1548 (Venice); pp. 162–3, January–February, 21 May 1552 (Rome and Ancona); pp. 177–91, various dates and references, 1540–54. For his attempts to sell the cameos, see *ibid.*, pp. 111, 113, 4 September 1548, and 118, 27 November 1550. On his use of his seals on letters, see Mauro Zanchi, *Lorenzo Lotto e l'immaginario alchemico*, Clusone BG, n.d., p. 7.
- 44 See Lotto, *Il 'Libro di spesi diverse'*, 1969, p. 304, 25 March 1546: 'Ancora un anello doro ligato una bellissima corniola antica, con una gruva che si leva a volo con un iugo ai piedi et in becho el segno de Mercurio, significato la vita activa e la contemplativa con meditazione spirituale levarsi dale cose terrene.' A manuscript copy is in the Archivio delle Istituzioni di Ricovero e di Educazione, Venice, Testamenti no. 76. On the ownership of such goods in intellectual and higher social circles, see Syson and Thornton, 2001, pp. 83–90; and for a Venetian example, Perry, 1978, p. 216, n. 4, p. 217.
- 45 It evokes the Platonic ideal, as reinterpreted by Christian Humanist scholars, of spiritual union with God, as well as Ciceronian ideas about active and contemplative lives. On the former, see *The Letters of Marsilio Ficino*, trans. members of the Language Department of the School of Economic Science, I, London, 1975, nos 91 and 108, pp. 141, 162; as well as Stephen D. Bowd, *Reform before the Reformation: Vincenzo Querini and the Religious Renaissance in Italy*, Leiden, Boston and Cologne, 2002, p. 62; the Platonic scheme is also succinctly and very clearly explained by Tillyard, 1973, pp. 25–8. On the latter, see Kristeller, 1961, pp. 54–5; and Bowd, 2002, p. 9. In this respect Lotto's gem is reminiscent of the intarsia hieroglyphs which he designed for the basilica of Santa Maria Maggiore in Bergamo in the 1520s. See Zanchi, n.d.; and also Humfrey, 1997, pp. 82–5, 90–2. Zanchi detects a mixture of biblical, alchemical, Kabbalistic, Greek philosophical and Egyptian hermetical sources in Lotto's intarsie (p. 3). Similar intellectual concerns are evident in the hieroglyphic frieze in Sebastian del Piombo's contemporaneous portrait of Andrea Doria (1526, Palazzo Doria Pamphilj, Rome). See Michael Hirst, *Sebastiano del Piombo*, Oxford, 1981, Pl. 124 and pp. 105–6. While noting that Lotto's knowledge of Latin was purely functional, Zanchi (n.d., pp. 2–3) and Humfrey (1997, pp. 21, 46) place Lotto within circles of scholars interested in these intellectual issues.
- 46 On the use of such mnemonic devices in the period, see Woolf, 2003, pp. 263–7. Useful general points about the contemporary importance of such ideas about salvation, and the utility of the Platonic scheme – to 'the mystically minded' – for explaining it in the period, are also highlighted by Tillyard, 1973, p. 29. Pietro Aretino notoriously mocked Lotto for his religious zeal in a letter dated 1548 reproduced in Lotto, *Il 'Libro di spese diverse'*, 1969, pp. 305–6; see also Humfrey,

- 1997, p. 158; whereas Vasari described Lotto's piety and unworldliness in *Le vite de' più eccellenti pittori, scultori e architettori nelle redazioni del 1550 e 1568*, ed. Rosanna Bettarini, IV, Florence, 1976, p. 554 (life of Lotto); see also Humfrey, 1997, p. 4. For an in-depth discussion of Lotto's spirituality and of his relationships with heretical Venetians, see Massimo Firpo, *Artisti, gioiellieri, eretici: il mondo di Lorenzo Lotto tra riforma e controriforma*, Rome, 2004.
- 47 Bowd and Cullington, 2002, p. 148.
- 48 Cf. Hans Baron, 'Franciscan Poverty and Civic Wealth as Factors in the Rise of Humanistic Thought', *Speculum*, 13 (1938), pp. 1-37; David Chambers, 'The Economic Predicament of Renaissance Cardinals', in *Renaissance Cardinals and their Worldly Problems*, Aldershot, 1997, I, p. 311; and Goldthwaite, 1993, pp. 204-12. On the remarkably persistent notion of religious poverty, which had inspired the early founders of monastic orders as well as many subsequent waves of religious reformers, see Rowland, 1997; Lester K. Little, *Religious Poverty and the Profit Economy in Medieval Europe*, London, 1978; Paul Christophe, *Les Pauvres et la pauvreté*, 2 vols, I: *Des origines au XVe siècle*, Paris, 1985; II: *Du XVIe siècle à nos jours*, Paris, 1987. The problems posed by such worldly vanities were detailed in the influential and widely distributed religious work of 1418, attributed to Thomas à Kempis, *The Imitation of Christ*, London, 1886, book 1, ch. 1, p. 5.
- 49 See R. Po-Chia Hsia, 'Religious Cultures (Spirituality, Reform, High and Low)', and Brucker, 2002 in Ruggiero, ed., 2002, pp. 333-48, 25-31; cf. Von Martin, 1944, p. 18, for a classic dismissal; and John Martin, 'Recent Italian Scholarship in the Renaissance', *RQ*, 48 (1995), p. 609. Key works include Donald Weinstein, *Savonarola and Florence: Prophecy and Patriotism in the Renaissance*, Princeton, 1970; and Ottavia Niccoli, *Prophecy and People in Renaissance Italy*, trans. Linda G. Cochrane, Princeton, 1990. For a revision of Niccoli's ideas about the early demise of prophetic ideas, see Bowd, 2002, pp. 191-2. Sixteenth-century examples of preachers and bonfires of 'vanities' are given in Maria G. Muzzarelli, ed., *La legislazione suntuaria, secoli XIII-XVI: Emilia-Romagna*, Rome, 2002, p. xx. On the 'considerable influence' which millenarian ideas continued to exercise in Venice and elsewhere throughout the sixteenth century, see Martin, 1993, pp. 16, 112-15. For a pertinent example, given the emphasis on poverty, see Marion Leathers Kuntz, 'The Virgin of Venice and Concepts of the Millennium in Venice', in Leathers Kuntz, 1999, essay VII, pp. 111-30.
- 50 See Christophe, 1985, II, pp. 23, 25, 31, 187; as well as the references in the previous note; cf. Martines, 1980, p. 292. For a contemporary description of a 'bonfire of vanities' held in Savonarolan Florence in 1496, see Luca Landucci, *A Florentine Diary from 1450 to 1516*, trans. Alice De Rosen Jervis, London, 1927, pp. 130-1. On the idea of Renaissance Christianity as a dynamic force which shaped society instead of just reflecting it, see Martin, 1993, p. 20. A particularly vehement contribution was made by Piero Camporesi, *The Fear of Hell: Images of Damnation and Salvation in Early Modern Europe*, trans. Lucinda Byatt, Cambridge, 1990 (first pub as *La casa dell'eternità*, Milan, 1987). See pp. 24, 28, 36.
- 51 The reconceptualization of the chronology of reform in the sixteenth century is central to John W. O'Malley, *Freni and All That: Renaming Catholicism in the Early Modern Era*, Cambridge, MA and London, 2000, especially pp. 131, 135; and Peter G. Wallace, *The Long European Reformation*, Houndmills, Basingstoke, 2004. See also Robert Bireley, *The Refashioning of Catholicism, 1450-1700: A Reassessment of the Counter Reformation*, Houndmills, Basingstoke, 1999; and Bowd, 2002, especially pp. 5-6, 25, 178, 229.
- 52 The place of religious poverty in the late sixteenth-century reforms of nunneries is explored in Silvia Evangelisti, 'Monastic Poverty and Material Culture in Early

- Modern Italian Convents', *Historical Journal*, 47:1 (2004), pp. 1–20. On the role of property in Venetian initiatives, see Jutta G. Sperling, *Convents and the Body Politic in Late Renaissance Venice*, Chicago and London, 1999, pp. 120–4; and Mary Laven, *Virgins of Venice: Enclosed Lives and Broken Vows in the Renaissance Convent*, London, 2002, p. 2. Cf. Christophe, 1985, II, p. 67, 188.
- 53 Felix Gilbert considered religious considerations to be the 'primary reason' behind the introduction of sumptuary legislation in this period; see Felix Gilbert, 'Venice in the Crisis of the League of Cambrai', in J. R. Hale, ed., *Renaissance Venice*, London, 1973, pp. 275–80. See also Gaetano Cozzi, 'Authority and the Law in Renaissance Venice', in Hale, ed., 1973, pp. 309–12; Stephen D. Bowd, 'How to be a Renaissance Hermit', *Bulletin of the Society for Renaissance Studies*, 16:1 (1998), pp. 10, 14; Giulio Bistort, *Il magistrato alle pompe nella repubblica [sic] di Venezia: studio storico*, Bologna, 1969 (facsimile of 1912 edition), pp. 51–5; and Luca Molà, 'Leggi suntuarie in Veneto', in Maria G. Muzzarelli and Antonella Campanini, eds, *Disciplinare il lusso: la legislazione suntuaria in Italia e in Europa tra Medioevo ed età moderna*, Rome, 2003, p. 49. For a brief introduction to the League and its impact on Venice, see Gaetano Cozzi and Michael Knapton, *La Repubblica di Venezia nell'età moderna: dalla guerra di Chioggia al 1517*, Turin, 1986 (*Storia d'Italia* 12:1), pp. 91–5; and William J. Bouwsma, *Venice and the Defense of Republican Liberty: Renaissance Values in the Age of the Counter Reformation*, Berkeley, CA, 1968, p. 103. Cf. Michael Mallett, 'Venetian Elites in the Crises of the Early Sixteenth Century', in Stella Fletcher and Christine Shaw, eds, *The World of Savonarola: Italian Elites and Perceptions of Crisis*, Aldershot, 2000, pp. 151–61.
- 54 See the draft minute in Hubert Jedin, 'Vincenzo Querini und Pietro Bembo', in *Kirche des Glaubens – Kirche der Geschichte: ausgewählte Aufsätze und Vorträge*, 2 vols, Freiburg i. B., 1966, I, p. 165. On Querini's reform programme and his antipathy towards 'worldly honours', see Bowd, 2002, pp. 128, 138–41, 149–71. The personal choices made by Querini, in the early 1500s, are a dramatic example of the spiritual ideal of religious poverty in action. Having adopted a semi-monastic life within his family's palace, he subsequently decided to reject his privileged circumstances completely, leaving Venice to enter a Camaldolese hermitage in 1511. See *ibid.*, pp. 12, 61–85; and Bowd, 1998, p. 10.
- 55 On Miani and his circle, as well as the worn, old clothes which Miani and his friend Andrea Lippomano chose to wear, see Carlo Pellegrini, 'S. Girolamo Miani istitutore della cura degli orfani e fondatore dell'Ospedale dei Derelitti', in *San Girolamo Miani e Venezia nel V^o centenario della nascita: atti delle celebrazioni tenutesi nella chiesa di S. Maria dei Derelitti 8–15 feb. 1986*, Venice, n.d., pp. 19–20, 27–8, 33. On Miani, see also Giuseppe Ellero, 'Un ospedale della riforma cattolica veneziana: i Derelitti ai SS Giovanni e Paolo', *Tesi di Laurea*, Università degli Studi di Venezia, 1980–81, pp. 67–70.
- 56 Dolan, ed., 1964, p. 62 (*The Handbook of the Militant Christian*, 1503), p. 170 (*The Praise of Folly*, 1509). On the proposal made at the Council of Trent, that the *Handbook of the Militant Christian* be made available to all future priests, see *ibid.*, p. 24. On the use of pagan writings for religious ends, see *ibid.*, pp. 63–4, also p. 36. Ficino made a similar point in a letter to Lorenzo Franceschi: see Ficino, *Letters*, 1975, no. 108, p. 162. Tillyard, 1973, pp. 2, 19, makes the valuable general point that Platonic ideas had informed the religious world view of Christians well before the Platonic revival during the fifteenth century.
- 57 Niccolo Nelli, *Proverbi*, Venice: Fernando Bertelli, 1564. For proverbs as a means of accessing contemporary perceptions see Michelle A. Laughran, 'The Body, Public

- Health and Social Control in Sixteenth-Century Venice', Ph.D. dissertation, University of Connecticut, 1998, pp. 37–9. However, this sheet of proverbs is unusual in being illustrated, and is more sophisticated than the sayings in Veneto dialect included in the popular early sixteenth-century collection: Manlio Cortelazzo, ed., *Le dieci tavole dei proverbi*, Vicenza, 1995. See also Gian Antonio Cibotto, *Proverbi del Veneto*, Florence, 1995 and 2000. For evidence that proverbs were also appreciated by an educated audience, see Ficino, *Letters*, no. 22, p. 60. A very similar expression is used by Erasmus in his guide for spiritual living, see Dolan, 1964, p. 71.
- 58 ASV, Notarile, Testamenti, Atti Cigrini, busta 199, no. 319, Zuane Strazzaruol – Sant'Apolar, 17 November 1579. On the poverty and asceticism associated with the Capuchins (who witnessed their heyday of popularity in the 1600s), see Bireley, 1999, pp. 28–9. Lotto made a similar request in his will of 1546, and he subsequently dedicated himself and all his worldly possessions to the Holy House of Loreto, becoming a lay brother in that institution in 1554. See Lotto, *Il 'Libro di spese diverse'*, 1969, p. 303 (1546 will; the funeral was part of the payment for his famous painting of the observant Dominican Saint Antonino), p. 151 and p. 298; also p. 311, 8 September 1554 (Loreto); and Firpo, 2004, p. 309.
- 59 Thomas Coryate, *Coryat's Crudities 1611*, introduction by W. M. Schutte, London, 1978, p. 255: '... because they beleeve there is such virtue in the Friers cowle, that it will procure them remission of the third part of their sinnes ...'. Strocchia, 1992, p. 236, cited this example as proof of the long-term continuities in the ritualistic use of symbols in Renaissance Italy.
- 60 Strocchia, 1992, also makes this important point on pp. 236–7; and highlights the 'very powerful statement' made by opting to be buried in a mendicant habit when the practice was no longer standard, on p. 41. On the 'anxiety of all anxieties' provoked by death in the late seventeenth century; and for horrific seventeenth- and eighteenth-century descriptions of the hell which awaited sinful people, see Camporesi, 1990, pp. 36, 58–9. Cf. Christophe, 1985, II, p. 67.
- 61 Cesare Vecellio, *Habiti antichi et moderni di tutto il mondo di Cesare Vecellio di nuovo accresciuti di molte figure*, Venice, 1598 (orig. pub. 1590), fols 104v–105r, 'Donne di Venetia attempate, & dismesse'. On this work, and its author, see Tiziana Conte, ed., *Cesare Vecellio 1521c.–1601*, Belluno, 2001, especially pp. 13–22, 125–54.
- 62 See, for example, the comments about 'cose del mondo' in Vasari 1976, p. 554 (life of Lotto).
- 63 À Kempis, 1886, book 1, chapter 1, p. 5. The animated nature of objects has been stressed by Anne Rosalind Jones and Peter Stallybrass, *Renaissance Clothing and the Materials of Memory*, Cambridge, 2001, p. 2.
- 64 See Michelle A. Laughran, 'Oltre la pelle: i cosmetici e il loro uso', in Belfanti and Giusberti, eds, 2003, p. 58. On perfume burners, see Peter Thornton, *The Italian Renaissance Interior, 1400–1600*, London, 1991, pp. 249–51.
- 65 On the furnishings used for special occasions in Venice and legislative reactions to them, see Allerston, 1998, pp. 25–40. More generally, see P. Thornton, 1991, pp. 30, 44–53, 120–35, 158–61; and on Venice, Fortini Brown, 2004, pp. 79–81, 85–6.
- 66 In addition to being stored in coffers along with sweet-smelling herbs and pine needles, perfume was applied to interior furnishings to keep them clean, as well as fragrant on special occasions. See Carole Frick, 'Dressing a Renaissance City: Society, Economics and Gender in the Clothing of 15th-Century Florence', Ph.D. dissertation, UCLA, 1995, pp. 430–1; Giovanventura Rosetti, *Notandissimi secreti de l'arte profumatoria (1555)*, ed. Franco Brunello and Franca Facchetti, 2nd edn, Vicenza, 1992,

- p. 116; and Allerston, 2003, p. 577. On some of the problems posed by bad-smelling textiles, see *ibid.* Attention was drawn to the colours of Venetian artefacts by Paul Hills, *Venetian Colour: Marble, Mosaic, Painting and Glass 1250–1550*, New Haven, 1999.
- 67 The role played by the senses in helping people to understand was emphasized by Ficino, *Letters*, 1975, no. 39, p. 80. The sensuous qualities of textiles and other types of goods were positively celebrated in the letters written by the Venetian habitué Pietro Aretino. See, for example, Pietro Aretino, *Il secondo libro delle lettere*, I, ed. Fausto Nicolini, Bari, 1916, letter 187, 29 May 1539, which highlights the sparkle of precious stones, pleasant smells and the delicate nature of fabrics among the pleasant diversions of life. On the sensuous nature of Aretino's writings and life, see Grendler, 1969, pp. 8–10. On the classical notion of splendour, see Welch, 2002, pp. 211–29; Lindow, 2004, chapter 2; and Shepherd's essay below (chapter 2).
- 68 For Neo-Platonic-influenced religious views of the senses, see Ficino, *Letters*, 1975, nos 39, 43 and 115, pp. 80, 85, 172; and most famously, Baldassare Castiglione, *Il libro del cortigiano con una scelta delle opere minori*, ed. Bruno Maier, Turin, 2nd edn, 1964, pp. 514–18. See also Dolan, 1964, pp. 170–1 and 49–50. The hierarchy of the senses, in which touch was the basest and sight the highest, is noted by Bowd, 2002, p. 171. On the dangerous nature of the senses, see Carla Casagrande and Silvana Vecchio, *Histoire des péchés capitaux au Moyen Âge*, Paris, 2003 (orig. pub. as *I sette vizi capitali: storia dei peccati nel Medioevo*, Turin, 2000), pp. 234–5, 238. In this respect they were like vainglory; see *ibid.*, p. 62, and Maria G. Muzzarelli, *Guardaroba medievale: vesti e società dal XIII al XIV secolo*, Bologna, 1999, pp. 324–36. Such negative ideas are among the reasons why Aretino's works were considered to be provocative, see Grendler, 1969, p. 17. In his letter to the Cardinal of Trent cited above (n. 67), Aretino notes that the sensual diversions mentioned might not be appropriate for his addressee.
- 69 Camporesi, 1990, pp. 58–9. For an explanation of social attitudes to the senses over time, see Robert Jütte, *A History of the Senses: from Antiquity to Cyberspace*, Cambridge, 2004.
- 70 Camporesi, 1990, p. 59 (example taken from a text published in Venice in 1670).
- 71 Berry, 1994, p. 101. The 'discourse of "luxury"' which 'pre-industrial societies deployed ... to discuss consumer behaviour' is also linked to the seven deadly sins by De Vries, 2003, p. 41.
- 72 On this close association, see Casagrande and Vecchio, 2003, p. 238; and Berry, 1994, p. 94, which discusses Augustinian ideas on the subject. According to Morton W. Bloomfield, whereas the seven sins were not deadly to start with, they became so over the course of the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries. See Morton W. Bloomfield, *The Seven Deadly Sins: An Introduction to the History of a Religious Concept, with Special Reference to Medieval English Literature*, Ann Arbor, Michigan, 1952, pp. viii, 43–4, 157.
- 73 On 'the breadth of meaning possessed by the term [luxury] in pre-modern discourse', and the addition of lust as the 'Christian contribution' to this ancient concept, see Berry, 1994, pp. 87–98, and Sekora, 1977, pp. 42, 45–7.
- 74 For the quote, see Valerio Rossato, 'Religione e moralità in un merciaio veneziano del Cinquecento', *SV*, new ser., 13 (1987), p. 241.
- 75 See Syson and Thornton, 2001, p. 229, and, more generally, Woodruff D. Smith, *Consumption and the Making of Respectability, 1600–1800*, New York, 2002, pp. 63–7; cf. Burke, 1987, pp. 133–4. The term 'luxury' has been deployed in its modern senses in many studies on the Italian peninsula, including my own. For an idea of the ambiguities its use can cause, see Kovesi Killerby, 2002, p. 160.

- 76 Coryate, *Crudities*, 1978, pp. 265–7, at 266.
- 77 The ‘vanity and vice’ quote is from R. Ascham, ‘The Schoolmaster (1570)’, in *The Norton Anthology of English Literature*, 5th edn, I, New York, 1986, p. 1026. See especially Thomas Nashe, ‘The Unfortunate Traveller or the Life of Jacke Wilton (1594)’, ed. Herbert F. B. Brett-Smith, Oxford, 1920, p. 96, whose fictional protagonist describes Italy as ‘the Paradise of the Earth, and the Epicure’s heaven’. Like Coryate later, Nashe also placed his traveller in a Venetian courtesan’s house in which every room was like ‘a haberdasher’s shop’ (p. 52).
- 78 Anon., *La Venexiana*, text and trans. ed. Ludovico Zorzi, Turin, 1965, Act II, Scene 4: ‘No spetar pì. Aparecia el mezaio cun le so spaliere; meti el sopraçelo a la letiera; trova li acanini da brusar, sastu? fia dolçe.’
- 79 On this image, see Aurelio Rigoli and Annamaria Amitrano Savarese, eds, *Fuoco, acqua, cielo, terra: stampe popolari profane della ‘Civica Raccolta Achille Bertarelli’*, Vigevano, 1995, p. 431. For more subtle artistic depictions of sensuous goods, see Rogers, 2000, pp. 125–6.
- 80 See Casagrande and Vecchio, 2003, pp. 334–7, who also highlight the role of the seven capital sins in Ignatius Loyola’s Spiritual Exercises, as well as in Erasmus’s *Handbook of the Militant Christian*, which was recommended to the Council of Trent for use by the reformed clergy. Cf. Bloomfield, 1952, pp. xiv, 123.
- 81 On these sculptures, which depict Luxury as ‘a woman with a jewelled chain across her forehead, looking into a mirror and exposing her breast by drawing down her dress with one hand’, see *ibid.*, p. 104. An image of the fourteenth-century sculpture (a copy of which was carved in the fifteenth century) is reproduced in Wolfgang Wolters, *La scultura veneziana gotica (1300–1460)*, 2 vols, Venice, 1976, II, fig. 237; see also *ibid.*, I, pp. 173–8 (capital 27), and pp. 249–50 (capital 7). On the association of women and nakedness with the sin of Luxury, see Berry, 1994, pp. 89 and 98; and Sekora, 1977, pp. 43–5. The links between Venetian courtesans and material goods were highlighted in the late sixteenth century by Michel de Montaigne among others; see *Journal de voyage de Michel de Montaigne*, ed. François Rigolot, Paris, 1992, p. 69, and also Allerston, 2000, p. 380.
- 82 The idea that worldly wealth was corruptive and a threat to virtue was one of the oldest ideas associated with the term, which persisted into the Christian era; see Berry, 1994, p. xiii.
- 83 See *Il gioco dell’amore: le cortigiane di Venezia dal Trecento al Settecento*, exhibition catalogue, Venice, 1990, pp. 180–1. On the Soccorso, see Bernard Aikema and Dulcia Meijers, *Nel regno dei poveri: arte e storia dei grandi ospedali veneziani in età moderna 1474–1797*, Venice, 1989, pp. 241–8; see also Brian Pullan, ‘Support and Redeem: Charity and Poor Relief in Italian Cities from the Fourteenth to the Seventeenth Century’, *Continuity and Change*, 3:2 (1988), p. 195 on such institutions. Benedetto Caliari worked closely with his more famous brother; see R. Cocke, *Paolo Veronese: Piety and Display in an Age of Religious Reform*, Aldershot, 2001, pp. 58, 201 and 204–5. On the atmosphere of religious reform which affected the Caliari workshop, see *ibid.*, pp. 41–5 and 109–11.
- 84 Another pertinent visual example is the presumed Mary Magdalene, an early work by Caravaggio in the Galleria Doria Pamphilj, Rome.
- 85 On the use of the print as a fan, see Rigoli and Amitrano Savarese, eds, 1995, p. 431. For sumptuary restrictions on fans and decorated ones, see Bistort, 1969, pp. 198–200; and Fortini Brown, 2004, p. 151 (which also reproduces fan-related prints by Tozzi). Surviving examples of such ‘weathercock’ fans (with decorative turned handles) are

- reproduced in *I mestieri della moda a Venezia/Serenissima: The Arts of Fashion in Venice from the 13th to the 18th Century*, exhibition catalogue, Limena, 1995, p. 125, cat. 158; see also *ibid.*, pp. 125 and 127, especially cat. 160, for examples of fans incorporating printed illustrations. A weathercock fan is also included in fig. 6.
- 86 Cf. Lidia D. Sciana, 'Lacemaking in Venetian Culture', in R. Barnes and J. B. Eicher, eds, *Dress and Gender: Making and Meaning in Cultural Contexts*, Providence and Oxford, 1993 (1st edn 1992), p. 127. On its religious uses, see, for example, E. Ricci, 'A Seventeenth-Century Altar-Cloth', *Old Furniture: A Magazine of Domestic Ornament*, 8:31 (December 1929), pp. 168-74; and for an interesting Jewish example, Dora Liscia Bemporad, 'Jewish Ceremonial Art in the Era of the Ghettos', in Vivian B. Mann, ed., *Gardens and Ghettos: The Art of Jewish Life in Italy*, Berkeley and Los Angeles, 1989, pp. 124-6.
- 87 The wearing of lace was, for example, completely forbidden to the young female Venetian orphans in the Ospedaletto, who, like the Soccorso inmates, also made lace. See the 'Ordini per il Buon Governo della Casa delle Figliole, Riformati l'anno 1667', reproduced in *Arte e musica all'ospedaletto: schede d'archivio sull'attività musicale degli ospedali dei Derelitti e dei Mendicanti di Venezia (sec. XVI-XVIII)*, exhibition catalogue, Venice, 1978 p. 145; and Rosa and Luigi Savio, 'L'organizzazione del lavoro femminile a Venezia nelle antiche istituzioni di ricovero e di educazione', in Alessandra Mottola Molfino and Maria Teresa Binaghi Olivari, eds, *I pizzi: moda e simbolo*, exhibition catalogue, Milan, 1977, pp. 39-40; as well as Maria Elena Vasaio, 'Il tessuto della virtù: le zitelle di S. Eufemia e di S. Caterina dei Funari nella controriforma', *Memoria*, 11-12 (1984), p. 56. For a poem which associates the wearing of large pieces of lace with concubines and other women of dubious reputation, see L. Menetto and G. Zennaro, *Storia del malcostume a Venezia nei secoli XVI e XVII*, Abano Terme, 1987, p. 23.
- 88 ASV, Pompe, busta 6, Denuncie, 27 August 1639; see also Allerston, 2000, p. 380. For an example of a sumptuary law which specifically forbids lace to be used on such items, see Bistort, 1969, pp. 447-51, 20 August 1644; see also *ibid.*, p. 457, 31 August 1644, for similar limits on prostitutes' clothes.
- 89 Kovesi Killerby, 2002, seeks to be comprehensive although it plays down religious motives, and stops at 1500. See especially pp. 61-91 and 110-32. See also Maria G. Muzzarelli, *Gli inganni delle apparenze: disciplina di vesti e ornamenti alla fine del Medioevo*, Turin, 1996; and Muzzarelli and Campanini, 2003; as well as Alan Hunt, *Governance of the Consuming Passions: A History of Sumptuary Law*, New York, 1996. Influential studies include Diane Owen Hughes, 'Sumptuary Law and Social Relations in Renaissance Italy', in John Bossy, ed., *Disputes and Settlements: Law and Human Relations in the West*, Cambridge, 1983, pp. 69-99; and Edward R. Rainey, 'Sumptuary Legislation in Renaissance Florence', Ph.D. dissertation, Columbia University, 1985; whereas Muzzarelli, ed., 2002, is the first of an ambitious series of regional volumes which aims to publish the many sumptuary laws issued in the Italian peninsula up to c.1600. On Venice, see the following note, as well as Bistort, 1969; Gina Fasoli, 'Lusso approvato e lusso riprovato', in F. Bocchi, ed., *Memorial per Gina Fasoli: bibliografia ed alcuni inediti*, Bologna, 1993, pp. 123-43; and M. Margaret Newett, 'The Sumptuary Laws of Venice in the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Centuries', in T. F. Tout and J. Tait, eds, *Historical Essays by Members of the Owens College, Manchester*, London, 1902, pp. 245-78. The religious scruples underlying Venetian laws are highlighted by Molà, 2003, p. 49.
- 90 See especially Peter Burke, *Venice and Amsterdam: A Study of Seventeenth-Century Elites*, London, 1974, p. 63; Piergiorgio Mometto, "'Vizi privati, pubbliche virtù": aspetti e problemi della questione del lusso nella repubblica di Venezia (secolo XVI)', in

Luigi Berlinguer and Floriana Colao, eds, *Crimine, giustizia e società veneta in età moderna*, Milan, 1989, pp. 237–70; and Fortini Brown, 2000, pp. 295–338 (summarized in Fortini Brown, 2004, pp. 150–3). Although it mostly deals with a later period, Erica Morato, 'Tra dovere e privilegio: "Il vestir de' patrizi" nella legislazione suntuaria veneziana del Settecento', *Cheiron*, 16 (1999), pp. 187–201, is also very relevant. Cf. Allerston, 2000, pp. 373–4; and also Kovesi Killerby, 2002, p. 5, which criticizes such attempts to analyse sumptuary legislation in terms of particular forms of government.

- 91 A particularly vehement example is Edward Muir, 'Images of Power: Art and Pageantry in Renaissance Venice', *American Historical Review*, 84:1 (1979), pp. 31 and 33. This idea also underpins Fortini Brown, 2004, although it is much more restrained in its expression. Especially influential in this regard has been Burke, 1987, pp. 132–49, which applied the sociological–anthropological concept of 'conspicuous consumption' to the upper echelons of baroque Italian society, including Venice; see especially p. 144. On the social mobility associated with dynamic urban contexts, see Peter Burke, "'Material Civilisation" in the Work of Fernand Braudel', *Itinerario*, 5 (1981), p. 41. On this interpretation, and its applicability to Venice, see Allerston, 2000, pp. 374, 381. Increasing social differentiation in Venetian society is emphasized, for example, by Dennis Romano, in *Housecraft and Statecraft: Domestic Service in Renaissance Venice, 1400–1600*, Baltimore, 1996, pp. 227–35.
- 92 See the proclamation quoted in Fortini Brown, 2004, p. 153; and Morato, 1999, pp. 188–94. On this ideal view of the Venetian state, see, for example, Brian Pullan, "'Three Orders of Inhabitants": Social Hierarchies in the Republic of Venice', in Jeffrey Denton, ed., *Orders and Hierarchies in Late Medieval and Renaissance Europe*, Manchester, 1999, pp. 152, 153; and Muir, 1979, p. 48.
- 93 ASV, Pompe, busta 6 Denuncie, 18 January 1605 more veneto (mv).
- 94 The sumptuary laws governing such occasions are detailed in Bistort, 1969, pp. 201–5; see also Doretta Davanzo Poli, 'L'abbigliamento in gravidanza, parto, puerperio', in Lia Chinosi, ed., *Nascere a Venezia dalla Serenissima alla prima guerra mondiale*, exhibition catalogue, Turin, n.d., p. 64. On childbirth festivities, see Jacqueline M. Musacchio, *The Art and Ritual of Childbirth in Renaissance Italy*, New Haven, 1999 (the elaborate nature of Venetian events is discussed on p. 44); and more generally, Adrian Wilson, 'The Ceremony of Childbirth and its Interpretation', in Valerie Fildes, ed., *Women as Mothers in Pre-Industrial England: Essays in Memory of Dorothy McLaren*, London, 1990, pp. 68–107.
- 95 Francesco Sansovino, *Venetia città nobilissima*, Venice, 1663 (rev. edn, orig. pub. 1581), p. 402.
- 96 ASV, Pompe, busta 6, Denuncie, 18 January 1605 (mv): 'haver visto la camera del parto fornida con razzi di seda a figure alti da terra fino sotto al soffita ... con cassi di noghera intagliade et dorade con lavori di bronzzo [sic] ... letto con linzuoli lavoradi et letiera di fero dorada co[n] pavion di damascho zalo.' These goods were apparently seen by the capitano of the sumptuary magistrates and his men. Details of the sorts of goods forbidden on such occasions are cited by Bistort, 1969, pp. 203, 394–400 (1562), 463–6 (1644).
- 97 Along with the denunciation against Pasquetta, this document is one of very few examples of enforcement by the sumptuary magistrates, and the outcomes are equivocal. The methodological problems cannot be underestimated, see Patricia Allerston, "'Contrary to the Truth and Also to the Semblance of Reality"? Entering a Venetian "Lying-in" Chamber (1605)', *RS*, 20:5 (2006), pp. 629–39.

- 98 ASV, Pompe, busta 6, Denuncie, 18 January 1605 (mv): 'La denontia data sotto di /18/ genaro passato contra la persona di me Vic.^o Zuccato humil servo delle SS. VV. Ecc.^{me}, non solo è contraria alla verità ma anco al verisimile: Poiche se io in occasione delli molti parti di mia moglie, non sono mai uscito de i termini della modestia, et della tenue mia fortuna, et conditione, non è da credere che in questo parto, ch'è stato l'ultimo di sette io habbia operato diversamente con fare quello, che in nissun tempo mi si conveniva.' The links drawn between expenditure and social condition, and the inappropriate association of a merchant with a sumptuous lifestyle, are highlighted by Fortini Brown, 2000, pp. 317–18; cf. Molà, 2003, p. 49.
- 99 See Fortini Brown, 2004, p. 153; Bistort, 1969, p. 60; Mometto, 1989, p. 245; Newett, 1902, p. 277; Molà, 2003, p. 54, and more generally, Kovesi Killerby, 2002, pp. 133–63.
- 100 ASV, Pompe, busta 6, Denuncie, 27 August 1639.
- 101 *Ibid.* On a previous attempt to prevent this type of intervention on the part of noble clients, see Michelle A. Laughran, 'The Body, Public Health and Social Control in Sixteenth-Century Venice', Ph.D. dissertation, University of Connecticut, 1998, p. 81.
- 102 The close identification of aristocratic interests with judicial structures and the problems posed by the socially embedded nature of the Venetian judicial system are central to Claudio Povolo, *L'intrigo dell'onore: potere e istituzioni nella repubblica di Venezia tra Cinque e Seicento*, Verona, 1997; see, for example, p. 275. The topics of noble honour and criminal justice in Venice were also explored by Jonathan Walker, in chapter 4 of 'Honour and the Culture of Male Venetian Nobles, c.1500–1650', Ph.D. dissertation, University of Cambridge, 1998.
- 103 This section is a condensed version of a paper on the practical arrangements behind these receptions, presented at the conference, 'Cultural Exchanges: The Courts of Europe in the Ancien Régime, Istituto Universitario Europeo', Florence, in 1992. Its findings are developed in my forthcoming book. On the political importance of such occasions, see ASV, Consiglio dei Dieci, Parti Comuni, filza 69, fol. 95, 12 November 1556; as well as Mackenney, 1987, pp. 137–8; Patricia Fortini Brown, 'Measured Friendship, Calculated Pomp: The Ceremonial Welcomes of the Venetian Republic', in Barbara Wisch and Susan Scott Munshower, eds, *All the World's a Stage ...: Art and Pageantry in the Renaissance and Baroque*, University Park, PA, 1990, pp. 137–86; and Matteo Casini, *I gesti del principe: la festa politica a Firenze e Venezia in età rinascimentale*, Venice, 1996, pp. 287–94. On the traditional and continuing importance of material wealth in Venetian public ritual, see Muir, 1979, p. 41.
- 104 ASV, Rason Vecchie (RV), busta 222, Spese fatte ... nelli refrescamenti p[er] l'ocasion [sic] delli Ser.^{mi} Principi di Savoia, principia a di 21 April 1608, section 6, Spese Diverse. On procurators in the seventeenth century, see Burke, 1974, pp. 17–19 and 21–3.
- 105 ASV, RV, busta 222, Spese fatte ... nelli refrescamenti p[er] l'ocasion [sic] delli Ser.^{mi} Principi di Savoia, principia a di 21 April 1608, section 6, Spese Diverse. The reasons for the Jewish community's involvement in these events are discussed in Allerston, 1996, pp. 203–8. On the specific sets of sumptuary laws drawn up for the Jewish community in Venice, see Bistort, 1969, pp. 261–4; and David J. Malkiel, *A Separate Republic: The Mechanics and Dynamics of Venetian Jewish Self-Government, 1607–1624*, Jerusalem, 1991, pp. 220–33.
- 106 The amount paid to the person who invited them is listed in ASV, RV, busta 222, Spese fatte ... nelli refrescamenti p[er] l'ocasion [sic] delli Ser.^{mi} Principi di Savoia, principia a di 21 April 1608, section 6, Spese Diverse. The 'official function' which

- women fulfilled at these events is also highlighted by Casini, 1996, p. 297, and Fortini Brown, 2004, p. 153.
- 107 For the more usual interpretation of the relationship between the so-called myth of Venice and Venetian public ceremonial, see Edward Muir, *Civic Ritual in Renaissance Venice*, Princeton, 1981; and MacKenney, 1987, pp. 133–49 (which also discusses the important role played by the craft guilds on these occasions). Cf. Currie's essay in this volume (chapter 7) which shows that conspicuous consumption on the part of courtiers could also benefit a princely state.
- 108 On the issue of costs, see Casini, 1996, p. 295. An idea of the increasing costs of public ceremonial can be had from the amounts spent on a meal held after the Venetian boat race to the Lido held four times a year. Whereas 15 ducats were allocated for this purpose in 1535, by 1615 the amount then spent, 30 ducats, was considered inadequate, and it was raised to 70. In 1633, at the behest of the officials involved, the sum was raised again to 120 ducats. See ASV, RV, busta 3, fol. 157v, 20 September 1535; *ibid.*, busta 1, fol. 138, 3 June 1615, and fol. 151, 20 July 1633.
- 109 On private citizens' use of others' property for festive occasions, see Allerston, 1998, pp. 37–8, 40.
- 110 This contradiction was highlighted by Muir, 1979, p. 33.
- 111 On the opportunities which these events offered to private citizens to make a public appearance, see Casini, 1996, p. 296.
- 112 The 'important role played by the concept of space' in official welcomes, and its relationship with political power, are, for example, emphasized in *ibid.*, pp. 288–9, in relation to public places and the city's boundaries.
- 113 On the French king's visit to Venice and the Foscari's involvement, see Nicolas Ivanoff, 'Henri III à Venise', *Gazette des Beaux-Arts*, American edn, 6th ser., 80 (1972), pp. 316, 318, 325. The hospitality extended to Sforza in Florence is noted by Lauro Martines in *April Blood: Florence and the Plot against the Medici*, Oxford, 2003, pp. 89, 107. On the notion of a palace as the embodiment of the family that inhabited it, see Lindow, 2004, chapter 2; and Fortini Brown, 2004, pp. 24–6 (special attention is also devoted to Ca' Foscari on pp. 26–8).
- 114 On the use of family insignia on household property in Venice, see Fortini Brown, 2004, pp. 13–15, and Marta Ajmar and Flora Dennis, eds, *At Home in Renaissance Italy*, London, 2006, pp. 112, 116. On the incorporation of insignia in furnishing tapestries, see Wim Mertens, "'Van Spallieren, Sitteccussens en Tappyte Stoelen": The Steady Rise in the Use of Tapestry as an Established Upholstery Textile in Seventeenth-Century Western Europe', in *Ijdel Stof: Interieurtextiel in West-Europa 1600–1900*, exhibition catalogue, Antwerp, 2001, pp. 291–2. A good example in lace is illustrated in Doretta Davanzo Poli, *Il merletto veneziano*, Novara, 1998, pp. 12–13.
- 115 See, for example, on Henry III's visit: M. della Croce, *L'Historia della Publica et Famosa Entrata in Vinegia del Serenissimo Henrico III Re di Francia, et Polonia, con la Descrizione Particolare della Pompa, e del Numero, & Varietà delli Bregantini, Palaschermi, & Altri Vasselli Armati, con la DechiARATIONE dell'Edificio, & Arco Fatto al Lido*, Venice, 1574; R. Benedetti, *Le Feste et Trionfi Fatti dalla Sereniss[ima] Signoria di Venetia nella Felice Venuta di Henrico III Christianiss[imo] Re di Francia et di Polonia*, Venice, 1574; V. Donàio, *Le Feste et Trionfi Fatti nella Nobilissima Città di Padoa nella Feliciss[ima] Venuta, et Passaggio di Henrico III Christianissimo Rè di Francia, & Pollonia*, Padua and Venice, 1574. A useful discussion of this type of pamphlet literature is included in Letizia Pierozzi, 'La vittoria di Lepanto nella vita veneziana di quegli anni (1571–1573)', Ph.D. dissertation, European University Institute, Florence, 1992, pp. 294–345.

- 116 Marin Sanuto, *I diarii*, ed. Rinaldo Fulin et al., 58 vols, Venice, 1879–1903, LII, coll. 513–14, 24 January 1530.
- 117 *Ibid.*, XXIX, coll. 546–7.
- 118 Muir, 1979, pp. 38–9. The Ortolani had just accepted the prince as one of their members. On the role of these companies, including the Ortolani, in such events, see also Lionello Venturi, *Le compagnie della calza (sec. XV–XVI)*, Venice, 1983 (orig. pub. 1908–09), pp. 58–9; and Casini, 1996, pp. 298–304.
- 119 ASV, Senato, Terra, registro 36, fol. 74v [2nd pagination]. On this law see Allerston, 1998, p. 31.
- 120 The practice of gilding food, which was legislated against from 1473, is noted by Bistort, 1969, p. 207. This particular banquet is cited *ibid.*, p. 209.
- 121 Sanuto, *I diarii*, 1879–1903, XXIX, coll. 546–7: ‘In questo zorno, la sera, a San Anzolo sul Canal grando, in cha’ Lando di sier Marco Antonio Venier signor di Sanguanè mio nepote, fu fato una festa et cena honoratissima ...’. On banquets as occasions for demonstrating one’s wealth, see Fasoli, 1993, p. 134.
- 122 On this, specifically in relation to the *compagnie della calza*, see Venturi, 1983, pp. 59, 63. Venturi also argued in these pages that an increasing intolerance of ostentatious display, in the latter part of the sixteenth century, affected the activities of these festive companies.
- 123 My fellow contributor to this volume, Luca Molà, has attributed the creation of Venetian sumptuary legislation to economic and moral motivations rather than socio-political ones; see Molà, 2003, pp. 49–51.
- 124 The conference was held in Florence in 2000. John Brewer was invited to make a formal commentary on the last day, but unlike the contributions of Richard Goldthwaite and Dennis Romano, his contribution was not included in the final publication: Marcello Fantoni, Louisa C. Matthew and Sara F. Matthews-Grieco, eds, *The Art Market in Italy, 15th–17th Centuries/Il mercato dell’arte in Italia, secc. XV–XVII*, Moderna, 2003.
- 125 See Strocchia, 1992; Syson and Thornton, 2001. A good example of this recent trend in consumption studies is Joy Parr, *Domestic Goods: The Material, the Moral, and the Economic in the Postwar Years*, Toronto, 1999, especially pp. 167–71.
- 126 See Strocchia, 1992, p. 32.
- 127 On such bequests of goods, see Patricia Allerston, ‘Reconstructing the Second-Hand Clothes Trade in Sixteenth- and Seventeenth-Century Venice’, *Costume*, 33 (1999), pp. 51–2; and for an example of a nobleman’s carpet stolen from a church during a religious festival, and thought to be resold or pledged in the Ghetto, see ASV, Ufficiali al Cattaver, busta 244, registro 5, fol. 91v, 9 September 1593.
- 128 ASV, Notarile, Testamenti, Atti Cigrini, busta 199, no. 319, Zuane Strazzaruol, 17 November 1579: ‘di far vender tutto il mio al’incanto, et pagar li legati ...’. On the Venetian Capuchins’ reluctance to accept control of Palladio’s expensive new building, Il Redentore, which was being built as Zuane wrote his will, see Deborah Howard, *The Architectural History of Venice*, rev. and enlarged edn, New Haven, 2002.
- 129 Cf. Jardine, 1996, pp. 8–9, 15.
- 130 See also Parr, 1999, pp. 168–9, on the need for historians ‘to resist overstating consumption as a sphere of liberty and self-expression’.
- 131 See *ibid.*, p. 268, on the notion of consumption patterns resulting from ‘a complex arbitration among the political, moral and household economies from which the entitlement to spend results’.